

Stockton AB 617 CSC Meeting - Chat Transcript
Jan. 19, 2021 5:00-7:00 p.m.

00:28:11 Mariah Looney: can someone please rename me? I am driving. thank you!

00:36:02 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt- Catholic Charities: Good evening everyone! Thank you for joining the meeting

00:36:35 R - Douglas Vigil: Hello everyone this meeting '

00:36:49 CSC - Matt Holmes: Hi Doug. :-)

00:37:23 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui - St. George School: Hola!

00:37:55 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt- Catholic Charities: Spaghetti sounds good too. Thanks Taylor for the idea lol

00:39:02 CSC - Taylor Williams: Lol here to help Jonathan

00:46:10 R - Deby Provost: Did we get the needed info from the Port/Jeff to discuss the final issues?

00:48:37 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui - St. George School: Will we have any presentations on the port information/data at a regular AB 617 meeting?

00:49:49 Ryan Hayashi - AD: @Noehmi, yes, we are planning on providing that information at the next meeting on February 3rd

00:50:35 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui - St. George School: Thank you Ryan

00:51:08 CSC - Matt Holmes: Also Ship Visits? and Ship Tiers?

00:51:29 CSC - Taylor Williams: SECOND Dillon's point

00:51:54 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui - St. George School: Yes, info on existing incentive programs. Good idea Dillon.

00:52:50 CSC - Matt Holmes: For all incentive measures...not just port, but trucks, fireplaces, school busses, etc.....

00:54:07 Skott Wall - CARB: Good evening! Here is a follow-up answer from CARB Incentives from last Thursday's meeting:

Question from Jonathan Pruitt: CARB, will there be future funding for car share programs coming up soon?

Answer: There aren't any dedicated sources of CARB funding for car share programs. There is the possibility of funding car share as an advanced technology and equity pilot program using low-carbon transportation incentives. This is a competitive solicitation and would be judged against a variety of other pilot and tech demo projects. As with many incentives, any specific or dedicated sources of funding would likely come from the air district, though broadly speaking any community-based organization, federally recognized tribes, or local government entity could submit an application for low carbon transportation investment grant solicitations. If you'd like to explore this further, please let me know and I can connect you with CARB staff who can assist.

00:54:40 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: It would also be helpful if we could see a breakdown how much District incentive program money has been given to Stockton in the past few years.

00:55:24 Kyle Goff - CARB: For a bit of added context, many of the statewide incentives are competitive solicitations geared towards demonstration and pilot projects for advanced technologies or equity projects (or in some cases equity AND advanced technologies)

00:57:05 Jose Saldana - CARB EJ Unit: <https://fundingwizard.arb.ca.gov/web/>

00:58:24 Kyle Goff - CARB: That being said I can work on gathering up what sorts of statewide money has gone to projects in the air district, and I may be able to also get community-level investment data as well. I'll see how I can insert this kind of information into the broader discussion on local incentives in the community.

01:00:30 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Thanks Kyle, it would still be helpful to see the money that has been given for pilots in the Valley as well. I am assuming that if those pilots are able to prove technical feasibility it would be more likely that they would also get funding for implementation as well? Is that safe to assume?

01:02:24 Kyle Goff - CARB: I agree, it can feed into the bigger picture of what incentives have looked like in the valley! Also generally speaking those pilots and demo projects are exactly supposed to feed into the more "emission reduction oriented" projects you see in the Moyer Program for example. You've got it spot-on Cynthia!

01:02:58 Skott Wall - CARB: Here is another follow-up answer from last Thursday's meeting:

Question from Kevin Hamilton: Be great if CARB staff could present on the new (August 2020) Clean Ports and Ships at Birth rules and incentives.

Answer: CARB port staff did present to the committee on September 9, 2020, which included a brief presentation about the new and upcoming port regulations. The CARB Regulatory Presentation begins at approximately 1:18:10 at the recording posted to the Stockton AB 617 website and linked here:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QzaZKokjqQw&feature=youtu.be>

If the committee would like a deeper dive with CARB port staff, I'm happy to coordinate that.

Also, there are currently no CARB incentives that are directly linked with the port rules. Projects could be funded using Moyer/AB 617 funds.

01:05:40 R - Deby Provost: Can we do the yellow ones?

01:05:52 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Taylor and Douglas have their hand raised

01:10:16 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Thanks Skott,, would I be able to find if any port projects have been funded by Moyer on the CARB website?

01:14:08 CSC - Matt Holmes: But they will gobble up staff time which is not insignificant.

01:14:17 R - Stacey Panyasee: Shouldn't Port of Stockton be enforcement? Not just coordination?

01:15:38 R - Nate Knodt: I agree with Matt that we must not overload staff with too many measures. We must set priorities so as not to water down the usefulness of these measures by adopting too many.

