

Meeting Highlights*
AB 617 Fresno Community Steering Committee Meeting #30
February 10, 2021 | 5:30 pm - 7:30 pm
Virtual Zoom Meeting

Action items for the Fresno Community Steering Committee (CSC):

- Send CARB a list of locations for future enforcement

Action items for San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (District):

- Confirm City of Fresno will provide the Truck Rerouting Study timeline to the CSC
- Provide a copy of the strategic planning slides to the CSC
- Ensure that public members get subcommittee meeting notifications if those meetings are open to the public

Welcome and Introductions

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, Institute for Local Government (ILG)
Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, District
Community Co-host, Ed Ward, Fresno Community Member

Erica introduced herself and the ILG team, welcomed all participants and went over housekeeping items and translation services. The facilitation team provided an overview of the meeting agenda and Zoom controls.

Ryan welcomed the CSC to the first 2021 Annual Planning meeting and thanked them for the time and energy they have invested in AB 617. Community co-host, Ed Ward, expressed how amazed he was by the path the CSC has taken and said he is humbled and thankful to be a part of the group.

2021 Annual Planning Approach

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, ILG

Erica summarized feedback received. She reported that the CSC agreed they want an aligned strategy for 2021 to ensure that the CERP and implementation tactics are clear. Erica previewed the 2021 planning process that would accomplish those goals. Presentation highlights included:

- Three main areas of discussion to cover:
 - Administration: meeting agendas, meeting times, structure, committees, etc.
 - Reporting & Tracking: materials and updates received from the Air District, from other agencies, from committees, etc.
 - CERP Strategies: prioritization and implementation
- Outcomes for the planning process should include refinement of administration items, agreement on reporting and tracking, agreement on approach for prioritizing CERP measures, a prioritized list of CERP measures for 2021, a list of other key activities to accomplish and clarity on metrics for success in 2021

Question: What is happening after today? Are we affirming we agree with this plan and then scheduling the first meeting?

ILG Response: Yes, and if you agree, we are starting today.

Question: Will you go in depth about the overarching goals of administration?

ILG Response: Yes, I will give you a download of what administration means to the planning committee and issues related to administration of the committee.

Comment: Without seeing anything in writing, I can't agree to the priorities today.

ILG Response: That's ok, we are doing live notes and real-time discussions. We will not make any decisions.

Annual Planning Topic #1: Goals & Administration

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, ILG

Erica explained to the CSC that this first conversation will center on administration and what is working well and what suggestions they have for improvement in 2021. Presentation highlights included:

- The Administration topic includes:
 - CSC Meetings
 - Subcommittees
 - Notifications and Updates
 - Translation, Interpretation and Access
 - Membership
- What is going well and what improvement is needed?

The CSC had a robust discussion about Administration. The comprehensive notes taken during the meeting are attached.

Question: What does code of conduct mean?

ILG Response: It is an approach for how the CSC will operate and engage with one another.

CARB Comment: If anyone on the CSC has any questions about how CARB does things, such as staff, budget, etc., please contact us.

ILG Response: Thank you.

Erica asked the CSC to type their 2021 administration goals into the chat. Suggestions are captured under the complete chat log and included in the annual planning notes.

Standing Updates

Truck Rerouting Subcommittee Update:

Scott Mozier, Public Works Director, City of Fresno

Scott gave an update on the truck rerouting subcommittee and the RFP. Presentation highlights included:

- There is an agenda item for the March 4th City Council meeting where the Council is scheduled to approve a total of \$250,000 through Measure C funding and \$500,000 in AB 617 funds for the truck rerouting study
- The subcommittee has asked that the truck reroute RFP and consultant contract both be reviewed by the CSC before being made final
- RFP will go to subcommittee for approval in March and to the CSC for approval in April
- Full study to be completed Fall 2022

Question: I was under the assumption that we may not commit the entire \$500,000 to this truck study, so we have funds available to implement the possible changes identified from it.

