

Stockton AB 617 CSC Meeting - Chat Transcript
Oct. 20, 2020 5-7 p.m.

00:37:03 Albert Rivas - GOV: Albert Rivas, Program Manager III, City of Stockton - hello everyone!

00:38:51 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Good evening, Catherine with Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ) and CSC

00:45:16 CSC - Tina Lau:HAPPY BIRTHDAY!!!!

00:45:19 R - Stacey Panyasee: Happy Birthday!!

00:45:21 Karen Buckley - CARB: Happy Birthday!!!!

00:45:24 Kim Danko - ILG: happy birthday, Jaime!!!

00:46:26 Erica Manuel - ILG: Happy Birthday, Jaime!!!

00:47:18 CSC - Albert Rivas GOV: happy birthday Jaime! Wishing you a fantastic birthday! thanks for sharing a portion of your day with us.

00:51:26 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I'm really excited to see all the links in this powerpoint!

00:52:11 R - Nate Knodt: I served three four three year terms on the SJCOG Citizen's Advisory Committee 2002-2014.

00:57:43 R - Nate Knodt: Links are very helpful!

00:59:19 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Wow, looks like a major increase in all types of traffic at the port.

01:01:02 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Unfortunately, more traffic means more trucks driving through Boggs Tract Community.

01:05:11 CSC - Albert Rivas GOV: yes interested in Algal bloom. will visit website. thank you

01:06:21 Jaime Holt - AD: Thanks for the birthday wishes everyone. I really am having a great day!

01:07:04 CSC - Ed Ward:Thank you Mary Catherine valuable presentation

01:07:17 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Does the port have an identified location for truck parking, ideally where trucks can plug in instead of idle?

01:07:36 Hanna - Institute for Local Government: Mary, we cannot hear you anymore

01:07:44 R - Stacey Panyasee: I'm concerned about the major increase of traffic at the port. The air quality by the port is already very poor.

01:08:11 R - Nate Knodt: Applause!

01:08:12 Christal Lazard - CARB: Fantastic presentation!

01:08:14 R - Bianca Mendoza: Thank you for all the links! Definitely interested to read more on the topics.

01:08:16 CSC - Dillon Delvo: How it is possible that Port Commissioners vote on funding initiatives without fully understanding health impacts to residents of Stockton?

01:08:18 R - Ned Leiba : Thanks Mary Elizabeth, I learned a lot!

01:08:36 R - Deby Provost: What a great presentation from Mary Elizabeth! Thank you! I do have some questions, but will ask you later!!

01:08:42 R - Stacey Panyasee: thank you for the presentation Mary!

01:09:21 R - Anthony Macias: Thank you Mary! Awesome presentation!

01:09:27 R - Bianca Mendoza: Concerning to hear that the port starts initiatives without having an environmentalist sufficiently weighing in on the topics.

01:09:29 Jaime Holt - AD: Great job Mary!!!!

01:09:47 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I'm not familiar with the number. It isn't Mary

01:10:01 Kim Danko - ILG: thanks, Jonathan

01:10:07 Kim Danko - ILG: we will keep our eyes and ears peeled

01:15:08 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Environmental Justice needs to be understood from the Port Commission level

01:16:45 Mary Elizabeth: The Technical working group should be public meetings to allow the public to learn about the emission inventory.

01:18:45 R - Margo Praus: Great presentation, Mary. Delta-Sierra Group is so fortunate to have her expertise as she continues to work full time. As the monitoring of these projects moves forward, the participation of other community members is important to effecting change so asking all to please keep in mind.

01:18:58 Mary Elizabeth: The Port has only just begun with electric equipment. I do not believe that there is charging available for trucks but perhaps Jeffery can better address that question.

01:22:04 R - Margo Praus: What efforts is the Port working on to control coal dust and other dust from cement and agriculture products? These also draft widely into neighborhoods.

01:22:36 R - Victoria Moreno: agree with you Margo!

01:22:50 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Trucks also idle for things like their AC, etc when they are resting, so even diesel trucks can plug in for that power, right? And reduce emissions from idling?

01:24:51 R - Nate Knodt: I was RTD Director of Planning and Schedule Development when RTD installed Proterra Bus Quick-Charging Stations at Downtown Transit Center and at Union Transfer Station and designed bus charging schedules. RTD implemented and operates nine (9) all-electric bus transit routes.

01:25:04 R - Lenard Seawood: #8922 Lenard Seawood is on

01:26:15 Heather Heinks - AD: Hi Lenard!

01:28:45 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: It would be helpful to know timelines for things like the Health Risk Assessments. Also are there emergency plans in place, since there are lots of volatile products moving through the port?