01:16:18 R - Nate Knodt: We must start our sorting very soon or we are going to need another special meeting.

01:16:24 Skott Wall - CARB: Cynthia - Kyle Goff from CARB Incentives will link something.

01:16:40 CSC - Mariah Looney: didn't mean to raise my hand :)

01:17:30 Jaime Holt - AD: Stacey, several strategies such as #9 and #17 and #12 are enforcement activities aimed at equipment operating at the Port.

01:18:46 CSC - Matt Holmes: OR The Public Health Sector which still hasn't shown up to my knowledge?

01:19:22 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Public Health is present Matt

01:20:58 CSC - Matt Holmes: Ok Thanks just for example: Idling TRUs hit both local respiratory conditions and exacerbate the Global Climate phenomenon that will eventually kill us all....whereas fugitive dust could be addressed through vegetative barriers since we know how to address that with the incentives.

01:21:20 CSC - Matt Holmes: Not at all to me...why is Stockton last on the AD docket?

01:22:02 CSC - Matt Holmes: Copy that

01:22:22 Kyle Goff - CARB: Cynthia: We do have regular program statistics publicly posted for the Moyer Program -- which does include a level of detail that shows the number of marine vessel and shore power projects in each air district: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/carl-moyer-program-statistics-and-reports>

01:22:51 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Thanks Kyle appreciate it!

01:23:20 R - Stacey Panyasee: Let's move #9, #12, and #17 from yellow to green

01:23:35 Kyle Goff - CARB: It's kind of a lot of data to look at, but simultaneously I think It may leave you wanting more detailed information in regards to marine and shore power projects. The district-specific information starts on page 12!

01:24:27 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Orange or yellow?

01:24:47 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: ohhh nm

01:27:02 CSC - Matt Holmes: I think it is important as orgs that represent communities that we are clear that these are our priorities....whether we pay for it or CARB gets it done.

01:27:11 CSC - Matt Holmes: There appears to be no risk to leave it off the plna

01:27:14 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: So just to clarify, does moving the yellow enforcement items to green mean that those will get "enforced enhancement?"

01:27:20 CSC - Matt Holmes: plan*

01:27:34 R - Margo Praus: i think 1-7 are all important to be moved to green. Important enforcement. And if moving to green would just reinforce efforts—let's move to green.

01:28:21 CSC - Matt Holmes: Agree with Margo.

01:28:42 R - Gloria Alonso Cruz: I agree with Margo too!

01:29:16 CSC - Matt Holmes: They should all go in. Part of this process is to join forces with the AD to ensure that our region get the support that Sacramento owes us.

01:29:25 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: So does that mean funds from AB 617 will be used to pay for the extra enforcement as Jaime stated?

01:30:43 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: Thanks for the clarification.

01:31:27 CSC - Matt Holmes: Still, all AD funding will still (as promised) be sorted throughout implementation phase and will benefit from continuous community oversight.

01:31:52 CSC - Matt Holmes: And if CARB no shows on our CERP then we have one more ax to grind against them.

01:33:39 R - Douglas Vigil: I second it

01:33:39 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Is this making sense for folks? Stockton residents?

01:33:47 CSC - Matt Holmes: 'clapping' thank you Erica.

01:33:52 CSC - Matt Holmes: or we'll tell their board

01:34:00 R - Douglas Vigil: yes I second it

01:34:39 R - Deby Provost: I still think we need to talk about what the yellow items are!

01:34:40 CSC - Taylor Williams: I agree 1-7 should move to green. But if we are going to move over seven at once, can we have a vote?

01:34:54 R - Florence Quilantang: Makes sense. to me. Move 1-7 to green.

01:35:04 CSC - Matt Holmes: I concur

01:35:33 CSC - Mariah Looney: I agree with 1-7 being green

01:35:37 R - Douglas Vigil: i agree 1 to 7 move green

01:35:52 R - Stacey Panyasee: 1-7 to green

01:36:28 R - Lenard Seawood: i agree, 1-7 to green

01:40:55 R - Jennifer Flores: if we leave as is, it will still get done and no ab617 funds will be used? moving to green uses ab617 funds?

01:41:44 R - Nate Knodt: I am good with moving 1-7 from Yellow to Green.

01:41:50 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Thank you Warren. Glad to have you on the call

01:42:19 R - Douglas Vigil: i agree move 1 -7 to green

01:42:41 R - Deby Provost: I too am okay to move 1-7 from yellow to green.

01:42:57 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: When it comes to enhanced enforcement, does that mean quicker reporting. Quicker turnaround?

01:43:48 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Isn't CARB targeting some of their statewide strategies in the Valley on a faster timeline due to the Valley's extreme nonattainment? So we SHOULD be getting emissions in the next few years correct?

