

Meeting Highlights* **AB 617 Fresno Community Steering Committee Meeting #26**

October 14, 2020, 5:30 pm - 7:30 pm

Virtual Zoom Meeting

Action items for the Fresno Community Steering Committee (CSC):

- Participate in the October 28 Truck Rerouting Subcommittee Meeting
- Provide feedback or comments about the Truck Rerouting Study RFP
- Contact the SJVAPCD with information about the best locations to focus enforcement measure inspections
- Contact CARB with any suggestions about where anti-idling signs should be placed
- Submit comments on the draft Annual Report by October 23
- Contact SJVAPCD if you need a printed copy of the draft Annual Report
- Submit recommendations for possible agenda items for future CSC meetings

Action items for San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (SJVAPCD):

- Re-send the Truck Rerouting Study RFP to those who did not receive it
- Send information about which CARB contacts are most appropriate for truck idling violations
- Finalize a one page document about what AB 617 is and distribute a community postcard about AB 617 air quality monitoring data
- Investigate the Orange Street idling issue and report back to the CSC
- Re-engage in discussions with CARB around the possibility of developing an MOU on enforcement
- Check the reporting hotline to ensure that proper protocols related to response time are being adhered to
- Explore viability of establishing a Vegetative Barriers subcommittee
- Confirm the November CSC meeting date and time

Welcome and Introductions

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, Valley Air District

Kimberly McCoy, CSC Community Co-host

Erica introduced herself and the ILG team, welcomed all participants and went over housekeeping items and translation services. The facilitation team provided an overview of the meeting agenda. Ryan thanked the CSC for attending and for continued support of the AB 617 program and moving the measures forward. Kimberly thanked everyone for allowing her to be the community co-host again and expressed excitement to hear all the updates and discussion.

Standing Updates: Truck Rerouting Subcommittee

Scott Mozier, Public Works Director, City of Fresno

Scott gave an update on the truck re-routing study RFP and feedback opportunities. Presentation highlights:

- The City of Fresno compiled a draft RFP that outlines the scope of services for the study, including traffic data, evaluating routes, looking at land uses, schools, city/county/Caltrans jurisdictions, truck origins and destinations, stakeholders, and subcommittee reports

- The CSC received the draft RFP document electronically on Monday, October 12
- Next steps are to convene the Truck Rerouting Subcommittee to provide detailed comments
- With regard to funding, there will need to be a cooperative agreement between SJVAPCD and the City of Fresno for this work to be completed
- The Truck Rerouting Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for October 28 and any CSC member is welcome to attend

SJVAPCD Comment: We are very fortunate because this was one of the first project plans we submitted to CARB to get the allowance to spend the incentive funding on this measure.

Question: Can you provide the financial breakdown of the 617 money that will fund this study versus budget allocated from the city?

Answer: The RFP draft does contain dollar amounts from AB 617. The city has budgeted numerous in-kind services and the hard cost of managing the consultant through that process, as well as oversight during study period itself.

Question: If I have not been part of the subcommittee, to whom do I send my comments on the RFP?

Answer: SJVAPCD is happy to collect the feedback from the CSC and then provide it to the City on your behalf.

Question: I attended the City's budget hearing this week. The City Council asked what portion of the Study budget of \$500,000 the city would be responsible for. My concern is that a Truck Reroute Study is already something the city is and should be responsible and accountable for through the Southwest Specific Plan. Based on that document, a Truck Reroute study was supposed to be initiated by 2018. There is overlap between the Southwest Specific Plan area and our 617 community. The AB 617 money related to the CERP funding is limited because of all of our measures, so we should ensure the CSC understands this. We should push the City to provide more than just in-kind donations. The CSC has requested a wide range of services be provided as part of this RFP. If the respondents review and the RFP and say they'll need more than \$500,000, will the city contribute additional funds? Where will additional funding come from to ensure this study meets its goals?

Answer: That is a great question. From the city budget perspective, there are additional dollars that are anticipated to be needed as part of this partnership with SJVAPCD. Our administration and city council will have to consider if and how to secure additional funding if it is needed. We all know these are very difficult times. The City is not undertaking new general fund requests. With regard to refining the scope of the study, that's exactly what the Truck Rerouting Subcommittee is for. While we could add a lot more to the study, if we can accomplish the goal of achieving truck rerouting in the community without spending as much and preserve more funding for other priorities the CSC has outlined, that would be a valid effort.