City of Fresno Response: This decision would establish that \$750,000 is the maximum amount. There is still plenty of time in the RFP process to indicate a lower budget for the consultant. This is a very generous amount for a truck study.

Vegetative Barriers Subcommittee:

Nayamin Martinez, Fresno CSC Member

Nayamin updated the CSC on the Vegetative Barriers Subcommittee. Presentation highlights included:

- The subcommittee had a productive meeting where they identified partners
- There is already an opportunity to partner with Tree Fresno
- Tree planting is scheduled for early April; this would be a participatory process and the CSC can say which areas to prioritize to plant these trees

School Filtration and Bus Subcommittee:

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, District

Jaime gave a brief update on the School Filtration and Bus Subcommittee. Presentation highlights included:

- Subcommittee is in discussions with Fresno Unified for buses and the associated infrastructure
- Continuing to work on the application for air filtration
- The District received authorization from their board to start a new school air filtration program

CARB Update:

Brian Moore, Office of Community Air Protection, CARB

Brian gave the CARB agency update. Presentation highlights included:

- New management at CARB related to AB 617; Chanel Fletcher and Deldi Reyes. Their bios were hyperlinked in the chat
- February 25th board meeting will include selecting next year's AB 617 communities
- Blueprint guidance is currently being updated

Monitoring Update:

Chay Thao, Program Manager, District

Chay gave an update on community air monitoring. Presentation highlights included:

- Just placed PM2.5 monitor at Madison Elementary; should be on [website soon](#)
- One site left; Edison High School

Enforcement Updates

Jason Lawler, Manager, District

Justin Shields, Community Outreach and Enforcement, CARB

Jason and Justin updated the CSC on enforcement activities. Presentation highlights included:

- Residential wood burning enforcement: for first half of the wood burning season, the District responded to six public complaints, resulting in one violation. There were a total of 47 violations found within AB 617 community
- Illegal open burning enforcement: responded to 14 public complaints and surveillance; five violations issued
- Fugitive dust: completed inspections at 42 construction project sites
- Statewide anti-idling enforcement: no additional violations found from surveillance efforts during the second half of year
- Stationary source inspections: total of 141 inspections, 23 new violations (seven emissions-related)
- CARB staff was in South Central Fresno two days in 4th quarter of 2020. They performed 49 inspections on 45 heavy duty vehicles and issued three citations for non-compliant TRUs
- Inspected two pieces of off-road equipment and found them to be in compliance
- While in the field, CARB staff performed roaming idling investigations on areas the community has expressed concerns of; all were in compliance

Comment: I called in a complaint and the AD didn't respond quickly.

District Response: That information was forwarded on to our Compliance Director so they can find out why that happened. We will reach out to you soon.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, ILG

Erica thanked everyone for attending and making the meeting productive. Community co-host, Ed, thanked everyone for participating and said he is humbled by the talent and concern for cleaning up the community. He encouraged the CSC participants to sit in on CARB's rail listening session in March because of the potential large emissions reductions rail has.

Reminders

The next regularly scheduled CSC meeting is March 10 via Zoom. All the presentations, meetings highlights, transcripts and the Zoom meeting recording will be posted online.

**Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.*

Public Comments

Comment: I am not getting notifications about the air monitoring subcommittee and I want to know what I can do to help.

ILG: Thank you for that. We have captured that public members aren't getting notifications in the notes.

Comment: Someone should go around in the evenings to check for chimneys.

ILG Response: I believe the District does perform this, but we will reflect the request that it be enhanced.

Annual Planning Notes - Administration

CSC Meetings

Agendas, Topics, Time Allocations, Technology, Frequency, Structure, Engagement, Code of Conduct, etc.