01:45:06 CSC Alt - Dillon Delvo: We believe enhanced enforcement is necessary. When CalEPA organized some enhanced enforcement two years ago, there were many fines handed out which showed the high levels of noncompliance from industry in our area.

01:45:09 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Interesting! Okay

01:45:53 R - Jennifer Flores: yellow items seem like major polluters I think moving to green is good

01:46:56 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Because the quicker reporting helps the communication strategy for Stockton. The Communication campaign for Valley Air District, EJ orgs, et al. on AB 617, incentive funding, and emission reporting is important.

01:48:33 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Dang, do we need more staff for VAD and CARB? lol

01:52:46 CSC-Kenda Templeton-PUENTES: Will #1 include options for alternatives for those who utilize wood for heat and cooking? Also, the homeless population burns a lot from parks. This is why my tree planting in parks struggle.

01:52:48 CSC - Matt Holmes: Yeah if they don't have to time to notice a huge industry violating state law...I hardly think we need them spending their rousting our most vulnerable unsheltered neighbors.

01:53:33 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Again for this measure, I would like to see what expedited emissions reductions we can get since this VMT is a part of CARB's Mobile Strategy

01:53:36 R - Gloria Alonso Cruz: Strongly agreeing with Matt

01:54:08 R - Deby Provost: I think we should move the residential burning over to green.

01:54:08 CSC - Matt Holmes: Ok thanks Ryan

01:54:11 R - Nate Knodt: I am for INCENTIVES to reduce residential wood burning reduction, but not very excited about enforcing this. US public is very anti government and regulation at this time, especially with personal activities.

01:54:11 R - Nate Knodt: \

01:54:54 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Thank you Kenda for letting us know about that. That's concerning and should be addressed. There's a gap here

01:56:50 CSC - Matt Holmes: Seems like an education campaign with replacement incentives would be more effective?

01:57:06 CSC - Matt Holmes: Maybe that can be qualified it the CERP?

01:57:18 R - Nate Knodt: I somewhat favor enforcement of reasonable measures to reduce vehicle travel. I believe that we must ENCOURAGE public transit and ped. & bike use. I rather these items be largely promoted through funding of attractive service and alternatives.

01:58:42 R - Nate Knodt: I totally favor upgrading of wood burning devices.

01:59:26 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: The Communication strategy will need to be heavily focused on so we can get Stockton residents aware of these incentives out there.

01:59:27 CSC - Matt Holmes: Are there new strategies that will benefit form inclusion in this CERP?

02:00:19 R - Deby Provost: I would like to urge everyone to push residential burning to the green side.

02:00:35 CSC - Matt Holmes: Wood burning was acknowledge as a meaningful strategy but with the Caveat that we wanted to see how much of that funding was already in District Coffers

02:00:37 R - Nate Knodt: I agree with a variety of strategies that zero in on wood burning to where limits will become accepted by the public as a reasonable behavior needed to clean our air.

02:02:12 CSC - Matt Holmes: Tax Documents... ;-)

02:03:05 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: lol

02:04:12 R-Stacey Panyasee: res. wood burning gets enough attn., no on enforced enhancement

02:05:33 CSC-Kenda Templeton-PUENTES: I agree with that

02:05:54 R - Florence Quilantang: Agree with Nate's comments.

02:06:37 R - Margo Praus: i think we're looking at decreasing our air pollution. Now would be a good time to increase enforcement. Let's move wood burning to green. With increased education.

02:07:43 R - Jennifer Flores: yes!

02:08:06 CSC Melissa Vargas - Catholic Charities: Great point, Mariah

02:08:36 Irene Calimlim - CSC: I agree with Mariah also

02:10:25 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: I agree with Mariah. It defeats the purpose of Environmental justice if we aren't also aware of communities already burdened

02:10:49 CSC - Taylor Williams: Same. Enhanced enforcement on residential woodburning seems like it would have an undue burden on low income residents.. I agree education and outreach is the better option

02:11:55 CSC - Matt Holmes: Also sounds like an existing successful program that can benefit form the new Ed & Outreach efforts we are already committed to funding.

02:11:59 R - Deby Provost: But do we want to be poor and sick? I think I would prefer a bold help on our side to those that need it, but we are trying to achieve a place w/o air pollution!

02:13:35 R - Douglas Vigil: i agree erica

02:13:46 R - Margo Praus: i agree with Deby

02:13:54 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Maybe the word "enforcement" needs to be changed

02:14:00 R - Nicholas Hatten: thumbs up

02:14:00 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: i have a question

02:14:09 Irene Calimlim - CSC: I think doing education and outreach is a better approach

02:14:49 CSC - Matt Holmes: I object to enhanced enforcement. I recommend we put it in as an element that benefits from ED & outreach effort here and the incentives prog.

