

AB 617 Shafter Community Steering Committee - Meeting #6
May 13, 2019, 5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.
Shafter Veterans Hall

1. Doors Open/Meet and Greet/Refreshments

2. Welcome and Introductions

Jimmy Yee, Facilitator

Jimmy welcomed the committee and provided an overview of the meeting agenda as well as the meeting logistics. He provided an introduction of the first speaker, Heather Bolstad from the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA).

3. Health Effects of Air Contaminants

Heather Bolstad, Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment

Heather Bolstad, PhD., from OEHHA gave a presentation titled, Risk Assessment of Air Contaminants. Heather is based at the Oakland OEHHA office. She provided an overview of the factors that can influence risk for pollution. Risk is equal to toxicity multiplied by exposure. Heather reviewed how OEHHA determines the toxicity of different compounds. She also reviewed different rates of exposure, including acute and chronic exposures. The development of health guidance values was discussed, and then Heather discussed the relative toxicity of different pollutants, including PM2.5, diesel exhaust, wood smoke, metals, volatile organic compounds, and ammonia. Heather reviewed the determination of risk for different chemicals, including cancer and non-cancer risks. Finally, Heather reviewed studies that show that improved air quality can result in improvements in public health, and that air quality in Fresno has improved from 2000-2017, including levels of PM2.5. For more details on Heather's presentation, the video recording and a copy of her presentation is available here:

<http://community.valleyair.org/media/1179/oeaha-health-effects-of-air-contaminants-5819.pdf>.

Heather provided answers to committee member questions on topics including the impacts of cumulative impacts, the formation and major contributors to ammonia formation in the Valley, and cancer risks in the Valley. Specific questions from the Committee included the following:

- How do you calculate the health risk for someone who works outside in Shafter?
- Have you done a comprehensive study of those who work outside in Shafter?
- How does DPR get to win over OEHHA?
- Was the study on hospital admissions and burn days done in the Valley? I'd like to see that study. (Heather later shared it: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4358186/>)
- Has anyone looked at who contributes to ammonia in the winter? That's important to us.
- Do we have data that shows cancer rate/population in Valley communities? Please provide to this to committee members.
- Where does the exposure level come into play? When could it become a problem?
- There are lots of things around us that impact air quality, but I don't want to look too far out. I want to know what impacts me and my neighbors.

4. Continuing Technical Assessment Update

Update on Inventory of Emissions Sources (Stationary, Mobile, and Area) Brian Clements, Manager of Technical Services, and Alejandra Cervantes, CARB

Brian Clements discussed the different map updates that the District has planned for the community, including maps of sensitive receptors, and maps that will include relative magnitude indicators for sources of NO_x, VOCs, and PM_{2.5}, and toxics inventory. For further details, please reference Brian's presentation ([here](#)).

Alejandra presented on CARB's updated emissions inventory, including off road mobile sources and area-wide sources. The mobile source mapping was still a work in progress, but Alejandra reviewed the upcoming information that will be available for different classes of information. For further details, please reference Alejandra's presentation ([here](#)).

Brian, Alejandra, and additional CARB staff answered questions after their presentations, which included questions on how the inventory was created. Adrian from CARB provided further explanation for how the emissions inventory model was created. Specific questions from the Committee included the following:

- You've actually done this testing to determine the emissions across 7 miles?
- How do we know these pollutants are coming from this grid?
- What is the size of each grid?
- Is there a reason why sensitive receptors aren't listed for Shafter?
- Will there be one visual indicator for each source on the map?
- Is reactive organic gas different from VOCs?
- Why aren't daycare centers included in mapping?
- Do you have a factor for residential cooking?
- Are farming operations including dairy emissions?
- Did you look at all 10 dairies in the 7 mile radius?
- Did you use Shafter zip code to get the age of the vehicles for light duty emissions?
- Having this data layered on the interactive map would be the most efficient
- I don't see any numbers that show what the concentrations are
- We are surrounded by petroleum. I don't see an explanation of these sources.