Question: At the City's budget meeting today, there were motions made in support of the planning department adding additional studies at \$525,000. With that in mind, you should go back and request a minimum of \$100,000 for this CSC effort in case there are additional expenses required to cover this study.

Answer: The City's budget process is not driven by the staff; it is actually driven by the Council members. So far, they have not elevated this Truck Rerouting Study as a top priority... If you have concerns about that prioritization, please reach out to the Council directly and they can provide staff approval.

Question: This issue was clearly discussed and made a priority by the community throughout discussion about the Southwest Specific Plan. It is unfortunate that it hasn't been prioritized from

the city's perspective. Given that the impact of continued exposure to PM 2.5, the health risks, the development of chronic lung disease and all of the issues that place black and brown communities at increased risk for poor COVID outcomes, is there a possibility of using CARES dollars to fund a legitimate study that accomplishes the health outcomes we're seeking?

Answer: Our City Council is responsible for determining where the CARES dollars are allocated. The CARES dollars are expiring December 30 and whatever the money is earmarked for must be fully delivered, installed and complete by that date. This type of Truck re-route study would not be able to meet that deadline. I think with SJVAPCD, AB 617 and the city's contribution, there are appropriate levels of funds to complete the study as proposed.

Standing Updates: School Filtration and Bus Subcommittee

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, Valley Air District

Jaime provided an update on the School Filtration and Bus Subcommittee. Presentation highlights:

- SJVAPCD has been working to better understand school HVAC systems and some of the challenges and limitations
- There are lots of variations in what the different school sites can take on
- SJVAPCD is talking to the CARB grants team to better understand what the grants can fund and where there may be flexibility
- SJVAPCD staff is still working with CARB to make sure the grant application has as much flexibility as is allowable within the CARB guidelines to get these filters in as many schools as possible
- SJVAPCD is continuing to deploy electric school buses in CSC school districts that are not Fresno Unified and we are planning to have a conversation with Fresno Unified to get them on board as well
- There is a subcommittee meeting scheduled for October 26 with numerous school trustees and Fresno Unified staff already confirmed to attend

Question: Do you have an accurate inventory of what is currently at the schools?

Answer: We do have a decent inventory of what is at the non-Fresno Unified schools, but we are struggling to get that information from the Fresno Unified schools.

Standing Updates: Recent Community Air Monitoring Results

Chay Thao, Program Manager, Valley Air District

Chay provided an update on recent community air monitoring. Presentation highlights:

- The Central Unified School Board requested monitoring at Madison Elementary; that agreement has been signed
- SJVAPCD is working with Fresno Unified to get equipment at the Edison High School location
- SJVAPCD has finally installed the air monitoring at West Fresno Middle School; the CSC deserves recognition for the support of that location
- Staff is continuing to use the air monitoring van to respond to community concerns; we received a request to monitor high delivery van traffic near the Amazon delivery center and that data from September 16 is now on the website

Question: I was looking at the newsletters on the website and the data from a 24-hour period is an average. Is there any way to show the actual data by hour? That data would allow the community wants to plan their day based on the hourly spikes.

Answer: SJVAPCD has weekly reports that we publish but there is also real time monitoring data you can access with per hour information. The weekly data wasn't intended to show hourly spikes; instead the weekly data provides a general idea of where the weekly emissions are. The hourly data you're looking for is available on the website and provides a historical view as well.

Question: Someone who is not familiar with AB 617 probably doesn't know where to look for these monitors. Is there a way for any person, regardless of their involvement in AB 617, to have quick and easy access to the data from these monitors?

Answer: SJVAPCD has this on our to-do list; a one page document about what AB 617 is and a postcard for community members about how to check AB 617 air quality monitoring data. We appreciate you bringing this back to the top of our priority list.

Question: Why are these monitors not being connected to RAAN? There is so much work being done to get the word out on RAAN and it would make sense to merge that data.

Answer: Part of that is just a technology challenge that SJVAPCD is having. We are looking at the back-end architecture that the RAAN system is built on. We have struggled with reliability and we are looking to make RAAN much more reliable.

