

Meeting Highlights*

AB 617 Stockton Community Steering Committee Meeting #12

December 2, 2020 | 5:00 pm - 7:00 pm

Virtual Zoom Meeting

Action items for the Stockton Community Steering Committee (CSC):

- Email Air District to volunteer to be a community co-host at a future meeting
- Reach out to CARB if there are any additional questions about the new heavy-duty omnibus regulations

Action items for San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (District):

- Send out a doodle poll for additional CSC meeting dates
- Send Zoom links for standing CSC meetings
- Allocate time to discuss CAMP into future agendas

Welcome and Introductions

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, District

Stacey Panyasee, Community Co-host

Erica welcomed the Stockton CSC participants, introduced the ILG facilitation team and gave an overview of the agenda.

Ryan welcomed the CSC before introducing Stacey.

Community Co-host Remarks

Stacey Panyasee, Community Co-host

Stacey shared a presentation detailing how residents of Stockton experience the impacts of air pollution daily. She shared statistics about average life expectancy in Stockton compared to the rest of San Joaquin County and California. Stacey urged the CSC to continue working together as the decisions will impact 132,000 lives and counting.

Community Emission Reduction Program (CERP) Strategies

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO, ILG

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, District

Erica presented a slide that recapped the CERP development process and showed the CSC which stage they are currently in. The District showed examples of measures from other community CERPs. Presentation highlights include:

- At this stage, a measure is very high level and does not include specific details until the implementation phase
- The District wants to ensure there is flexibility to implement CSC suggestions
- The CERP is a living document that can be changed as needed during the implementation phase

Question: What is ongoing oversight of the implementation phase like? Have we anticipated any planning and collaborative strategies for integrating agency leads into the specific measure details?

District Response: The District has incorporated some of that during the implementation phase in other communities and has created numerous subcommittees that include relevant agencies to achieve specific goals. As an example, there is a pesticide measure in Shafter and DPR is heavily involved.

Question: Who is writing up the measures?

ILG Response: The District will take the lead on writing and refinement.

Question: What is the compensation for community volunteers in subcommittees? Can we have the same overview that we're getting for the incentive measures with the enforcement measures?

District Response: Absolutely, we'll structure the enforcement measure overview in the same way. Regarding compensation, the District follows the statewide stipend guidance. Stipends are only paid for full CSC meetings, not committee meetings. But the residents in Fresno and Shafter are participating actively in the subcommittees and we have not seen a decrease in resident participation.

Question: How will the proposed schedule accommodate that we still need more time to discuss the monitoring plan?

District Response: The District is currently reaching out to property owners to get access and approval on specific locations. We will provide an update to the CSC on those discussions. We'll also make time in a future agenda to discuss the draft that was sent out. If the CSC wants to explore having a subcommittee to talk about the draft CAMP or additional meetings, we can explore that as well.

Erica explained the measure sorting process to the CSC. The measures were sorted into green, yellow, and red columns, color coded based on CSC feedback. Green measures have received general consensus and can start to be refined, yellow measures have some agreement but need additional discussion and red measures have a lot of confusion and little agreement from the CSC. ILG presented all 25 measures and what color they have been coded based on initial feedback. The CSC discussed the measures and if they thought some should be moved to different color categories.

Comment: Within the vegetative barriers measure, I had suggested we place trees in people's homes and have a contract signed by the residents saying they will maintain the trees.

District Response: The District has taken note of that. The process is complex and would include further investigation and asking the public about locations, but that definitely can be part of the process.

Question: For green trucks, these are local, but not long-haul right?

District Response: The CSC has said they want to focus on zero-emission technology. The majority of the use for those vehicles would have to be local.

Question: Can we hear about CARB's heavy-duty omnibus regulation that was passed by CARB? I think we need an understanding of what businesses operating at the port will be doing in the future.

