

Meeting Highlights*

AB 617 Stockton Community Steering Committee Meeting #6

August 5, 2020 | 5:00 pm - 7:00 pm

Virtual Zoom Meeting

Action items for the Stockton Community Steering Committee:

- Email District staff if interested in co-hosting a meeting

Action items for the District:

- Provide a succinct list of the 32 BARCT rules to the CSC; add to future agenda
- Work with community co-hosts to set agenda to cover rules and regulations and describe stationary sources in more detail
- Bring air monitoring plan budget info forward at the next meeting

Welcome and Introductions

Hanna Stelmakhovych, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, District

Douglas Vigil, Community Co-host

Hanna welcomed the Stockton CSC participants, went over Zoom etiquette, and thanked everyone for attending. She specifically acknowledged two new resident members, Nate Knodt and Victoria Moreno.

Hanna then turned it over to Ryan for a host welcome and Douglas Vigil for co-host remarks.

Community Emission Reduction Program (CERP) Strategies Exercise

Hanna Stelmakhovych, ILG

Jessica Olsen, District

Hanna described the CERP strategies exercise for the meeting, which was designed to provide an overview of CERP strategy components and a timeline for developing measures to reduce air pollution from community sources of concern.

Hanna turned it over to Jess, who covered the following:

- Overview of CERP strategies - existing and new
- Reminder of what needs to go into the CERP (measures, enforcement, compliance, collaboration with other agencies, etc.)
- Sources of concern that the District heard from the community

Jess explained that the purpose of the exercise was to begin developing a list of community-proposed strategies to address the main concerns heard throughout the community. Subject matter experts have been briefed to lead small group discussions on key topics.

Kim Danko (ILG) provided breakout room instructions. CSC members, CARB staff and District (AD) staff joined five small breakout groups to discuss: mobile sources, outreach/education, community sources, port sources, and stationary sources.

Hanna asked the subject matter experts to report back on their small group discussion and brainstorm briefly with the larger team.

Note: Zoom breakout room technology malfunctioned after the first breakout session. The meeting continued as a large group discussion.

Mobile Sources:

Aaron Tarango, District

Kyle Goff, California Air Resources Board (CARB)

Small Group Highlights:

- The community wants to know what the District is doing and what is happening in Stockton in terms of the incentives, the enforcement actions, etc.
- Public service announcements to the community may help residents learn to use the incentives offered
- Enhanced outreach is needed around the Port, as well as more electric trucks around the Port and electric school buses around the Stockton area
- There is interest in understanding how best to support independent truckers who cannot afford brand new trucks
- The last topic was replacing ag tractors in and around the Stockton area

Full Group Discussion (verbal and chat comments):

- CARB should come to a future CSC or subcommittee meeting to discuss truck rules, specifically in the Port area (refrigerants)
- Consider policies that will help small businesses with industrial pollutants (e.g. warehouses, trains, large vehicles)
- Find opportunities where electrical fleets can replace outdated fleets to reach current standards and lower emissions
- Add money to help educate the community about maintenance and repair of electric vehicles to increase community adoption and support
- Increase infrastructure for electric charging
- Add bike share in Downtown and South Stockton
- Provide more financial support for the rebates for replacing older cars with electric vehicles
- Electric drayage trucks at Port
- Electrify all rice trucks from Sacramento to Stockton
- Tug boat replacement/repower
- Electric landscaping, both commercial and residential
- Create low emission zones around schools

- Support land use policies that create a buffer zone between sensitive land uses (like homes) and major sources (like the freeway)
- More trees

Chat Question: What’s the difference between “enhanced enforcement” and just regular “enforcement”?

District Chat Answer: Enhanced Enforcement would be spending more time in a certain area, specifically looking at a certain emission source on a more regular basis, targeting enforcement on an area of concern. We are happy to mention strategies that are ongoing for any of these sources!

Chat Comment: It would be good to hear what other communities have done regarding AB 617. The issues of redlining and zoning have been pretty consistent statewide, so to hear what other communities have done should be extremely helpful. *(Answered below.)*

Chat Comment: Yes, learning from other communities and CERPs would help. Some ideas: closing the zone, or some roads in the zone, to all vehicles; car free days; reduce parking in certain areas; truck free hours, truck routes.

