

Stockton AB 617 CSC Meeting - Chat Transcript
Feb. 3, 2021 5:00-7:30 p.m.

00:05:48 Heather Heinks - AD: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DYIZOxVgHbc>

00:06:00 Heather Heinks - AD: There's the link Douglas, I'll try to share it too on FB

00:07:02 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Good evening everyone.

00:09:56 Albert Rivas-GOV: Good afternoon! Albert Rivas, City of Stockton

00:10:22 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : good afternoon.

00:10:23 Noehmi Jauregui - St. George School: Good afternoon!

00:10:31 V-R - Ned Leiba: I understand we would have cost benefit and specific projected health benefit information at our next meeting Februry 17, correct? Then we will be in a position to recommend CERP strategies.

00:10:34 Heather Heinks - AD: Thanks Erica! That link is directly to this meeting.

00:11:43 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Good afternoon all! Thank you for being here this evening

00:12:41 V-R - Nate Knodt: Good evening everyone. Just a reminder that we must move through the agenda briskly tonight. We must also remember that we are a citizens steering committee and that we represent individual citizen's view more than any public, private, or non-profit organizations that we may sometimes represent or be associated with.

00:13:39 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Individual residents that are part of the community of Stockton.

00:13:58 V-R - Nate Knodt: We must again be aware that we are on "overtime" operating past our Dec. 31, 2020 deadline. Grant opportunities and Stipend Budgets are stressed as we operate into Calendar Year 2021.

00:19:16 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Goal: We should also have a robust set of measures that immediately protect people's health.

00:25:23 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: What does delayed enhanced really mean though?

00:25:33 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Like is it based on Months? Years?

00:25:44 Jaime Holt - AD: Jonathan, we will explain.

00:26:28 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: F5

00:26:50 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Dual screen problems

00:27:02 V-R - Regina Griffin: yes

00:28:04 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: unemployment has many people barely getting by. I'd favor waiting until Fall 2021 for enhanced enforcement.

00:28:42 Jaime Holt - AD: The wood burning season runs Nov. to Feb.

00:30:37 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Would the community have the opportunity to discuss the messaging for the social media and marketing for things like Wood burning?

00:31:16 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : The AD still will be responding to citizen complaints?

00:31:17 Jaime Holt - AD: Jonathan, The wood burning outreach item includes coordinating with local partners on messaging.

00:31:18 V-CSC - Ed Ward: Gene a good point. Non essential wood burning should be ended?

00:31:31 Jaime Holt - AD: Mary Elizabeth, yes

00:31:41 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: 3

00:32:08 V-R - Nate Knodt: Thank you. Nate Knodt CSC

00:32:25 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Can we please place the options in the chat?

00:32:30 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: 3

00:32:31 Hanna St. - ILG: 1. No enhanced enforcement
2. Delayed enhanced enforcement
3. Enhanced enforcement starts in Fall 2021

00:32:33 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: When we lost power for two days, I was almost forced to use the fireplace to heat my home. Many have no other option. What happens to them with this enhanced enforcement?

00:32:48 V-R - Ned Leiba: Why have enhanced enforcement? Certainly not for childhood asthma. The presentation yesterday at the CAC discussed air filtration in the AB 617 Fresno and Shafter area schools, but there were no plan to have monitors to see if they had any health effect. And I cited from the Asthmatic Children's Environment Study (F.A.C.E.S.) :

To date, the results of the analyses of exposures to PM2.5 and lung function have not demonstrated an association.

And athma is the most important health issue we face in the Stockton AB 617 area.

00:32:50 Jaime Holt - AD: Noehmi,

00:32:55 V-R - Anthony Macias: 3

00:33:04 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Great question, Noehmi. We have to think about folks who have no choice.

00:33:15 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: 3

00:33:23 Jaime Holt - AD: Noehmi, if you have no access to another heating source, such as your power going out for extended period, you would not get a ticket.

00:33:24 V-R - Deby Provost : Can we go back to the yellow/red /green cerp window?

00:33:32 V-R - Nate Knodt: I prefer Option B - I define that as major Outreach first, Incentives next, then Delayed Enhancement in later years as described by Erica.

00:33:47 V-R - Deby Provost : 3

00:33:47 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Option 3....I do want more outreach...much more outreach

00:33:51 V-R - Gloria Alonso: 3

00:33:58 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: 3

00:34:00 V-R - Bianca Mendoza: 3

00:34:03 V-CSC - Tina Lau: 3

00:34:04 V-CSC - Silvia Cantu: 3

00:34:04 Hanna St. - ILG: No enhanced enforcement
Delayed enhanced enforcement
Enhanced enforcement starts in Fall 2021

00:34:18 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Thinking 3 is 1

00:34:20 V-R - Victoria Moreno: 3

00:34:21 V-R - Deby Provost : YES

00:34:23 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: 2+2 is 5

00:34:27 V-CSC - Ed Ward: Where do you vote? where do you see 1-3?

00:34:34 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: outreach only

00:34:34 V-R - Nate Knodt: I vote 2

00:34:34 V-CSC - Arlene Galindo: 3

00:34:35 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Sorry - I meant 1.

00:34:35 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: haha

00:34:47 Ryan Hayashi - AD: @Mary, District field staff will continue to respond to all
complaints

00:34:55 V-R - Margo Praus: 1. I vote for.Enhanced starting in Fall 2021. I think we can
change the air in our community.

00:34:56 R-Nicholas Hatten: I vote 1

00:34:56 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: 3-no enhanced

00:34:57 V-R - Deby Provost : 2021 start enhanced

00:35:06 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: no enhanced enforcement - option 3 from the powerpoint

00:35:07 V-CSC - Arlene Galindo: no enhanced 3

00:35:10 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: 3 no enhanced, only outreach

00:35:13 Jaime Holt - AD: Noehmi, we added a new strategy specifically about wood
burning outreach and the committee will be involved in what that is and how that is done during the
implementation phase.

00:35:15 CSC Alt - Paige Tengeluk: Why are we enforcing residents who might have
financial hardships, hence having to use other forms of heating?

00:35:40 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: 3 - No enhanced enforcement

00:35:40 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: A) No enhanced enforcement. Only Outreach.

00:35:40 V-R - Bianca Mendoza: no enhanced enforcement

00:35:42 V-R - Lenard Seawood: option 1: no enforcement

00:35:43 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: No enhanced enforcement

00:35:51 V-R - Ned Leiba: No enhanced enforcement. Thank you.