02:14:57 R - Stacey Panyasee: I agree, I think doing education and outreach is a better approach.

02:15:12 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Not sure How to raise my hand but I have a question

02:15:23 CSC - Kenda Templeton: i agree with Irene and Matt...

02:15:33 CSC - Taylor Williams: Same^

02:15:39 Christal Lazard - CARB: @jonathan click on participants

02:16:01 R - Gloria Alonso Cruz: agree with education and outreach

02:16:05 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: i did

02:16:06 CSC - Matt Holmes: Yeah not sure where the 'staggered' enforcement strategy came from?

02:16:39 CSC - Matt Holmes: Grateful for the successful program history though. :-)

02:17:05 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: I agree with MAtt as well

02:17:08 R - Stacey Panyasee: just to clarify I object on enhanced enforcement on res. burning.

02:18:49 Jose Saldana - CARB EJ Unit: how bout enhanced outreach? folks who get called on get a visit to offer them incentive information

02:19:17 CSC - Mariah Looney: does the property owner get fined or the tenant if the property is rented?

02:19:31 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: There should be a Stockton specific survey.

02:20:00 CSC - Matt Holmes: Upvote "enhanced outreach."

02:20:01 R - Gloria Alonso Cruz: I want to clarify that I am Not voting yes on enhanced enforcement. I want to see more edu. and outreach

02:20:06 CSC - Mariah Looney: agreed with Cynthia

02:20:07 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: I agree with the language suggestion Jose made.

02:20:09 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: There should be enhanced outreach!

02:20:17 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: I've beennnn sayiinggg lol

02:20:35 R - Nate Knodt: I like the approach that incentive and outreach comes first, then enhanced enforcement as the last measure triggered later. COVID and economy will be better by 2024

02:20:57 R - Nate Knodt: I do not wish to move the last two red items. I wish to deal with VMT,

02:20:57 R - Douglas Vigil: i agree enhanced outreach

02:21:08 CSC - Matt Holmes: Ok that's where the "staggered" idea came from Nate....sorry I lost track of that.

02:21:43 Kyle Goff - CARB: For a bit of extra context at the CARB level, education and outreach leading to incentives leading to regulations leading to enforcement is definitely a solid long-term approach to an air quality issue!

02:22:01 Jaime Holt - AD: #5 in the green column is Enhanced outreach, really it is new outreach that will be specifically targeted directly to the AB 617 community.

02:22:03 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: Bumping back my comment on VMT, how can we guarantee Stockton getting expedited emissions reductions as opposed to the Valley Wide attainment timeline?

02:23:02 CSC - Matt Holmes: Just worried that it will disproportionately impact low income residents who have no choice but to commute to a higher wage earning region.

02:23:36 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: I'm hoping #5 will be more than multilingual outreach.

02:24:00 CSC - Matt Holmes: Thanks Ryan....So it's a joint advocacy initiative.

02:24:03 Jaime Holt - AD: Jonathan, it is a big item

02:24:42 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: So to be clear, if Stockton wants priority on this we need to allocate AB 617 funding.

02:24:48 R - Nicholas Hatten: Gotta go- Nieces virtual b-day party!

02:24:56 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Thanks Nicholas!

02:25:04 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Cynthia, can you clarify?

02:25:26 R - Nate Knodt: To reduce VMT, yes must be ;partnerships and coordination! Get Private and Public Partnerships to enhance funding for better transit. Yes Go Green!

02:25:54 R - Margo Praus: Outdoor Commercial Cooking Emissions should be a deeper discussion. I think it's important to get some control of those emissions which on are many street corners. but we ought to have input from the chefs utilizing. How can we see what options there are for them?

02:25:55 CSC - Matt Holmes: Seems low risk

02:26:22 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: There are lots of partnerships in this and I'm hoping some orgs are noting on the future priorities.

02:26:29 CSC Alt - Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera: It sounds like these collabs are already being worked on, so if we don't allocate money we'll fall into a waitlist

02:26:49 Anthony Presto - AD: Nothing on Facebook

02:27:10 CSC - Matt Holmes: Doubtful Cynthia....they'll work with us either way.

02:27:19 CSC - Matt Holmes: Especially if we keep up the heat.

02:27:52 Trish Johnson - CARB: CARB's Virtual Project 800: Zero-Emission Truck Forum this Thursday: <https://content.govdelivery.com/accounts/CARB/bulletins/2ba182b>

02:27:54 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Great! Who's cohost?

02:28:18 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Oh yes! Trish please share this on the video

02:28:59 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Erica, could we please have CARB share the Truck forum

02:29:16 Christal Lazard - CARB: We can send info out to the full list

02:29:49 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt - Catholic Charities: Have a good night everyone and a wonderful week. Thank you all!

02:29:56

CSC - Matt Holmes: Can anyone share info with the list?