01:29:28 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Good points, Catherine

01:29:34 R- Mary Elizabeth: Community outreach is a new area that green marine is piloting this year and making it a part of their program the following year.

01:29:53 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: I know we want to discuss CERP measures so would be happy to receive answers to these questions offline.

01:35:26 CSC - Dillon Delvo: During yesterday's Port Commissioner meeting, one of the Port Commissioners did not know what GHGs were. As Stockton's largest polluter, what type of public health and environmental training is given to Port Commissioners?

01:37:23 R - Deby Provost: Jeff, I'd be interested in helping the Port and you by participating on your commty committees.

01:37:30 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: ++ Dillon...and training for staff, and are there staff positions dedicated to EJ and public health issues?

01:41:39 CSC - Dillon Delvo: How it is possible that Port Commissioners vote on funding multimillion dollar initiatives without fully understanding health impacts to residents of Stockton?

01:42:49 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: ^^

01:42:54 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : <https://www.stocktondiamond.com/> Information on Stockton Diamond project

01:43:50 R- Mary Elizabeth: DSG wrote two letters of support for the project. Looking forward to those mitigation measures.

01:44:43 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I too have those concerns that Dillon questioned

01:45:40 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : \$200 million awarded

01:46:08 R - Douglas Vigil: wow

01:47:46 R - Nate Knodt: Rene, I will coordinate with you to provide time on local radio shows for you to conduct outreach. I have been working on LEAP Grant Projects.

01:47:56 Rene Gutierrez - SJRRC: rene@acerail.com; 209-235-0133

01:48:19 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: If we really want to stay on track with adopting CERP measures by December, I thought the goal for extra meetings was to discuss the measures.

01:48:58 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Hi Mary,

01:49:41 CSC - Albert Rivas GOV: Rene - thank you for insightful information. I'll email you some questions I have. albert.rivas@stocktonca.gov

01:50:51 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Sorry about that, the emission inventory technical advisory group is made up of air experts but I would like others input as we move forward and think there will be an opportunity. The EV Blueprint will definitely include community members throughout to provide input.

01:51:33 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:I will follow up with the group regarding input on the emission inventory once all info has been gathered.

01:52:20 CSC - Ed Ward:Jeff thank you for your presentation well done

01:53:57 R - Nate Knodt: RTD has publicly committed to all-electric bus transit routes by 2025-30 as technology allows.

01:55:47 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:We have the chargers but we do not have any electric trucks coming to the port. We'd like to find funding for zero emission trucks and work with our tenants to introduce them to our fleets.

01:58:38 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Dillon, our Commissioner knows what GHG's are, I think it was out of context, but we will revisit with our Board.

01:58:50 R - Nate Knodt: Heavy-duty reliable and efficient vehicle charging devices are a big challenge to operating all-electric bus and truck fleets.

02:00:17 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Thank you Skott! Helpful to see there are growing options for ZEVs.

02:00:22 Hanjro Ambrose @CARB: There are incentives available for fleets to adopt Zero emissions trucks through the hybrid vehicle incentive program (HVIP). Although the program has exhausted funds for this year, there will be additional funds available next year.

02:00:26 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Skott, there are funds available for Truck companies and Ports to apply for to get ZEVs?

02:00:44 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Thanks Hanjro

02:00:59 Hanjro Ambrose @CARB: Heres a couple links to the HVIP: <https://www.californiahvip.org/how-to-participate/#steps-to-participate> and to more about CARB programs: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2019-12/SB%20498%20Appendix%20B%20-%20ZEV%20Programs%20120719.pdf>

02:01:44 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:HI, if you are interested in being a part of our Community groups please email me and Shannon Arnold at jwingfield@stocktonport.com and shannon@rebelmarketing-pros.com

02:01:46 Skott Wall - CARB: Jonathan - Hanjiro beat me to it with the links he shared (thanks Hanjiro!).

02:02:13 Skott Wall - CARB: Jonathan - if you'd like me to connect you with our Incentives folks for a deeper discussion, I'd be happy to.

02:05:04 R- Mary Elizabeth: I missed the need to add a new number.

02:05:12 Jeffrey Wingfield - GOV:Hi Catherine, we do have plans in place through our safety and police departments. I'd like to share more and maybe we should send info in the upcoming newsletter.

02:08:40 R - Nate Knodt: Electric vehicle charging infrastructure and devices are essential to success of converting to electric vehicle use.