District Chat Answer: Some Mobile Source strategies that are in CERPs from Fresno and Shafter include replacing heavy duty trucks, helping public to replace older cars that might be gross polluters, providing Tune Up Events that help vehicles get repaired so they can pass smog, providing car share programs for public, electric school buses, clean up locomotives, and others.

Chat Comment: I'd liked to also look into an Alternate Truck Route Study for Boggs Tract. Fresno's AB 617 involves a Truck Route Study, correct?

District Chat Answer: You are correct! We are working with the City of Fresno on implementing that measure to study truck routes in their AB 617 boundary.

Chat Comment: What kind of verification is done on those voucher programs taking the money but not buying? We have a lot of diesel buses for schools public and private.

District Chat Answer: For vehicle replacement, we have a couple of check and balances in the program. Primarily we require a signed agreement with the resident and then the check actually goes to the dealership (say CarMax) for a pre-approved vehicle they plan to purchase. We walk them through the process and then require three years of follow up.

Chat Question: Does anyone know if delivery vehicles are already electric in this area? US Postal Service, UPS, FedEx, Amazon trucks....

District Chat Answer: Yes there are many EV light duty vehicles in the Stockton area (such as UPS) being used, but we are still far from having them all switch over. Definitely a good idea.

Chat Comment: Please include child care centers and private schools when allocating money for air filters.

Outreach/Education:

Heather Heinks, District

Jaime Holt, District

Small Group Highlights:

- We want to push out District messages in any way possible, such as state highway billboards
- The sky is the limit for the potential of outreach
- The District will work with the school districts to replace and install the highest rated school filters possible and see what other enhancements can come from the work already being done in schools
- The group discussed disseminating messages about no burn days or air quality alerts and ensuring that all communications are in both English and Spanish
- Suggestion to work with the Housing Authority and Citizen Science to have a portable air monitoring program as a way to get people more involved
- Focus on the farmworker community and make sure they have sufficient resources and knowledge

Full Group Discussion (verbal and chat comments):

- State highway billboards with messages around no burn days
- Spanish and other languages
- Using masks for promotional items
- Educating truckers about idling
- Try to reach the farmworker community
- Seek out unique outreach mechanisms (like parking lots) since COVID has changed patterns of travel
- Incorporate air filtration in schools
- Focus on positive messaging (incentive) vs. punitive
- Social media and real time outreach
- Use encouraging and positive messaging about what residents can do (e.g. carpooling, etc.)
- Utilize direct mail when possible, as well as electronic and digital (like text messaging)
- Utilize point of purchase marketing, retail, etc. vs. individual outreach (or in concert with it)
- Use Nextdoor app and local neighborhood watch Facebook groups
- Advertise in newspapers and on local radio stations
- Involve churches, mosques, temples, etc.
- Provide signage to businesses to ensure customers and employees are aware of concerns, issues, legally protected rights, etc.
- Educate the public to know what to watch out for in areas with lots of idling and how to file a complaint
- Talk about historical injustices that result in unjust policies in hopes of not repeating
- Insert in grocery ads
- Text message alerts
- Engage truck driver training companies to reach clients

Comment: Public education is one of the most cost effective ways we can have a positive impact. We can put together a strategic communications plan with key areas of what we think the community should know. Direct mail is an effective approach, our city council can help get positive messaging out.

Comment: We often hear employees or consumers are the last to get the information, so we should provide that at the top level.

Community Sources:

Jason Lawler, District

John Cadrett, District

Derek Winters, CARB

Small Group Highlights:

- Explored incentives for lawn mowers and types of yard care equipment
- Plastic and other materials used in cooking fires at homeless encampments are an issue; how can we find access to cleaner cooking alternatives?
- How can enhanced enforcement mitigate dust from traffic?
- Develop a research project to study air pollutions in Boggs Tract and how it impacts asthma rates, and from that develop an approach for going after the pollutants that trigger asthma

Full Group Discussion (verbal and chat comments):

- Increase incentives for lawn mowers and yard care equipment and increase outreach programs to expand awareness
- Asthma rates
- Cooking operations are an issue
- Trees are a major opportunity; lots of trees being destroyed
- Vegetative barriers on all roadways
- Ban fireworks
- More aeration to improve water quality from toxic blooms

Comment: The spike in the algal blooms near the Delta are a producer of methane, which is a concern for the community.