CARB Response: The regulation is adding several different layers of regulatory measures to the heavy-duty regulations. The regulation is complex, so I will post a fact sheet in the chat. Feel free to reach out to CARB.

Comment: Urban greening and parklets/traffic calming measures are all urban greening. The planning for urban greening costs as much as the urban greening itself.

ILG Response: Each one of these individual items will have a budget allocation, so if we want to prioritize some items for emphasis and budget considerations, that may be why they are currently listed as separate.

District Comment: Another reason why some related measures are separate right now has to do with who the District thinks may be partner agencies in this. For vegetative barriers, trees, and urban greening, we see PUENTES or Fathers and Families of San Joaquin being the main points of contacts.

Comment: I am with PUENTES and we have been doing a lot of the individual planting throughout Stockton and have strategies for people to take accountability for that.

ILG Response: That's great.

Comment: I am more supportive of green space. The District used to have incentives for electric bikes and I could go to work or city hall on one. Do you have that type of program in Fresno?

District Response: The District doesn't currently have a bike sharing program. There have been versions of those programs started in a lot of different cities with varying success. It is certainly a possibility.

Question: Why are the home lawn care equipment and wood burning fireplaces in the yellow box? I think these are important.

District Response: They are definitely important but we wanted to make sure the CSC understand what the measures entailed before moving them to green. The home lawn care equipment measure can be explained like you going to Lowe's and buying a trimmer and getting a rebate for that. The commercial equipment measure is for equipment that is significantly more expensive than residential lawn care equipment and it often has to run for 8-10 hours at a time. The percentage that this program would pay for residential would be more than it would pay for commercial, but the commercial dollar amount may be more because that equipment is in operation longer. With regards to wood stoves, an incentive for people to go from wood to gas is something some want to do. Gas still does have emissions and needs a little bit more discussion.

District Response: The lawn care equipment is the one program at the District that really targets neighborhoods. The emission reductions and benefits are highly localized. Even the new pieces of equipment are fairly dirty when talking about combustible equipment, so going all electric has many emission benefits.

Comment: I used to have a powerful gas lawn mower. With electrical, they stop every five minutes because they get stuck or the battery dies.

District Response: That is a great point and has been the experience of a lot of early adopters of the technology. Over the last 2-3 years, there has been a huge increase in the number of manufacturers of this equipment and the power and battery storage has increased.

Comment: I don't know enough about cycling in Stockton, but I believe the city doesn't have the infrastructure in place for a safe cycling community. There is a world of planning and infrastructure that needs to happen before bike share can be introduced.

The following measures were moved from yellow to green:

- Truck routes
- Replace commercial lawn care equipment
- Replace home lawn care equipment
- Parklets, pocket parks, traffic calming measures

There will be six yellow and four red measures to continue discussing at future meetings.

District Comment: If the CSC still wants to consider the bike share, we can include it, place a lower priority on it and look to launch a program later as opposed to right out of the gate.

Comment: The truck idling plug-ins should be green. Perhaps there are other programs that handle that concept and we can encourage that to start taking place.

ILG Comment: Noted. Also remember that anything yellow is going to continue to be discussed.

Comment: Stockton does not have the infrastructure for healthy bike riding. The main thing is that we have such a problem with illegal bicycling. I am not in favor of spending any money on electric bikes at this time.

ILG Response: Thank you. The chat reflects there is still a lot of interest in continuing the conversation on that item.