02:09:19 CSC - Dillon Delvo: Jeff, do Port Commissioners get any kind of training regarding the public health effect upon the people of Stockton? It seems that the commissioners have a strong business background. But our committee is made up of people who live in Boggs Tract and South Stockton. It's our families that are impacted. It's our life expectancies that are shorter. I just wonder if there's anyone that actually feels any real responsibility for that. If Port Commissioners don't feel that understanding the health impact is important to making decisions, why is the POS at this table?

02:09:37 Erica Manuel -- ILG: Quick time check or everyone. As discussed, this meeting will run about 15-20 minutes long to make sure we cover this item and get all the feedback necessary. If you can stay on the line, please do. Thank you!

02:10:19 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Glad we are taking out locomotives funding

02:10:32 R- Mary Elizabeth: Perhaps the Port Commission could also go through the UOP Board Development Program.

02:10:37 R - Nate Knodt: School buses do not operate nearly as many miles as transit buses and trucks. School buses sit still throughout much of each day and the districts and drivers are very good about turning off engines and not idling.

02:11:02 Skott Wall - CARB: CARB Public Presentation: Concepts For In-Use Locomotive Regulation
October 29-30, 9am-12pm each day - link follows

02:11:29 Skott Wall - CARB:
<https://content.govdelivery.com/accounts/CARB/bulletins/2a5e435>

02:11:53 R- Mary Elizabeth: Thank you Skott.

02:12:03 CSC - Dillon Delvo: I agree Nate. Since funding for desegregation stopped, school buses aren't operating at levels as high as before.

02:12:13 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Good point Dillon, it would be good to clarify the process of becoming a member of the Port Commission

02:13:05 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Yes, and the POS clearly needs to be more accountable to the community and public health. I was shocked to hear there's only 72 hours for important agenda items. I would have like to attend yesterday's meeting but already had things on my schedule.

02:13:21 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: *72 hour notice

02:14:00 R - Ned Leiba : Jamie, How do you quantify reduction in emissions in our project area and the health effects regarding the mobile source proposals? CARB has primary responsibility for statewide air quality effects from mobile sources. Given mixing from many mobile sources, I don't see how you can establish a strong connection for these mobile source emission reduction strategies and easurable benefits to our project area. Remember we are concerned with our project area. And these are very expensive proposals. Thanks.

02:15:51 R - Ned Leiba : My note above should read: "measurable" benefits.

02:16:18 Todd DeYoung - AD: hi Ned,

02:16:56 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Just to let folks know about the electric cars shared program, there are already ideas that SJCOG is looking at with the Sustainability Transportation Equity Program (STEP grant). We shall know from CARB hopefully soon if SJCOG got the grant

02:17:31 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: I am definitely not in favor of bonnet emission control.

02:17:44 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Fingers crossed, Jonathan. Thanks for the update.

02:17:45 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: At which future meeting will be able to solidify air monitor placement?

02:19:10 R - Glenabel Toreno: ^ Also wondering the same thing

02:19:10 Ryan Hayashi - AD: Robyn: We are planning to send out the latest draft of the monitoring plan based on all of the feedback that we have received and hope to be able to discuss at the November meeting.

02:19:47 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : We have already ordered the air monitors correct?

02:22:53 R - Bianca Mendoza: I would also like to know the answer to Dillion's question "do Port Commissioners get any kind of training regarding the public health effect upon the people of Stockton?" The community's health should be a top priority and topic of discussion in all decision making that the Port does.

02:23:48 CSC - Paige Tengeluk: ^^ Strongly agree

02:23:50 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I'd like more enforcement on the Trucks driving on Fresno Ave. Causing a huge dip in the roads which destroys Boggs tract resident's tires

02:23:55 R - Deby Provost: I agree with Bianca on that! Money is important, but we should ALWAYS consider health of residents first!!

02:24:35 R - Victoria Moreno: yes, indeed Jonathan. Thank you for bringing that up.

02:24:47 R - Nate Knodt: Enforcement on residential fireplaces and outdoor cooking may seem as an infringement on personal freedoms and cause a major backlash against air quality mitigation. More success may come from bigger projects that are public and commercial projects.

02:25:01 Todd DeYoung - AD: Hi Ned, We quantify emission benefits from each mobile source project by calculating the reductions in NOx, PM and VOCs from going from older, diesel technology to new, low or zero-emission technology and then multiplying those benefits over several years. Because diesel PM has been classified as a Toxic Air Contaminant, reducing emissions from these sources within the community has localized benefits in the form of reduced exposure. In addition, the reduction of NOx, which is a precursor to regional ozone formation provides benefit to the community and the entire region.