Question: Have we talked to any street corner chefs or food trucks? There must be other options for switching their equipment?

Answer: You have touched on a technologically challenging question. We are actively engaged in trying to find solutions for this, but there is not a way as of now to offer an incentive for new equipment. We are looking to see if there are ways to advance that technology and address that issue.

Question: Fresno had tree initiatives already—does Stockton have any tree initiatives?

Answer: Part of the problem is tree maintenance. We seem to have been able to move forward. We are relying on private spaces and private residences and business to maintain the trees we are currently planting. We will be doing limited planting in parks.

Port Sources:

John Stagnaro, District

Skott Wall, CARB

Small Group Highlights:

- A common theme that the Port had with the mobile source discussion was the traffic near the Port
- We want to electrify the fleet that comes and goes from the Port and we want to enforce or curtail the idling trucks
- Curious about the potential to use a different fuel type as ships come closer into the Port of Stockton; we can consider bio-diesel or renewable diesel as ships get within a mile of the Port
- Interest in electrifying boats and the charging of trucks as they queue up within the Port
- The Oakland Port has selected measures that might have some key learnings we can pull from. There are also examples from the Wilmington-Carson-West Long Beach Port that can be used as inspiration.

Full Group Discussion (verbal and chat comments):

- Lots of interest in other communities. West Long Beach/Wilmington/Carson has some examples from CARB research (e.g. outreach to shipping harbors; retrofit incentives, drayage truck regulations).
- Bicycle pathways, walking trails? What low cost opportunities exist? Smart technologies that make it easier for employers to telework, etc.
- The infrastructure side of this discussion is a critical piece, specifically with electrical and charging
- Work with community colleges
- Heavy duty to zero emission movers are all being considered; trying to bring everyone together and reduce emission across the Port
- Vegetative barriers around the Port
- Add another layer of review focused on the impact of development proposals and require additional mitigation measures
- Door to door carbon free supply chain from farm to Port
- Onshore power supply in the Port area for boats to plug in rather than idle
- FB Chat comment - provide free or discounted Wi-Fi so residents can hang air monitors from their homes
- Port traffic study to find out cumulative impacts
- Emission caps on various air pollution concerns with penalty fees for violations for stationary sources in Port
- Super Enhanced Enforcement on emissions from the Port of Stockton
- Transparency from Port on expansion projects
- Disallow use of mitigation banks or emission reduction credits that allow polluters to buy their way out of pollution instead of mitigate on site
- Compare on-site monitoring results to permitted pollution levels to ensure largest sources are compliant

Comment: Maybe some reasons we are seeing these mobile sources is that the right infrastructure is not in place. Maybe a bike exchange or bike program would incentivize the community to use bikes to get across town instead of vehicles. If we embrace the culture of zero emissions, we may help residents' lifestyles. Making sure there's adequate Wi-Fi service and smart technology makes it easier for employees to telework, which would be great.

Answer: This was the largest jump into electric equipment that the Port has ever made. I don't know if we were quite prepared, but the infrastructure side is a huge component of that and that is what we are learning right now, especially when working with PG&E to implement the charging stations. We do bounce a lot from other ports and try to learn from each other. We have a need in the workforce for electric vehicle technicians. We are in the middle of putting to use 36 pieces of zero emission equipment at the Port.

Stationary Sources:

Jake Felton, District

Arnaud Marjollet, District

Nick Peirce, District

Eric Bissinger, CARB

Small Group Highlights:

- The group discussed the Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT)
- A schedule has been approved and this BARCT analyses applies to those facilities that are subject to the cap and trade program
- There are over 100 facilities in the district subject to Cap and Trade and 32 rules will apply to those 100 facilities
- Out of those 32 rules that apply to those 100 facilities, 19 have demonstrated to satisfy the BARCT requirement
- Three more rules will be assessed in 2020
- Five rules that apply to oil and gas specifically will begin in 2020; two or three of these will be assessed ahead of the schedule that was adopted by our board a couple of years ago
- BARCT workshop hosted last week
- In 2018, they created a schedule to revisit each rule to ensure that they meet the BARCT requirements; if the rule needs to be revised, they will go through that process soon (like the 5 oil and gas rules to be considered in the near future)
- Assessments are ahead of schedule and everything is moving rapidly

Full Group Discussion (verbal and chat comments):

- Try to electrify equipment; efforts are currently underway
- Provide more explanation of Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT)
- We need electric public transportation for affordable housing communities
- We should still have the same approach as what was shared re: Port on enforcement on industries that are the top polluters with penalties and fines
- HVAC units and the running of AC is an issue; leverage technologies that use climate-friendly refrigerants

Question: What were the 32 rules that apply?