00:35:52 CSC Alt - Melissa Vargas: No enhanced enforcement

00:35:56 V-R - Regina Griffin: option 1

00:35:57 V-R - Deby Provost : That is not what I meant. I WANT C or 3

00:35:57 V-CSC - Ed Ward: A

00:35:58 V-R - Florence Quilantang: No enhanced enforcement. Hanna's #1.

00:35:59 V-R - Taylor Williams: No enhanced enforcement

00:35:59 V-R - Victoria Moreno: 3

00:36:01 V-R - Jennifer Flores: no enhanced

00:36:02 V-R - Margo Praus: Air quality is THE issue. This could be a tool for community education as well as introduction to options to change heating

00:36:02 V-R - Gloria Alonso: no enhanced enforcement

00:36:06 V-R - Nate Knodt: I vote 2 and/or B

00:36:06 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: 1

00:36:09 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : no enhancement

00:36:15 V-CSC - Silvia Cantu: No enhanced enforcement

00:36:32 V-R - Nate Knodt: I am Ok with 3

00:36:47 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: I want to say thank you to Heather Heinks! I saw her post about no burning on the NextDoor app - thanks Heather! Its the only place I have ever seen anything about the wood burning policy

00:36:56 V-CSC - Tina Lau: Sorry, does 3 = C?

00:37:11 Heather Heinks - AD: That's excellent news Noehmi! More messaging like that coming :)

00:38:02 Hanna St. - ILG: @Tina Lau. Yes, ILG's 3=c

00:38:03 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Thank you Heather I too look for your updates.

00:38:12 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: We can also fund home electrification and then people won't need to burn.

00:38:34 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: As someone with Public Health background. Education alone doesn't change behavior. But it is a start and brings more opportunities for home electrification

00:38:48 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Heyyy, Catherine, I see you with that electrification!

00:38:57 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: Pleasure encourage language that acknowledges disabilities and health factors when managing ones personal air control choices

00:38:59 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Home electrification as in providing funding for solar panels?

00:39:41 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Solar panels and battery systems are the only thing that would have helped with our most recent 2day power outage.

00:39:59 Heather Heinks - AD: Thank you @Mary and @Noehmi for your feedback.

00:40:16 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Those are options Noehmi, and electric heat pumps when you do have power.

00:40:16 V-R - Margo Praus: I still vote for enhanced enforcement starting in Fall 2021. This is important for our air quality. Do we want to make a difference?

00:41:31 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: @Catherine - Then I LOVE the idea of home electrification. When we lost power, we also lost our water because our well is powered by electricity. Solar panels are in my near future. Would love some help to make that affordable for my family of 6.

00:41:43 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: That's a good question Mary. Would like to see the data on that

00:42:15 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Whether people can afford to heat their homes in ways other than burning wood is absolutely a factor in what measures we select.

00:42:46 Jaime Holt - AD: 166 violations issued in San Joaquin County from Nov. 1, 2020 to yesterday

00:43:05 Ryan Hayashi - AD: We have issued 84 violations for all of Stockton since the November 1, 2020.

00:43:05 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: wait are we talking about ag burning now?

00:43:22 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Where specifically in South Stockton are these violations?

00:43:26 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: We've certainly shown lenience on growers to figure out cost effectiveness for 17 years when it comes to ag burning. Folks with gold plated tasting rooms can't be held accountable. You sure we should police low income communities?

00:43:27 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: What streets?

00:43:29 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : All for wood burning?

00:43:52 Jaime Holt - AD: Mary Elizabeth, yes

00:44:02 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Why include something in the CERP that is already working and effective is the way I see this vote.

00:44:33 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Dillon, I'd like to hear your thoughts on what you mean

00:44:45 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: +++ Mariah

00:44:56 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: +++ Mariah

00:44:59 V-R - Gloria Alonso: YES MARIAH

00:45:10 V-R - Victoria Moreno: agreed Mariah

00:45:20 V-R - Lenard Seawood: yes Mariah

00:45:44 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Thank you Mariah! I am worried about the families from my school that are struggling to get by and cannot afford to make changes right now. Even though there is an incentive, it isn't enough to actually replace. Is there a sliding scale based on income levels in the replacement program?

00:46:28 V-R - Ned Leiba: Mariah you are 100% correct. Folks whose "chances are thinner" are subject what seems like harsh and perhaps discriminatory enforcement. To me, that is a big worry.

00:46:30 CSC Alt - Paige Tengeluk: Low income neighborhoods need more support/services, not policing.

00:46:40 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: What I'm saying is that a bunch of people are already being cited. Everyone that I know doesn't burn wood anymore. So the program is working and will continue to happen. It doesn't seem like we need to do even more enforcement.

00:47:17 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: It seems like people are just trying to be fiscally responsible with taxpayer money.

00:47:34 V-CSC - Ed Ward: good questions Jonathan

00:47:43 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Does regulation exist that prohibits newer homes from having wood burning fireplaces?

00:47:53 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: And, again, those with disabilities and health issues have unique tempered needs. as someone suffering from neuropathy, if its too hot or cold, I get pain. these disclaimers never mention this.

00:47:56 V-R - Deby Provost : my neighborhood is full of wood burning people!

00:48:39 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: CARB, do you guys know about the new homes in CA being fully electric heating?

00:48:53 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Thanks Jonathan. :)

00:48:56 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Maybe the air district can do targeted enforcement based on community feedback.

00:49:14 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: second Noehmi's question—Does regulation exist that prohibits newer homes from having wood burning fireplaces?

00:49:22 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : That would be through the complaint process.

00:49:31 Jessica Olsen - AD: @ Jonathan--Part of the outreach will be to inform people of the incentives. We can use this committee to change the incentives amount to ensure that the cost is covered for residents in the community. For example, changing to a gas or electric device can be covered to nearly 100% of the cost (similar to what is in the Fresno and Shafter AB 617 CERPs)

00:49:46 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Yes, also curious whether San Joaquin County requires new homes not have wood burning devices?

00:50:18 Jaime Holt - AD: Noehmi and Stacey, yes...new homes in the city cannot have open fireplaces or wood burning stoves.

00:50:34 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Thanks Jaime. Happy about that!

00:50:52 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: We should not subsidize natural gas. The state is leading the transition to electric with back up battery storage. It will take time and we can get there. We don't want natural gas for trucks, we shouldn't promote it for homes either.