5. Control of Emissions for Regulated Sources

Brian Clements, Manager of Technical Services and Skott Wall, Office of Community Air Protection, CARB

The presentation given by Brian Clements discussed existing programs that control emissions from stationary sources and other sources of emissions in the San Joaquin Valley Air Basin. The District has adopted nearly 650 rules and regulations to reduce pollution from a wide-range of stationary sources in order to improve Valley air quality and move towards attainment of federal health-based air quality standards. These rules and regulations effect sources such as boilers, engines, oil and gas facilities, painting operations, and agricultural operations. The District also operates programs to reduce toxic emissions, through the permitting process, prohibitory rules, toxics emission reporting and health risk analysis implemented through the Toxic Hot Spots program, and incentive programs. The District's website, www.valleyair.org/grants, has further information about incentive programs available to businesses, residents, and public agencies to help with the purchase of clean-technology vehicles,

natural gas fireplace inserts, electric lawn and garden equipment, and more. Brian also discussed the District's Indirect Source Rule, which reduces pollution from new developments; the District's Voluntary Emissions Reduction Agreement program, which requires that developers mitigate new pollution; the District's E-trip Rule, which requires businesses to implement measures to reduce employee vehicle trips through measures such as carpooling, incentives for clean-engine cars, and others; and the District's CEQA review and commenting procedures.

Skott Wall provided an overview of CARB's regulated sources, which includes cargo handling equipment and drayage trucks that work on rail yards, mobile on-road sources, mobile off-road sources, and other toxics. Brian's presentation included slides that showed the reduction in diesel emissions from heavy duty trucks, and improvements in PM2.5 in Fresno County. Skott discussed the California Sustainable Freight Action Plan for emission reductions from freight and mobile sources, and California's 2017 Climate Change Scoping Plan from greenhouse gas sources, as well as the CARB's Community Air Protection Program Blueprint. Finally, Skott's presentation included slides about proposed on-road and off-road measures, as well as stationary source control measures for chrome plating, composite wood products, and commercial cooking. For further details, please reference Skott's presentation ([here](#)).

Specific comments and questions from the Committee included the following:

- Oil wells within 1/8 of a mile of power lines. They have internal combustion engines. There should be a rule against that.
- Makes zero sense that Air District allows people to burn using wood stove on days when air quality is poor.
- Dairy is burning to produce electricity. Some of these things don't make sense for this area.
- Is zero-emissions predominately electric?
- Ask: How do we produce energy in this area? I'd like to see data.
- I'd like to see baseline data about how air quality in Shafter compares to Kern County.
- Any data on VERA having a ROI in Shafter?
- Is there any data on the breakdown of projects and who benefits?
- How does CARB's new methane rule play a part in AB 617?
- Would you classify Kern County as a hotspot?

6. Update on Establishing Community Air Monitoring Network

Jon Klassen, Director of Strategies and Incentives

Jon Klassen provided a verbal update on the status of the Shafter Air Monitoring Network plan implementation. At the last meeting, the Committee had heard a presentation and approved an initial air monitoring plan. The District will keep the Committee updated on the implementation process. The District is also working with CARB to implement reporting and inventory requirements. District Staff are working to prepare a draft of the Air Monitoring Plan, and will send a draft to the Committee for review as soon as it is available before the July 1 monitoring deadline. Specific questions from the Committee included the following:

- Will monitoring show how ammonia is coming from specific dairies?

7. Wrap-up and Next Steps

Jimmy Yee, Facilitator

Jimmy Yee provided a summary of what was covered during the meeting. Specific questions and comments from the Steering Committee included the following:

- Do we need an additional meeting to discuss timeline?
- At the next meeting, some of us would like to present our plan for a CERP for Shafter. We want a meeting two weeks after that to discuss our proposed CERP. Please put on the agenda.
- Per the District, presentation needs to be provided a week in advance, but all CERP ideas can and should be discussed during steering committee meetings.

8. Public Comment

Specific questions and comments from the public were as follows:

- Could you indicate employment numbers on maps when referencing facilities?
- Would be interesting to see impacts from trains on community
- Would be nice for VERA and ISR monies be used in the counties in which they originate
- Consider age of vehicle when considering mobile emissions
- Wildfires contributed heavily to poor air quality. How will you take that into account?
- Is Ag source for the entire Valley? What are you using as your assumptions? Are you looking at crop types? Are you in contact with the Ag Commissioner? The more accurate the data, the better the success.
- Does ARB have technology to scan license plates for vehicles to identify unregistered vehicles?

**Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.*