02:26:11 Erica Manuel -- ILG: it looks like Jeff had to drop off the line. We'll ask the AD to follow upon any additional questions not yet addressed in the chat.

02:27:12 R- Mary Elizabeth: yes, effects of trucks on roadways also impacts fugitive dust issues. Thank you Jonathan.

02:27:13 CSC - Dillon Delvo: We're not going to get answers from the Port. Jeff has left the meeting. It's disingenuous to be a part of this effort while their leaders are voting to expand the port and expand pollution.

02:27:18 Robyn DeGuzman - GOV: Thanks Erica, there is a lot of trauma associated with the effects of Port pollution among CSC members and it is important to be transparent and provide answers.

02:27:27 R - Bianca Mendoza: Hi Erica, will the answers be sent out by e-mail or addressed at the next meeting?

02:28:32 R - Nate Knodt: Auto use, transit use and infrastructure, pedestrian, bicycle riding, and green buffers-medians, must all be planned in an integrated way. Then the sum result will be cheaper, more efficient, and lead to a sum total that is greater than its individual parts.

02:28:53 CSC - Ed Ward: If we are transportation planning realistically, the benefits of bio mass fuels need to be discussed for IMMEDIATE reductions and relief. Why would this not be on the list

02:29:03 CSC - Paige Tengeluk: Bringing back Dillon's question: "do Port Commissioners get any kind of training regarding the public health effect upon the people of Stockton?" We heard from a resident

in the beginning of the meeting who expressed his concerns, but he wasn't given a direct answer or a possible solution.

02:29:12 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Yes, Ned, the plans need to be integrated so the measures complement each other and happen in the needed order. I don't want people on bikes on heavily congested roads that aren't safe. That doesn't help anyone.

02:29:23 R - Victoria Moreno: yes, it is Jonathan

02:30:02 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Ed: How is biomass helpful? DTE Stockton is the largest emitter of GHGs and has a negative effect on air pollution, just like the Fresno biomass plant.

02:30:16 R - Ned Leiba : I agree with Jonathan. We need to focus on funds that will help our community. Do not take AB 617 funds for other purposes where there is funding or enforcement from CARB and the SJVAPCD.

02:30:31 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: ^^ Agree

02:32:01 R- Mary Elizabeth: There is Student First buses that I have seen around town.

02:33:11 R - Nate Knodt: Some SUSD Special Services buses are contracted to private companies such as Service First. Most regularly scheduled school campus "Line Services" are all operated by Stockton Unified and they are District Employees. Yes Athletic and Field Trips are often contracted to private charter bus companies.

02:34:54 R - Ned Leiba : Willie - I agree with you. Enforcement has unintended consequences. We want to build a community, not tear it apart.

02:35:16 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: ++

02:35:27 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Can we put the language to where we provide incentives instead of penalties?

02:37:34 R - Nate Knodt: I agree with Willie, small businesses and café/deli operators that are Barb-be-que and grilling meals will be too difficult and too intrusive to enforce. Let us go for more public and commercial enterprises that are larger and with more resources to comply.

02:39:05 R - Nate Knodt: Jaime is a real trooper!

02:39:53 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I have a question

02:39:56 R - Nicholas Hatten: We need to set the standard and get community to understand impact. If there is no enforcement, we are stuck with the same situation we are in with mask. An unenforced mandate that means nothing. When people are dying due to poor air, there has to be community accountability for actions.

02:46:08 R- Mary Elizabeth: Thank you Nicholas! I agree.

02:49:09 R- Mary Elizabeth: Part of the problem is that the Port is private property so they avoid public complaints because folks cannot make observations to make complaints to CARB or AD.

02:49:33 R - Stacey Panyasee: I'd like to hear the answers to Dillon's questions at the next meeting.

02:50:04 R - Stacey Panyasee: Please do

02:50:07 R - Stacey Panyasee: thank you

02:50:09 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : Do the Port Commissioners even know about AB 617?

02:50:33 R- Mary Elizabeth: Yes, I have invited them to join when AB617 got started.

02:52:26 R - Nate Knodt: I agree with enforcement totally! Simply avoid too many for very small business and residential to avoid harmful backlash and overall public opinion. Thank you all!

02:53:05 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I'd like more language on partnerships with local community based orgs on outreach and other projects

02:55:01 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : We would need more meetings on that

02:55:54 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt : I'm good with that

02:59:26 Hanjro Ambrose @CARB: Woot

02:59:48 R - Stacey Panyasee: thanks everyone and happy happy birthday Jaime!

02:59:50 CSC - Dillon Delvo: My kids are wondering why am I singing to myself. Happy birthday Jaime!