00:51:10 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: Thanks Jaime! Great to hear!

00:51:18 Skott Wall - CARB: @Jonathan - are you specifically asking if there are any statewide regulations re: fireplaces in new homes?

00:51:53 Heather Heinks - AD: What Jaime is sharing and other details about this topic can be found here: <https://www.valleyair.org/rule4901/>

00:51:54 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Yes skott. Like all new homes have solar panels on it

00:52:00 Jose Saldana - CARB EJ Unit: just curious, does outside wood burning apply to cooking food using wood

00:52:10 Kevin Hamilton - P: Agree with Catherine. Transition to electric now. Back up with solar and a small storage battery if indeed the device is being used for heating.

00:52:34 Kevin Hamilton - P: No battery needed if the fireplace is more cosmetic.

00:52:37 V-R - Ned Leiba: Why the long discussion, about enforcement. Does it have health effects? Not at all clear. We should put our time and \$ on, for example, school air filtration to see if it has an effect on asthma, a big problem. Don't focus on enforcement. Do not focus on punishment. Focus on measure that will directly improve health and health benefits that can be measured in our AB 617 area.

00:52:55 Heather Heinks - AD: @Jose Cooking is exempted but the fire has to be appropriate for the cooking activity. You cannot have a bonfire, for example, and call it a cooking fire.

00:53:03 Kevin Hamilton - P: Stockton is an ideal place to pilot something like this.

00:53:10 Jose Saldana - CARB EJ Unit: thank you

00:53:15 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Ryan - gas fireplaces are definitely more expensive than electric powered fireplaces

00:53:19 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Electric heat pumps are the more efficient electric heating

00:53:22 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: CPUC needs to address those affordability issues re: electric, Ryan, and my understanding is there are programs that exist and that are developing to do so, FYI.

00:53:37 V-CSC - Arlene Galindo: is the information on which zip codes are being enforced regularly

00:53:43 Eric Bissinger - CARB: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/resources/documents/woodburning-handbook>

00:53:58 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: How can we justify what is cooked for food and burned for just to keep warm? Technically people could use it for both and say that it was just used for cooking lol

00:54:05 V-R - Deby Provost : We need enforcement to keep it effective. If they know we are just going to talk, it eventually won't be effective.

00:54:12 Skott Wall - CARB: @Jonathan - I'm not aware of any statewide rules, but I'll ask around CARB and get back to you.

00:54:37 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Thanks Skott

00:55:27 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: @ Skott, I just realized that VAD would know the question more than CARB lol. Since they handle stationary sources

00:55:30 Jaime Holt - AD: Deby, we have conversations with people about it and the folks looking to skirt the rule are pretty brazen about it.

00:55:34 V-R - Deby Provost : We were supposed to be informed by you guys at CVA were supposed to review Jeff's info!

00:55:56 Jaime Holt - AD: Deby, still planning to discuss.

00:56:33 V-R - Nate Knodt: Let us move forward to remainder and leave No. 1 & 7 behind as per comments already provided and consensus.

00:56:44 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Yes, agree with Deby.

00:57:12 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: yes, I want to be able to make informed decisions please give us more information on the red measures

00:58:29 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Were the chat records from previous meetings checked with regard to port enforcement?

00:58:42 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Can someone provide a link to the info provided by Jeff? I haven't seen it.

00:58:56 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++ Catherine. I haven't see it either.

00:58:57 V-R - Deby Provost : Take 1 & 7 out completely, we just don't have the time for it.

00:59:24 V-R - Deby Provost : It was in an email to everyone from Jeff/Air board

01:00:09 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I did not receive that email. I just searched my inbox.

01:00:20 V-R - Regina Griffin: no

01:00:22 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: no

01:00:28 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: no

01:00:38 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Kevin Hamilton, what do you think?

01:00:43 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: no

01:00:58 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Thank you Taylor!

01:00:59 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: thanks Taylor!

01:01:00 V-R - Taylor Williams: 1-pager from POS^^

01:01:54 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: YOU ROCK TAYLOR

01:01:59 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: TY Ed

01:02:00 Kevin Hamilton - P: Gas stations come under various agency regulations. The critical piece is they are often connected to local food access.

01:02:33 Kevin Hamilton - P: Idling cars are the biggest emission problem they have.

01:03:21 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Thx Kevin

01:03:59 V-CSC - Ed Ward: I agree and convenience stores are critical to some communities. Idling can be a problem

01:04:44 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : <https://www.sjcog.org/AgendaCenter/ViewFile/Agenda/11122020-1087> pg 6 COG has money for electric bikes.

01:05:17 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: So I heard in the grapevine that there was a local truck company that was looking to be part of the Zero Emission Class 8 truck grant program. Unfortunately it fell through.

01:05:21 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: We want to enhance Port air quality Improvement efforts, not replace their spending for those efforts.

01:06:03 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: They were wanting to change their trucks to Hydrogen fuel. Not Electric

01:06:08 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Convenience stores are only critical to some communities because they are in food deserts and have no access to grocery stores.

01:08:06 V-CSC - Ed Ward: Not everyone has the ability to travel out of area for groceries. Milk and bread are critical to those folks

01:08:48 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: the term food dessert is misleading. there's WIC access. the stores carry what they can sell which is sadly, not the healthiest options.

01:09:26 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: WHAT?!

01:09:37 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: Milk and bread are sold at every corner or liquor store.

01:10:12 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Deserts Provide for their residents

01:10:19 V-R - Victoria Moreno: 24/7

01:10:19 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: How many locomotive switchers exist/work within the boundary?

01:10:39 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I thought that line was out of commission. Jeez

01:10:48 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I've never seen it in real time

01:11:09 V-CSC - Ed Ward: Good question CARB had indicated they would provide a list

01:11:10 V-R - Deby Provost : Is it really going down the middle of the street like that?

01:11:17 V-R - Gloria Alonso: yess

01:11:24 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: If this is the one by Stribley, I see it all the time

01:11:29 V-R - Victoria Moreno: yes on Washington st.

01:11:47 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: I support focusing our 'Port' efforts on the companies operating in the area of the port but financially separate from the Port of Stockton

01:12:00 V-R - Ned Leiba: Ryan, you will recall the Port of Stockton representative Jeff Wingfield said he had health studies on the effects of air pollution from the Port. While we received some emissions information, I have not received any of those health reports. Wingfield said he would provide those report to us. I asked him via email in November and again in January for those reports. Anyone on the Committee, CARB or SJVAPCD have those reports. That information would help us have

a deeper understanding of the current discussion. Thanks.