Comment: I live on Orange Street and see a lot of trucks driving through the street and I don't know why this is happening.

Answer: If they are driving through residential streets and not staying on truck routes, this is a very timely topic because we have both SJVAPCD enforcement and CARB enforcement available. If trucks aren't abiding by truck routes, that's potentially code enforcement.

CARB: CARB will be back in Fresno towards the end of the year and I just took note of Orange Street and will make sure we drive by there and see if those trucks are compliant.

Question: CARB, since you're located in Sacramento how do you handle requests that require immediate response? — Are you connected to the CHP? What is the fastest response when these violations are actually happening in real-time?

Answer: You are correct that because we are in Sacramento, it is hard for us to be present in Fresno all the time. If we go there and check regularly, it will deter negative behavior. Truckers tend to talk to each other, so if word travels that we are ticketing them the behavior may stop. It would be nice if CHP or the city could partner with us.

Answer: SJVAPCD will commit to sending the CSC a CARB contact list with the most appropriate contacts who can respond as quickly as possible.

Question: In the first part of the year, we talked in a CSC meeting about this exact problem. We will call Sacramento, someone will complain, but by the time CARB gets down here, they will be gone and nothing happens. At that time, we discussed the possibility of CARB and SJVAPCD entering into an MOU on enforcement. Did that happen? Could SJVAPCD actually send staff to do the investigation and write the citation?

Answer: SJVAPCD has the authority under the state regulation for the idling diesel trucks and school buses and to cite people not complying with the state regulations. There are other regulations under mobile that we do not have the authority over and would require a formal MOU. We will discuss streamlining these activities with CARB to see what is possible.

Answer: CARB can also conduct a desk audit to ensure compliance with our regulations, so even if we cannot be there physically, you can be the eyes and ears of the community.

Enforcement Update

Jason Lawler, Air Quality Compliance Manager, Valley Air District

Justin Shields, Air Pollution Specialist, CARB

Jason gave a brief update of enforcement measures implementation. Presentation highlights:

- There are six different enforcement measures in the CERP for the South Central Fresno community
- He provided an update on last season's work on enhanced enforcement of wood burning curtailments and asked for any feedback on additional areas and time of day since the season begins again on November 1st.
- District staff performed surveillance for illegal burning during the quarter and responded to 24 public complaints regarding open burning; all complaints were responded to. District investigations resulted in five open burning violations.
- SJVAPCD inspectors conducted targeted enforcement of fugitive dust at construction sites during the second and third quarters of 2020 and did not discover any violations of District rules. The District also requested any guidance and feedback on locations needing additional inspection
- SJVAPCD inspectors conducted targeted enforcement of statewide anti-idling regulation, focusing on areas identified by CSC members, during each of the first three quarters of 2020 and did not document any non-compliance.
- SJVAPCD has increased the frequency of inspections at permitted facilities that have had emissions violations within the last three years; to date, 23 enforcement actions have been taken as part of a compliance inspection
- SJVAPCD has developed a training outline to instruct gas station operators how to conduct self-inspections of vapor recovery systems, however, the District is evaluating how to perform the training while adhering to the federal, state, and local public health guidelines during the pandemic

Justin gave a CARB enforcement update. Presentation highlights:

- CARB has “no-idling” signs available that can be posted on public roads and act as a deterrent for heavy duty diesel trucks that are idling where they are not allowed
- Please reach out if you believe these signs would have an impact in the South Central Fresno community
- As CARB staff look for illegally idling trucks, the truck and bus regulation and transportation refrigeration unit regulation allows CARB to record license plate numbers and TRU identification numbers; CARB uses this information to conduct a desk audit to determine compliance
- CARB has a specific strategy in the enforcement plan section of the CERP; we will update our strategies based upon input from the community
- If an agency or community member would like to cooperate with CARB in further enhancing enforcement, please contact CARB
- CARB will be in Fresno before the end of 2020

Comment: There was a shop between H and Belmont that was burning something. South of Belmont Park, there were unsafe levels of PM 2.5 because of a fast food place.

CARB Response: These are great, thank you. We will report back to these during the public comment section.

Question: I dialed the reporting number at 1:00am this morning. What is the turnaround time to call somebody back? It has been almost twelve hours and nobody has called me back.