Working Well	Suggestions for 2021
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prep meetings are good • Facilitation team is good on CSC meetings • CSC and meetings have helped connect regional businesses and community groups/stakeholders – we're making connections and improvements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make more time for discussion in the agenda; allow for active listening and discussion among the CSC and the AD • Need clarity and agreement on direction for the CSC by the CSC • Minimize repeat requests to the AD; need better process for tracking CSC requests and making sure they are completed • Code of conduct in meeting is important; there should be a clear understanding that we should hear one another, listen to one another, but not always agree

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AD should respond to resident concerns and make sure follow through happens in a timely manner • Meeting agendas are too full, packed; need fewer agenda items and more time for discussion • There doesn't appear to be much action or progress between meetings; how to remedy/improve this? • Give co-host a larger role in the meeting; give a section of the agenda to present • Clearly delineate action items after each meeting, make sure there is follow through • Need more accountability and transparency from the Air District and CARB; especially around requests made during and between meetings • Comment from CARB: Feel free to email CARB with any suggestions/questions • Need one dedicated Air District staff person who is the point person for everything; someone who can track requests, seek answers and make sure requests are completed • Need faster Air District response time to questions and requests from the CSC
--	---

Subcommittees

Topics, Meeting Frequency, Times, Outcomes, Structure, Engagement, etc.

Working Well	Suggestions for 2021
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Subcommittee process is good, but could be better with some modifications 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Subcommittee meetings may need additional structure and revision to better lift up community voices • Need more progress and action between meetings • We need to balance getting everyone's feedback with the desire for productivity and progress on the CERP • More subcommittees may be needed to make real progress on CERP • Consider selecting a passionate CSC member to be a facilitator or meeting host for the subcommittees • Move the subcommittee start times to the early evenings so more residents can participate; if this is done, limit to one hour

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need Gantt chart of the CERP that highlights what we're doing in each subcommittee and when we're doing it • Each subcommittee should include: a timeline of activities from conception to completion, budget by task, staff hours, funding allocations, task assignments, etc.
--	--

Notifications & Updates

Calls, e-Mails, Printed & Mailed Updates, Doodle Polls, etc.

Working Well	Suggestions for 2021
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doodle polls are working well • Gratitude and thanks to the Air District staff for dropping off printed packets when requested • Spanish speakers appreciate the printed copies of materials and being able to read everything in a larger font 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting information and background may be arriving too late; more advance notice needed for materials and updates • Public members are not getting agendas or meeting notifications for subcommittee meetings; they need this information and want to be able to support committee goals • Need better AD notification and more detection for fireplace smoke* • Need more information about air pollution levels and reductions shared with the CSC; also important for AD to share on Facebook so CSC members can share with their networks

Translation, Interpretation & Access

During Meetings, Outside Meetings, Technology, etc.

Working Well	Suggestions for 2021
--------------	----------------------

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Translation of documents has improved over time – definitely important and getting better • Real time translation via Zoom in writing and on screen = very good • Live interpretation = good; helps Spanish speakers participate in the meetings; actually better through Zoom than in-person 	
---	--

Membership

Committee Makeup, Residents, etc.

Working Well	Suggestions for 2021
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consider whether we need to recruit more residents; clarify the process for that and how that may work; possibly advertise for CSC vacancies/openings • Make concerted outreach to the Hmong community for possibly participation and membership • Need more accountability for meeting attendance; announce the number of CSC members vs. staff in each meeting • Provide CSC contact info for fellow members; establish parameters for contacting them • Question: Are the missing or inactive CSC members getting calls? • Question: How many CSC members have backups or alternates? • Question: Does the committee represent the different geographic areas within the boundary? Let's check and make sure it does.

2021 Administration Goals

If we could *fast forward* to the end of 2021... What do you think **SUCCESS** would look like in this Administration category?

What administration improvement or process is the **MOST IMPORTANT** for the CSC to accomplish in 2021?

Administration Goals
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clean air that is free of asthma and contaminants; • To not have to drive out of the area to breathe fresh, clean air • Working more effectively so that this CERP implementation process moves along faster

- A road map of the strategies that residents want to prioritize, including revised funding and actionable plans on how we will get there and the responsible parties
- Land use policy changes
- A breakdown of the budget, how much we have spent, and how much we have for the rest of the strategies
- A CERP tracker that includes all priorities
- A crack down on unregistered fireplaces