01:12:00 V-R - Deby Provost : OMG! Something needs to be done...

01:12:10 Kevin Hamilton - P: I hear you Mariah. Unfortunately, most low-income urban neighborhoods experience a disparity in this as well. In my experience, chain stores don't invest there and while some small grocery markets exist, many don't or are saturated with liquor store instead. Gas stations often serve all three roles in those places. For those who are transportation embarrassed, the only choice is that corner store or gas station. Once the final transition is made to EV's those same places will hopefully have EV chargers instead of gas pumps. At least that's what we are working toward. Its a tough one.

01:12:23 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Is there interest by these companies?

01:12:55 Kevin Hamilton - P: There is no one solution for mobile and stationary diesel emissions other than to change the power plant.

01:13:12 V-R - Nate Knodt: This is the Stockton Terminal and Eastern Line that connects Hwy 99 Food Processing Plants and Ag products to UP Mainline Downtown Stockton. ST & E also operates line through Stockton crossing Fremont, Milner, Main, and Market to BNSF yard that provides connection to Port of Stockton.

01:13:18 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Isn't Yang ships known to be one of the worse offshore ships?

01:13:49 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:The picture is LA Long Beach

01:13:59 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Yeah lol. I realize that Jeff

01:14:16 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Isn't Port of Stockton trying to bring in Barges though?

01:14:52 V-CSC - Ed Ward: Kevin the newest diesel technology engines are near zero when running on Non-fossil fuel. That's available today.

01:14:53 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: To Mary Elizabeth's Point Are any industries besides the Port making any effort to attend these meetings, or engage the incentives programs?

01:15:30 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Barges with cargo or barges that contain these emission control devices?

01:15:38 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: That picture is of the Port of Stockton's 2018 report of projected deliveries over 10 years

01:16:27 Albert Rivas - GOV: will \$2.3 billion. invest en

01:16:36 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Isn't the port planning a massive expansion? How do we know that helping pay for new equipment at the port isn't just supporting the overall expansion of their footprint, which could negate or even increase emissions?

01:16:51 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Are the tugs owned by the Port?

01:16:55 Albert Rivas - GOV: investment by carb help reduce port emissions?

01:17:21 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Yes Catherine. Fewer boats in the port ALSO reduce potential emmissions. How was an expansion approved in this area when air quality is already so bad?

01:17:33 Kevin Hamilton - P: Electricity should be primary. Short hall dryage and all class 7 and below all have ready for prime time electric replacements many freight companies are already

adopting. Special carve outs for small trucking companies 1-3 trucks should be kept aside. That could also be piloted in the 617 area with CARB's approval.

01:17:56 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Also at Monday's meeting CARB staff said the primary ships coming to the port are dry bulk, which bonnets are not practical for...so I'm still not clear what that particularly technology would help with.

01:19:22 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: We have a need because people are dying/getting sick from pollution

01:19:23 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : I thought trees can help prevent exposure.

01:19:33 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: We should set aside those CERP items that can't be SPENT by the deadline

01:20:51 Kevin Hamilton - P: Green barriers do reduce exposures in communities. They are a viable solution that's being rolled out in the Fresno CERP.

01:21:57 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Hyphae Labs did a workshop for us about vegetative barriers. Would be cool for them to join the conversation

01:22:22 V-CSC - Ed Ward: I agree Jonathan

01:22:33 Kevin Hamilton - P: It could be used to line rail spur lines that run through neighborhoods. Obvious rare exceptions are the rail running down the middle of a street. Most don't.

01:22:46 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: The port expansion is a new project. What emission reduction methods are they incorporating in their expansion?

01:23:48 V-CSC - Ed Ward: That is important and the future rail project should be required to add and maintain vegetation barriers

01:23:49 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Vegetative Barriers are great AND this fall when we're looking at a 5 foot sapling with no leave and the wildfires come a classroom with an amazing filter is something you can count on

01:24:14 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Yes Matt, we need a multi pronged approach.

01:24:48 Kevin Hamilton - P: Steam ships are a lot tougher. The best solution still is shore power hook ups. All ships have an internal electrical generating system. Usually run off steam but some are diesel. Regardless. They need electricity which can be provided from shore to operate the ship and cranes.

01:24:48 Jessica Olsen - AD: Great point, Jonathan! Vegetative Barriers was one of the top measures included in the draft CERP. Moving forward with implementation, we certainly need to talk with outside partners (like Hyphae and the TCC project partners) to leverage expertise and current programs to get this measure off the ground.

01:26:57 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Skott, could you and Brian Moore invite Hyphae labs to our future AB 617 meetings? Please?

01:27:48 Kevin Hamilton - P: By the way. I was a machinist mate in the Navy. It was my job to make electricity. We always connected to shore power so we could shut down for maintenance. That was 1972. It's all a matter of investment.

01:28:32 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Jeffrey, thank you for clarifying

01:28:46 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Hyphae will come if we ask them....but their vegetative strategy is not controversial. It will be in the CERP. IT is also not a priority. IT will impact us over decades. We'll need them to build the budget not substantiate the benefits of the strategy.

01:29:03 Skott Wall - CARB: @Jonathan - I think it would be great to have a larger discussion about Hyphae with the District - maybe in the next agenda planning meeting?

01:29:27 Kevin Hamilton - P: I would think tugs would be tough for sure. Small operators with small budgets. A good place to focus more incentive funding to help them through it. Just like the small trucking firms.

01:30:01 Jessica Olsen - AD: Thanks @Skott and @Jonathan. We can chat about working the Hyphae. I was thinking more along the lines of during implementation, since (as @Matt pointed out) this is a measure that's firmly in the CERP.

01:30:24 V-R-Margo Praus: Ditto Noehmi's question about what efforts are being incorporated?

01:30:43 V-CSC - Espe Vielma: @kevin do we have any current incentive programs ?

01:30:51 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Momentum is very intentional on wanting to get clean technology in the Port of Stockton

01:30:55 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: \$ per ton of emission reduction could be used in prioritization

01:31:57 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Randall is now available

01:31:59 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Would like to raise up Kevin's comments on electrical plug-in for ships. This would greatly benefit our community.

01:32:07 Kevin Hamilton - P: Are these the total emission in that category for the year?

01:33:00 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Do we have information on the projected numbers with the uptick of ships coming into Port of Stockton in the near future?