District Response: SJVAPCD has directed people to return calls immediately, even in the middle of the night. My expectation is that no matter what time it is, we are responding quickly. Jason is the Compliance Manager in this region and he will look into your issue and get back to you with a specific reason why that follow up did not happen.

Comment: I am definitely in favor of adding diesel enforcement sweeps to the CERP. I also think an MOU between SJVAPCD, CARB and perhaps the City of Fresno concerning mobile source enforcement could be really helpful in the CERP.

CARB Response: In the CERP, there is an expectation that SJVAPCD and CARB continue to do idling sweeps over the next five years—that's not going to change. Regarding collaboration, we should discuss interagency interactions. Any time we get a complaint referred to us, if it's not within our jurisdiction, we don't tell people that we won't enforce that. We research it, we find out the right agency and identify who that person can contact at the correct agency. It is important not to just leave things unaddressed. SJVAPCD is looking to change the perception of government and you have our commitment to always find out who the responsible agencies are, even if it's not us.

Discussion of Annual Report Feedback

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, Valley Air District

Jaime reviewed the draft Annual Report and outlined the feedback process with the CSC. Presentation highlights:

- Comments are due October 23
- The report features tables that show exactly which strategies the CSC has chosen, the corresponding pages in the CERP, a description of the strategy and a status update

Comment from Spanish-speaker: The report looks fine, but I'd like to see more actions completed and promises kept that were made.

District Response: That is important and we want to keep our foot on the gas.

Comment: I have submitted a letter to SJVAPCD that includes some general concerns about resolution requirements that are still outstanding. We know there is a part that says under 617, CARB must develop a statewide reporting system for criteria and toxic conditions of stationary sources. We have had the conversation to add the awareness to land use decisions being enacted by the City Planning Commission. At a local air district level, being involved in that process and responding to those plans that do not contain the goals of emissions reductions is important. I would like to see those MOUs get developed and signed.

District Response: Thanks for that reminder. It will require a full partnership with active participation by all those jurisdictions to accomplish that.

Comment: There was an addendum added to the CERP related to public health issues. This presents an opportunity to expand the public health section of the report, because ultimately that is the real impact. This would allow us to connect this report and our monitoring to the health and well-being of the communities that are currently impacted. How do we improve the reporting aspect of all the monitoring so that communities actually have an understanding of what is happening?

District Response: SJVAPCD is actually thinking about how we can better gather some of this public health data and better communicate it. This is a priority and something we are hearing in the Stockton community as well. I do know that CARB is thinking of incorporating some of the health impact data as well.

Comment: I think the MOUs are overdue and we have not seen movement on that. I appreciate the City staff coming to CSC meetings and representing the city, but we need to take it to the next level and have those MOUs in place. In terms of health, I completely agree. Our response to addressing health impacts was just adding a document describing health impacts of air pollution; that document is not assessing how much we are moving the needle to improve the health of community residents. Can we ask the Asthma Collaborative to do some health assessments? I don't know if the health assessments need to be in this report, but we need to conduct them and report on them. Last, I have requested a subcommittee on vegetative barriers since we heard from Tree Fresno and we have not started that. There is a Climate Corp Program that helps the state pay for full-time fellows for nine months to work on strategies like the ones that we have incorporated into the CERP. Why aren't we taking advantage of these things?

District Response: Thank you. SJVAPCD is recording all the comments and requests related to this agenda item.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Erica Manuel, Facilitator & CEO/Executive Director, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Erica thanked everyone for participating in a productive meeting and asked CSC members to suggest future agenda items, especially if there are deadlines associated with them. She asked residents that participate in the stipend program to contact ILG with any questions. Erica thanked Kimberly for being the Community Co-host and asked interested CSC members to volunteer to be one in the future. Kimberly thanked everyone for attending and all the participation on the Truck Rerouting Study. She urged SJVAPCD to consider the health and wellness component.

Erica ended with a Zoom poll for the rescheduled November CSC meeting.

Reminders

The next regularly scheduled CSC meeting conflicts with Veterans Day, so the new date will be either November 5 or November 10 via Zoom and will be confirmed via email. All the presentations, meetings highlights, transcripts and the Zoom meeting recording will be posted online.

*Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.

Public Comment

No public comment.