The Original and Revised color coding assignments are as follows:

All Incentive Strategies in Order - Original

1. **Vegetative Barriers**
 2. **Trees and Urban Greening**
 3. **Truck Routes**
 4. **Air Filtration in Schools**
 5. **Bike Paths and Infrastructure**
 6. **Trucks**
 7. **Charging Stations for Electric Vehicles**
 8. **Training for Electric Vehicle Mechanics**
 9. **School Buses**
 10. **Large Clean Fuel Infrastructure**
 11. **New Electric Vehicles, Plug-in EVs, and Home Chargers for Residents**
 12. **Trains and Other Rail Equipment Operating in the Community**
 13. **Trucks and Other Heavy Duty Equipment Operating at the Port**
 14. **Repair Cars to Pass Smog Check**
 15. **Car Share Program**
 16. **Tug Boats**
 17. **Replace Wood Burning Fireplace, Stoves and Inserts**
 18. **Electric Bike Share Program**
 19. **Replace Commercial Lawn Care Equipment**
 20. **Replace Home Lawn Care Equipment**
 21. **Marine Exhaust**
 22. **Air Filtration in Homes**
 23. **Home Weatherization and Electrification**
- New. Truck Idling Plug Ins**
- New. Parklets, Pocket Parks, Traffic Calming Measures**

All Incentive Strategies by Color - Original

Green	Yellow	Red
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vegetative Barriers • Trees and Urban Greening • Air Filtration in Schools • Bike Paths and Infrastructure • Trucks • Charging Stations for Electric Vehicles • Training for Electric Vehicle Mechanics • New Electric Vehicles, Plug-in EVs, and Home Chargers for Residents • Repair Cars to Pass Smog Check • Air Filtration in Homes • Home Weatherization, Solar and Electrification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Truck Routes • Large Clean Fuel Infrastructure • Trucks and Other Heavy Duty Equipment Operating at the Port • Car Share Program • Replace Wood Burning Fireplace, Stoves and Inserts • Electric Bike Share Program • Replace Commercial Lawn Care Equipment • Replace Home Lawn Care Equipment • Truck Idling Plug Ins (new) • Parklets, Pocket Parks, Traffic Calming Measures (new) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School Buses • Trains and Other Rail Equipment Operating in the Community • Tug Boats • Marine Exhaust

All Incentive Strategies by Color - Revised

Green	Yellow	Red
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Vegetative Barriers• Trees and Urban Greening• Air Filtration in Schools• Bike Paths and Infrastructure• Trucks• Charging Stations for Electric Vehicles• Training for Electric Vehicle Mechanics• New Electric Vehicles, Plug-in EVs, and Home Chargers for Residents• Repair Cars to Pass Smog Check• Air Filtration in Homes• Home Weatherization, Solar and Electrification• Truck Routes• Replace Commercial Lawn Care Equipment• Replace Home Lawn Care Equipment• Parklets, Pocket Parks, Traffic Calming Measures (new)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Large Clean Fuel Infrastructure• Trucks and Other Heavy Duty Equipment Operating at the Port• Car Share Program• Replace Wood Burning Fireplace, Stoves and Inserts• Electric Bike Share Program• Truck Idling Plug Ins (new)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• School Buses• Trains and Other Rail Equipment Operating in the Community• Tug Boats• Marine Exhaust

Extension Letter

*Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, District
Skott Wall, Community Air Protection Program, CARB*

Ryan explained the process for requesting a CERP extension. Presentation highlights include:

- State law requires that the CERP is completed no later than 12 months after the community was selected, which was December 2019
- CARB released guidance that includes the process for extending the deadline
- The draft extension letter shows the CERP being presented to the District board for approval on March 18, 2021
- The CERP would go to CARB for adoption shortly after

CARB Comment: If you submit the letter and have CSC and District buy-in on the request to extend the deadline, there should be no problem with CARB approving the extension.

The CSC approved the extension of the CERP.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Erica Manuel, Facilitator, ILG

Erica reminded the CSC that they will continue to discuss the yellow and red color-coded measures at future meetings. Ryan thanked the CSC for getting a great amount of work done and wished everyone happy holidays. Stacey, community co-host, thanked everyone for their energy and time in making a difference.

Reminders

The next regular CSC meeting is January 6 on Zoom. All the presentations, meetings highlights, transcripts and the Zoom meeting recording will be posted online.

**Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.*

Public Comment

No public comment.