01:33:28 V-R-Margo Praus: Jeff, Last Fall you indicated forming a Community Outreach Group. Has that happened?

01:33:29 Kevin Hamilton - P: Where did the data come from? Direct monitoring or calculated based on the equipment profile in the EMFAC?

01:34:13 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Interested in Margo's question. I'd like to add that if there is a Community Outreach Group, who is that comprised of?

01:34:15 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: @Dillon Check my pic

01:35:41 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Thanks Jonathan.

01:35:53 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I'd also like to see the health reports. My email is mariah@restorethedelta.org

01:36:07 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: So we don't fully know the emissions coming from the port...and have no guarantee that emissions aren't going to go up?

01:36:15 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: health reports please - njauregui@stgeorgeschoolstockton.org

01:36:18 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Yes, please share the health studies with the entire CSC

01:36:49 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Who is running the health study? What consultant?

01:37:08 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Or who ran it?

01:37:09 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: To Catherin's questions. There's no data. No evidence that the strategies will even work. IT is easier to propose reductions in the plan though. I am not comforted.

01:37:13 V-R - Gloria Alonso: I second Catherine request. We should all get the health studies

01:37:15 Kevin Hamilton - P: The Air District will have health risk assessments for each of the permitted facilities.

01:38:11 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Can the Air District please also share the health risk assessments for all sources within the community?

01:38:25 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++++

01:38:38 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: +++++

01:39:44 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Jeff, you could still work with CBOs on that community outreach plan even though the consultant is on maternity leave lol. We want to advise the outreach plan. Free of charge

01:40:03 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree with Jonathan 10000%

01:40:10 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Restore the Delta is always here to talk

01:40:18 V-R - Regina Griffin: Thanks Jeff for continued outreach opportunities.

01:42:40 V-R - Deby Provost : 3 and 4

01:42:51 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Need the data before moving any of these

01:43:03 V-R - Nate Knodt: 3 and 5. I vote to add 3 RR Switching, and Port Ocean Emission with the Bonnet System. That is all, leave out 2, 4, and 6.

01:43:05 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Jonathan, I'm not sure what your table 1 image is!

01:43:05 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree with Catherine. I don't think we can make a real decision without health data.

01:43:05 V-R - Victoria Moreno: 3 & 4

01:43:05 V-CSC - Ed Ward: 3 to green limited to local switchers

01:43:07 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : 3 on red if industry interest

01:43:09 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: On Monday, there was a very detailed presentation on locomotives and what is feasible/best practices for AB 617 money. I think people are looking for the same amount/more detail from POS

01:43:12 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Still in the same place we were last meeting

01:43:29 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: My zoom connection doesn't have a raise hand feature

01:43:51 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I had to login from a neighbors house because PGE had to take down our power line

01:44:14 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I also have additional comments

01:44:26 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Only equipment not owned by the Port of Stockton should be in the CERP

01:44:50 V-CSC - Espe Vielma: 4 and 5

01:44:57 V-R - Nate Knodt: For Items 3 & 5, I only support Switch Locos and the Bonnet System, if possible. I would not add any other strategies. No Gas Station, Tugboat, or School Buses.

01:45:42 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: So why not force electrical plug in the city with the worst asthma rate in California?

01:45:50 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Also would be necessary to hear how POS expansion would affect spending

01:45:59 V-R-Margo Praus: 3, 4 & 5

01:46:10 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : I thought that there was a good bus project that was mentioned that just missed out on total funding.

01:46:39 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Jonathan I already agreed to include you in the planning and I've also shared some of our timing constraints. Did you get my email?

01:46:40 V-R - Deby Provost : I agree with Margo 3, 4, and 5!

01:47:30 V-R - Douglas Vigil: agree margo 3 4 5

01:47:36 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Also, how do we know 2018 is a representative year? Data over multiple years would be more robust and reliable to understand emissions.

01:48:00 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Yes I did Jeff. Thank you for that email. Would like to get on that ASAP. Let's get an email with the CBOs on here so we can go over the Port's outreach strategy

01:48:27 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Yep! I watched that meeting too, Matt. They referred to us as "complaining". :)

01:48:35 V-CSC - Arlene Galindo: 4,5

01:49:13 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: How could the Port Commissioners not know about our steering committee?

01:49:14 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: It's concerning when the Port of Stockton Board of Commission doesn't allow Public Comments to even be read aloud

01:49:28 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: +++

01:49:51 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: Praise all of this!

01:49:55 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : They are allowed if a Commissioner requests so.

01:50:00 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree with Jonathan. It makes it hard to trust that the AB617 money will be used correctly.

01:50:00 V-R - Regina Griffin: Keep talking

01:50:06 V-R-Margo Praus: I think incentives to Port and other businesses need to include actual verbiage that keeps this equipment to be used in our actual area. As well as a real commitment to the Port Commission really being responsive to the community. we need these things in writing.

01:50:08 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: good points Matt!!!

01:50:21 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: ALLOWED IF COMMISSIONER REQUESTS IT. AND THEY DON'T

01:50:25 V-R - Nate Knodt: Port of Stockton is mostly privately for profit service. It is not a subsidized port in the classic sense of most transportation such as many big urban ports and airports.

01:50:36 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: NEVER HAVE FOR THE PAST 7 MONTHS

01:50:42 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++++

01:50:55 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Nate, are you saying that the port doesn't receive any federal or state funds?

01:51:07 V-R - Regina Griffin: Thank you Matt

01:51:27 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: I would rather see the money benefit immediate protections and investments in the community that has been neglected for so long. Vegetative barriers, EV, home filters, electrification, weatherization.

01:51:40 V-R - Nate Knodt: It receives incremental tax dollars, but operates mostly on a stand-alone basis with freight and ship revenues.

01:52:07 V-R - Regina Griffin: Yes Catherine

01:52:16 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: Catherine- agreed!

01:52:31 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I can answer that kind of

01:52:32 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: The Port website says that they are "a public entity that functions similar to a self-supporting business"

01:52:33 V-R - Regina Griffin: We want to know where to put the money

01:53:06 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: How does it reduce pollution to subsidize a major source of pollution that is expanding? I still haven't gotten an answer to that question.

01:53:09 V-R - Nate Knodt: We must close out the Red category. We are now almost 30 minutes behind schedule on a meeting that is already scheduled for an extra 30 minute duration.