Answer: The 32 rules that apply are to very specific pieces of equipment, such as a combustion engine. 32 rules have been applied to those 100 facilities in the Valley. Under AB 617, a requirement applied to the district to put together a schedule with the intent of revisiting each of those rules under BARCT, in consideration of the cost and feasibility. Then a determination can be made on a rule by rule basis if it meets the state requirement of BARCT.

Answer: I think a more specific deep dive into the rules and regulations deserve more than just a couple of minutes on the agenda. We will work with the co-hosts to make sure that is on the agenda for the next meeting. We will bring a succinct list back to you and start identifying what kind of program it will be and what partners we'll need.

Community Air Monitoring Proposal

Jon Klassen, District

Jon presented a map of the proposed community air monitoring locations. Presentation highlights:

- We are proposing to put a PM 2.5 unit to measure PM 2.5 in real time, along with VOC measurements, just north of the Port of Stockton
- We are proposing to put an air monitoring trailer at the Port of Stockton—this would be the most comprehensive part of the air monitoring network
- We are proposing a PM 2.5 unit in Little Manila at the Crosstown Freeway because of all the traffic from diesel trucks and mobile exhaust
- We are proposing a PM 2.5 unit near Conway Homes and near El Dorado where there are a lot of emissions from cooking and barbecuing
- Last, we are proposing to put another compact multi-pollutant air monitoring system, which can measure PM 2.5, black carbon, oxides of nitrogen and VOC, downwind of the community
- This network design is not set in stone, but is a good start to implement; we can always shift some equipment during the monitoring campaign
- Our next step is to develop a community air monitoring plan, which will describe how the equipment will be operated and maintained
- Our goal is to have the air monitoring begin by January 2021

Question: Is there a reason why there is not a monitor in the Port versus across the street?

Answer: There are different fabrication shops in the area for cars and boats that produce VOCs and traffic types that cause PM 2.5, so we felt that measuring VOCs up there would be important.

Question: Does water algae get in the air as well and get monitored?

Answer: We will continue to do some research on this, but algae blooms cause different pollution levels of VOCs. We will have the ability to measure those samples and send them to a lab for more comprehensive analysis to break down if there are any impacts from algae in the area impacting air quality.

Chat Comment: A monitor near San Joaquin Elementary would be good. There's a lot of trucking companies in Charter Way and Fresno Ave.

Chat Comment: We need monitors that hold individual polluters accountable at the Port. I don't feel that the proposed monitors do that.

District Chat Answer: These are all regulatory grade monitors. As we collect the data, we can work to assess the source of pollution, respond to concerns, etc. Because these are of the highest quality, we can rely on the data.

Chat Comment: Will there be a short report out (document) of this proposed air quality monitoring work?

District Chat Answer: Yes! We will describe the details and purpose of the monitoring plan, the outreach plan, and quality control procedures.

Chat Comment: Big Concern: Community air monitoring plan but first you need to link to actual health outcomes. How much does the equipment cost? Should not move forward without knowing the economics and have some real cost benefit analysis.

Chat Comment: I'd like to request a budget be on the agenda next time. It's nice to think outside the box but we only have a few months so we will need to narrow down and cost is clearly a factor.

District Chat Answer: Yes, the plan is to bring budget info forward at the next meeting.

Chat Comment: When the CARB monitor moves, there will practically be no monitoring in East Stockton.

District Chat Answer: We can take that on as we continue our discussions with CARB. As the committee saw, CARB is planning to work with the CSC throughout the year to discuss the move and potential location. As we know more, we can work to supplement monitoring in that region after the move.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Hanna announced that the next community co-hosts are Glenabel and Gloria. She thanked Douglas for being the community co-host. She sought volunteers for future co-host duties. Douglas expressed gratitude for everyone's participation.

Public Comment

There were no public comments via Facebook.