01:53:09 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: They also received two substantial federal earmarks that funded the deepening of the port twice which increased its revenue. Something our new Assemblymember falsely tries to take credit for.

01:53:15 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Mariah, it says that because we receive zero tax dollars and have to make a profit to provide!

01:53:27 V-R - Regina Griffin: Where it is most needed and where to our limited funds to make the largest impact for the community

01:53:49 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I understand Jeff. I was just putting it in the chat for other folks to see.

01:53:52 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Survive, we are a public agency, not public utility just to clarify.

01:54:03 V-R - Ned Leiba: Ryan, health is fundamental. Health should guide our recommendations about which emission reductions are most effective, and what are a waste of funds.

01:54:49 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++

01:55:23 Kevin Hamilton - P: Most of the health studies are very general public health studies. We have more specific studies in Fresno but not in Stockton. Here's the link to the CHAPS home page which list all the peer reviewed publications to date. <https://www.chapssjv.org/>

01:55:45 Kevin Hamilton - P: CHAPS Children's Health and Air Pollution Study

01:56:15 V-R - Regina Griffin: If there are other funds available to the port we want them to take advantage of those first and foremost.

01:56:46 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: San Joaquin County doesn't have specific Air Pollution studies. But I'm hoping to bring in Stanford Medical, UC Davis, SJCPHS, and American Lung Association into a health study

01:56:59 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree Regina

01:57:00 Kevin Hamilton - P: Look at the studies on the impact of diesel pollution on fetal development. You will then understand our impatience with the process of cleaning this up.

01:57:22 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Jeff, please share out when you all put in a grant application so that you can receive some letters of support.

01:58:16 V-R-Margo Praus: Cleaning the air is our goal with this committee. Exposure mitigation is also important. But we don't want to ignore that we need to clean up the air.

01:58:54 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: I'm not sure I see where the committee wanted #3 in green

01:59:03 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: For rail equipment, CERP language would be helpful to spend only on the full-time LOCAL engines.

01:59:16 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Margo: We can do both. No one is saying we don't want to reduce emissions. We are discussing where we should invest these AB 617 dollars that are earmarked for this program. The port has many pots of money available they can access.

01:59:44 V-R-Margo Praus: I agree we can do both.

01:59:58 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: +++ @Catherine

02:00:04 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: The Strategic plan includes what exactly?

02:00:08 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Thanks Jeff, we can start by having them acknowledge public comments when they are appropriately submitted. Monday was a bad look. When they silenced public comments they made it harder for you to do your work here.

02:00:14 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Agreed with Catherine

02:01:07 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: +++ @Catherine

02:01:08 Ryan Hayashi - AD: @Catherine, my apologies definitely not saying that you don't want emission reductions, more just my desire to better understand the information people are looking for and how it would be used to help people's understanding. Thanks Catherine

02:01:14 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Hard to agree with 3 without discussing: Is there language ensuring these trains would stay local for their lifespan?

02:01:25 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Something that could help with community outreach with the Port of Stockton is hiring a full-time staff member that works solely on Community Engagement

02:01:39 Kevin Hamilton - P: Agreed Margo. Emissions. What can we do now to reduce all of them? Very little actually. It will take consistent investment across 5-10 years. So what can we do? We can make a big difference by investing in programs that protect residents from these emissions now. Within a few years would could create safe indoor air for schools and homes in these areas. The tech and experience are both here. As is are the studies that prove it works and improves health.

02:01:49 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: How much does the Port of Stockton have in their reserves?

02:02:05 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: So they don't take federal funds?

02:02:11 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:I agree Jonathan we are all wearing 10 hats...

02:02:15 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: I asked earlier and did not receive a response - Do we know how many locomotive switchers we have in the boundary area? If I remember correctly, it costs about \$1M to replace ONE. How many switchers are we talking about?

02:02:16 Brian Dodds - AD: @Catherine - their contract associated with any incentive funding would place requirements on usage within the community for a given period of time.

02:02:32 V-R - Regina Griffin: Its a public agency ?

02:02:33 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: It is interesting, but my children's bodies do not underwrite their profitability.

02:02:43 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Unless you're cool with being disposable

02:02:44 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: @Brian, who defines the "given period of time"?

02:02:47 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I love ships too

02:03:22 V-R - Nicholas Hatten:
https://www.recordnet.com/article/20100509/A_NEWS0803/5090316

02:03:41 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: Title: Earmarks a serious consideration in race for Congress

02:03:41 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Jeff, then lets make it happen with another staff member. Who do we have to convince? Richard, your boss? We'd like the Port of Stockton to be a partner similar to how the Port of Oakland respects West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project

02:03:57 Brian Dodds - AD: @Noehmi - we are reviewing information from CARB on locomotives in the Stockton area and there could be up 8-12 locomotives operating in the vicinity of Stockton

02:04:10 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Don't forget that Richard is a short timer.

02:04:16 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: ++ Jonathan. We don't need a new EJ Subcommittee, they didn't even know our name Monday

02:04:21 Brian Dodds - AD: @

02:04:35 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++ Jonathan and Matt

02:05:09 Skott Wall - CARB: @Noehmi - if the District does not have or share the switcher data you are asking, I will check with our rail group tomorrow to see if they have that information.

02:05:22 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: I believe Restore the Delta and @Nicholas are representing EJ, no?

02:05:30 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Thank you Skott

02:05:32 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: @ Brian - If we funded a locomotive switcher, what assurance do we have that it would actually replace the diesel switcher?

02:05:33 Brian Dodds - AD: @Catherine - typically the type of project dictates how long they are under contract for the equipment we fund. Trucks are typically 5 years.. Bigger projects like locomotives can be 10-15 years.

02:05:52 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Me neither

02:06:02 Ryan Hayashi - AD: @Noehmi, we are working with the owners of this equipment to have this information we will send it out to the committee

02:06:21 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Let build a port that works for us. Cause it doesn't.

02:06:25 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Thanks Kevin

02:06:49 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: I'm a resident participant who lives in the dirtiest air in this city. I'm here representing the historical marginalized people of this community. Thank you very much!

02:07:12 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : The citizen's of Stockton way back in the 1920's funded the Port.

02:07:19 Brian Dodds - AD: @Noehmi - with our incentive programs the last step in the process is the issuance of the funding for the project. In order to receive funds the company has to purchase, deploy the new equipment and get rid of the old equipment. All of which is verified by the District prior to sending them payment for the equipment. So we know 100% that the equipment has been replaced and the new lower emitting equipment is in operation.

02:07:35 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Boggs Tract neighborhood was here before the Port

02:08:11 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Good to know Brian. How long is the process of purchasing and deploying?

02:08:12 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Another piece of info we could use would be around what are the contract and arrangements with businesses at the Port.

02:08:16 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Why can't we keep the green measures we have and table all these for discussion after the plan is passed? It's a "living document" that we can add to anytime, right?

02:08:25 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Take out 2 in the red

02:08:28 V-R - Deby Provost : 3 4 5

02:08:37 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: They are taking a ton of heat here but there's plenty of actors out there that we want to understand and help

02:08:45 V-R - Deby Provost : Remove 2 and 6

02:08:57 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: strongly agree, @Catherine

02:09:10 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: ok with red 3

02:09:10 V-R - Nate Knodt: Yes move 3 Red to Green!

02:09:30 V-R - Ned Leiba: I do not believe any of the reds should be moved. Thanks.

02:09:38 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I don't think any reds should be moved.

02:09:44 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree with Catherine about tabling

02:09:51 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: No more moves....

02:09:52 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I vote no on all for now. I understand we need the reductions, but
for now

02:09:55 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: +++++

02:09:56 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: I don't agree with moving anything from the red

02:10:03 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: This is too entrenched

02:10:07 V-R - Deby Provost : move 4 and 5

02:10:08 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: No Tug Boats

02:10:10 V-R - Anthony Macias: no

02:10:11 V-R-Margo Praus: yes

02:10:15 V-CSC - Silvia Cantu: Not at this time

02:10:19 V-R - Nate Knodt: I say we do not move any more Red to Green.

02:10:23 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: No

02:10:23 V-R - Regina Griffin: remove 2

02:10:25 V-R - Florence Quilantang: No port moves.

02:10:32 V-R - Douglas Vigil: yes

02:10:34 V-R - Bianca Mendoza: NOT ready to move ANY of the red

02:10:39 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: I also prefer more discussion on 3 in red

02:10:45 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: fund only port items not owned by the Port of Stockton

02:10:55 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I want to work with these industries TERRIBLY but this is not an
accountable process YET. MOre discussion

02:11:23 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Can we consider a pilot marine exhaust project?

02:11:25 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: We have measures to clean up our air.

02:11:46 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Margo - we are trying to hold the industries that are
polluting the air accountable for cleaning their own messes.

02:11:49 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Related to trucks, electric vehicles, and what
about enforcement? Enhanced enforcement could generate a lot of reductions and is required under AB
617.

02:12:01 Brian Dodds - AD: @Noehmi - the timelines for purchasing and deploying a
locomotive vary to some extent but I've seen 12 - 18 months as fairly typical.

02:12:47 V-R - Deby Provost : We can remove 2 and 6, would that help?? Can we ask what
people think about those two right now?

02:13:04 Brian Dodds - AD: @Mary Elizabeth - a pilot marine exhaust project is something
that could be implemented through the CERP if that is a preference of the community

02:13:15 V-R - Deby Provost : Good job Douglas.

02:13:46 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Matt, we will have to make some decisions now, without complete information. We have flexibility to revise funding \$ amount for CERP line items

02:14:29 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Respectfully, We Don't Gene. That timetable is a straw dog.

02:14:32 V-CSC - Tina Lau: @Gene, agree

02:15:15 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: We'll get an extension or CARB Fails. The district just can't lead the extension request.

02:15:23 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I hate it oo

02:15:51 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: @Matt Proof?

02:16:16 V-R - Nate Knodt: I rescheduled other commitments tonight to be online tonight, and I put off another commitment from 7:00 to 7:30. We must move to CERP!

02:16:33 ASL Interpreter - Mark: Interpreter is here until 8pm

02:17:30 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: A community emission reduction plan is not legally enforceable. It is unclear what are any consequences there are if the plan doesn't achieve its goals. We have as much time as we need to add measures later if the CERP is truly a "living document."

02:17:33 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Multiple extensions across the state. CARB needs Stockton, bad... or the whole Cap and Trade program is in jeopardy.

02:17:37 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Nate is correct. CERP agenda item should begin now. Table present discussion, please

02:17:43 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Thank You Jeff. Very important info

02:17:54 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: *if not is

02:18:00 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: How come noone has the clout to get other actors here?

02:18:39 V-CSC - Espe Vielma: @air district staff. IF we don't vote today does that put us at disadvantage for funding?

02:18:54 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Thank you Nicholas - they have 4million to dredge to 40 feet in the audit report referenced earlier that you can find linked to the agenda from mon port meeting.

02:19:03 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: anyone from SUSD here to advocate?

02:19:57 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: @ Matt, no unfortunately. Silvia from George Washington Elementary (Boggs Tract area) is on

02:20:02 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: One of the main recipients of funding isn't even here

02:20:09 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Ok Cool.

02:20:12 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: HI Silvia;

02:20:27 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: How many people voted on moving item 3? I saw more people vote no than yes

02:20:45 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Can we formalize this vote?

02:20:47 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Same, Mariah...I saw a couple people but not enough to move it

02:20:48 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: What happened to roll call voting before moving items? Did that process change?

02:21:05 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: +++++

02:21:11 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: +++++

02:21:18 Erica Manuel - ILG: voting was a possibility but not a requirement

02:21:22 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : what does +++++ mean?

02:21:38 V-R - Bianca Mendoza: yes can we get an actual vote for moving 3

02:21:41 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: There's a lack of clarity whether a majority wanted to move 3 so I would recommend a vote.

02:21:42 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: @ Mary Elizabeth - it means that the person agrees with the person above

02:21:47 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: @ Mary, it means "AGREE"

02:22:01 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : living and learning:)

02:22:13 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: I did not agree. I counted at least 8 people who did not agree and only 3 that did agree. That is not fair or balanced.

02:23:12 V-CSC - Tina Lau: How many pages is the CERP?

02:23:13 V-R - Ned Leiba: The voting was confusing for me. I did not favor now moving anything out of red, but I assume we will have an opportunity to study and offer comments and vote later. Most important will be to gain cost benefit and health information for our next meeting.

02:23:17 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Wait we went form consensus to minority rule?

02:23:24 Erica Manuel - ILG: we can gauge by chat comments and spoken comments (public and private) if we have more than 50% or any strong disagreements

02:23:26 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: Take another vote. Not everyone voted.

02:23:36 V-R - Taylor Williams: Did item 3 get moved?? Agree that didn't look like consensus to me. Would prefer a vote if we're moving anything at all

02:24:28 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: ILG, we should probably do it the way we were meant to do. We can't pick and choose when we use voting and not.

02:24:36 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: +++

02:24:38 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:I apologize if I'm coming off as defensive, I'm trying not to be. I just feel like the Port has been making good strides and headed in a positive direction to continue to deploy zero emission equipment and continue to work together to make a difference in our air quality. I'm here to work collaboratively... just wanted to put that out there!

02:25:00 V-R - Regina Griffin: I didn't know I was voting

02:25:19 Erica Manuel - ILG: we definitely can vote on item #3 - it will take about 5 minutes to formally do so

02:25:35 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Thanks Jeff. I am interested in our St. George school and community parents participating in your future community collaborations.

02:25:42 V-CSC - Tina Lau: Jeff, I didn't find you to be defensive. I appreciate your efforts and the work you have put in

02:25:46 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Jeff, you're doing good. We aren't trying to be disrespectful.

02:25:51 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : Jeff you are. And good job to port it looks like minutes and meeting videos are going to be posted. But the community needs more than baby steps.

02:26:09 V-R - Regina Griffin: Jeff thank you for being here, we definitely need your input

02:26:11 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: We see you Jeff. You're in a tight spot. I appreciate you being here and responding. Just need your team to support your work. I really mean that.

02:26:14 V-R - Nate Knodt: Jeff thank you for fielding and addressing so many passionate comments and issues.

02:26:17 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: Jeff, we are looking forward to working with the Port on community outreach.

02:26:26 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: But at the end of the day, it's the Port commissioners that have final say for things :)

02:26:59 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : That is true and these folks for the City are going to be the same for quite some time.

02:26:59 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: As others have said Jeff, thank you for showing up. Obviously much more needs to be done from the port and that isn't just your responsibility. These conversations are challenging and much needed.

02:27:02 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Maybe we should have EJ representation in Port Commissioners like Port of San Diego

02:27:15 V-CSC - Tina Lau: ++

02:27:27 V-CSC - Tina Lau: (did I do that right?)

02:27:29 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : ++++++

02:28:11 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: Thanks for trying your best Jeff!

02:28:13 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Lol @ Tina and Mary Elizabeth: you got it!

02:28:26 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : What is the due date for this review?

02:29:39 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Is this document locked? or can a pdf reader comment?

02:30:31 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: May I suggest a web tool like Kami or Google Docs where we can collaborate on reviewing the document?

02:30:43 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: I can convert to gdocs.

02:31:43 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I'd like to review the document a lot longer than Fresno and Shafter had time

02:31:44 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Ok Great

02:32:21 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Just got the email from Heather with the link

02:32:31 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: And OCAP is listening to this and hopefully understands the need for malleability and long term community oversight.

02:32:50 Heather Heinks - AD: Great! Thanks for confirming @Catherine

02:33:24 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: The Port of Stockton is moving in a positive direction.

I feel there is confusion here what is meant by the "Port".

I believe there are two different categories for 'port'.

1. The equipment owned by the Port of Stockton (I would prefer to prefer we use the full name for this.)
2. The equipment not owned by the actual Port of Stockton should be given its own name. Port-support?

02:33:58 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: I have a hard stop at 7:30pm. If there is a vote about moving items into green from red. I want to make it known that I am not ready to move any red to green - including the trains. Thanks.

02:34:16 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: Let's revote red item 3 per other Voting members confusion

02:34:37 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: ++++ Gene Who are we talking about? Where's the business/activity roster?

02:34:56 Kevin Hamilton - P: Thanks Erica. Strong work tonight!

02:35:01 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: I request a formal vote, please.

02:35:03 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Yes, I request a formal vote.

02:35:05 V-CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: No to moving 3: Leave it in the red for further discussion.

02:35:05 V-R - Taylor Williams: Formal vote please

02:35:08 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: Please do a formal vote.

02:35:09 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: formal vote

02:35:10 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: If there's no time it stays where it's at.

02:35:10 V-R - Mary Elizabeth : yes formal vot

02:35:11 V-R - Bianca Mendoza: I would like a formal vote

02:35:12 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: I second formal vote

02:35:15 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: formal vote

02:35:15 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: in red

02:35:18 V-R - Nicholas Hatten: Don't move

02:35:26 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Do a blue hand vote...clocks ticking

02:35:41 V-R-Margo Praus: yes to moving 3 to green

02:35:51 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: No to moving 3 to green...

02:35:57 V-CSC - Silvia Cantu: formal

02:36:42 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Put the language in the chat please. What is the language for the vote?

02:39:12 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: Tengeluk

02:39:18 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Sorry Hannha! Worried there's no Roster set up for recording votes?

02:39:20 V-CSC - Mariah Looney: She is with Father & Families of San Joaquin

02:39:23 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: Thanks Noehmi!

02:39:30 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: it's in the chat

02:39:36 V-CSC - Noehmi Jauregui: I know about challenging names....)

02:40:19 V-CSC - Paige Tengeluk: Noehmi- Yes, lol! :)

02:41:39 V-R - Gloria Alonso: sorry I can't use my mic rn

02:41:56 V-R - Gloria Alonso: I vote no

02:42:18 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Matt, we got cut off last time. Interested in tree plotter or similar and think you had another option. Can I get your email?

02:43:05 V-CSC - Tina Lau: I really have to go now, is there anything after the vote that needs action?

02:43:15 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Or your recommendation for another tree planting software

02:43:24 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: I vote No

02:43:32 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: I tried unmuting several times

02:43:45 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: Panyasee

02:44:33 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: WHow as the alternate for?

02:44:41 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Did Tina get to vote?

02:44:48 Kim Danko - ILG: it was Arlene Galindo's alternate

02:44:52 V-CSC - Tina Lau: yes, thanks Jonathan

02:45:01 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: THX

02:45:58 V-CSC - Gene Fuss: would like to reach out to those who left

02:47:17 V-CSC - Matt Holmes: Thanks everyone

02:47:24 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Thank you everyone!

02:47:26 Kyle Goff - CARB: Thanks everyone, have a good night!

02:47:26 V-R - Taylor Williams: Thanks all

02:47:27 V-R - Stacey Panyasee: Have a great evening, everyone! Thanks for your time.

02:47:27 V-CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Goodnight