

Meeting Highlights*

AB 617 South Central Fresno Community Steering Committee Meeting #23

July 8, 2020 5:30pm-7:30pm

Zoom Virtual Meeting

Action items for the Community Steering Committee:

- Contact the Air District if interested in being a community co-host for future meetings

Action items for San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District:

- Forward all notifications on the rulemaking process
- Bring an air filtration survey to a future meeting
- Add stipend updates and calendars to future standing meeting agendas
- Loop back with CARB incentive folks and provide more information on what additional opportunities may be available for efficient but non-electric buses.

Welcome and Introductions

Hanna Stelmakhovych, Facilitator, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Erica Manuel, Facilitator, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, Valley Air District

Eric Payne, Community Co-host

Hanna welcomed CSC participants, members of the public, Air District staff and CARB staff. She introduced herself and the ILG team and gave Zoom instructions. The facilitators provided Spanish translation instructions, Zoom controls and meeting etiquette. Ryan thanked everybody for attending and explained that the Air District is looking forward to everyone participating in this process and assisting with agenda development moving forward. Eric thanked the Air District staff for all their work to set up the meeting.

Question: Two agenda items I would like to add to this agenda are an update on the stipends and time to discuss calendars, specifically the dissemination of information regarding calendars for the different meetings.

Answer: Today's agenda includes a standing agenda item to hear updates from the partner agencies. We will cover some of the suggestions later. At the end of each meeting, we also ask participants to share suggestions for the future agenda items.

Regulatory Development and Discussion

Jessica Coria, Program Manager, Valley Air District

Arnaud Marjollet, Director of Permit Services, Valley Air District

Cassandra Lopina, Manager, Technology Assessment Section, CARB

Hanjiro Ambrose, Office of Community Air Protection, CARB

Jessica highlighted the ongoing work of the Air District, reviewed district rules for reducing emissions in South Central Fresno, the PM2.5 Plan review, BARCT review, and toxics assessment. Presentation highlights:

- The Air District has programs that have reduced emissions by over 90% since the 1980s.
- Mobile sources make up the majority of community air pollution emissions and health risks in the community.

- Rules require that technology be developed to meet the stringent limits in the rules.
- In 2018 a new PM2.5 Plan for Valley was adopted to further reduce emissions throughout the Valley, includes comprehensive mobile and stationary source measures.
- We have committed to launching the public process, adopting the rule amendments, and implementation, which were all identified in the PM2.5 Plan.
- Amendments made in 2019 to the wood burning fireplaces and heaters (4901), and regulatory and public engagement process currently in process for flares (4311), boilers, steam generators, and process heaters (4306 and 4320), internal combustion engines (4702), and under-fired charbroilers at commercial restaurants (4692).
- Let us know if you know of a restaurant that is getting smoke complaints or might be interested in participating in the Restaurant Charbroiler Technology Advancement Program.
- Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) is an air emission limit for existing sources and is maximum degree of reduction achievable taking into account environmental, energy, and economic impacts.
- AB 617 requires expedited BARCT and implementation for facilities subject to CARB's CAP and Trade program.
- Under AB 617, all districts are required to adopt a BARCT schedule and the District adopted theirs in December 2018.
- 109 facilities in our District are subject to Cap and Trade; you can look at them to determine which rules are applying to those 109 facilities.
- 19 rules of the 32 were already found to meet BARCT; 13 others are subject to review.
- By combining Rules 4409-4624, the District is not only meeting the schedule, but will be ahead of the schedule.
- The CSC will receive a notification about all upcoming workshops and the District will engage the public in order to receive comments about the BARCT analysis.
- Public participation is extremely important and the CSC will have the opportunity to provide feedback and comments. The District offered separate ad hoc or subcommittee to work with the CSC and to take feedback on the rule development participation.
- AB 2588 Air Toxics "hot spots" mandates quantifying and assessing health risks and notifying residents.
- The District is in the process of reassessing all facilities in the Valley and has expedited the reassessment for facilities located within the South Central Fresno boundary.
- The Valley Air District is the furthest along in the process in California.
- So far no facilities have been deemed a significant risk for this community and we are continuing to move forward.
- Community involvement is very important in all of these processes.

Question: Under Rule 4692, what is the measure of success during the COVID shutdown? How can this program be effective if there are multiple shutdowns and the restaurants can't afford to upgrade?

Answer: For charbroiling, that is a great question, but it's going to be something we need to work through. We are currently looking at emissions from commercial charbroiling and how to reduce

them because we have seen they are a large part of emissions inventory throughout the Valley. We are also working on better understanding the emissions inventory -how COVID has impacted the measurements. In 2018, we put a requirement in our rule that restaurants had to send in information about the types and amounts of meat cooked on underfired charbroilers. We have been able to use that survey data and update the inventory based on that information. Economic feasibility of those controls will be a big topic of conversation because they are expensive.

Question: Under AB 2588, you spoke about commenting on the project. At what point in your review process do you look at projects for the cumulative impact to the community?

Answer: It happens during the CEQA process that takes place prior to issuing the Authority to Construct Permit. The lead agency addresses comments on the health risk assessment and community impacts. Other agencies comment. The District can be the lead or the permitting agency during the CEQA process for a particular project.

Question: When thinking about the CEQA processing or facility risk assessments, my concern is that we're thinking per project and per facility. We know that 617 was allotted to South Central Fresno because we are already overburdened. How can we be proactive and not reactive with the City of Fresno as they try to continue the industrial development within the already overdeveloped area? There are projects in the pipeline that the city is using to continue attracting the Amazons and Ultas. What are we doing proactively besides reacting to CEQA comments? We live in a city that is trying to do the exact opposite of what we're trying to achieve.

Answer: We as a District are in discussions about all those development projects. We are a responsible agency, behind the lead agency. In the CERP, there are a lot of measures that are designed to improve the community at the very early stage, including in CEQA. We take this very seriously. The District took a very active role in engaging the City of Fresno using CERP measures to comment on the General Plan update. We just commented on a warehouse project and how they can reroute potential traffic. I am limited in my power to require the city to use these solutions but we do present them. We have authority over air quality and we use that authority as much as we can. We engage with the city to enhance those relationships and comment at the early stages of development and planning.

Question: I want to narrow our focus on the community at hand and not the rules across the entire Valley. Specifically, I want to focus on the facilities in South Fresno that we know are emitting more than their neighbor facilities. Are there any reviews or audits that have been undertaken related to the biomass incinerator or the glass manufacturing plant? Do the rules related to the petroleum storage tanks apply to the petroleum terminal in South Fresno?

Answer: On toxics, the glass manufacturing and biomass incinerator are both required to do source testing. The three components required for testing are arsenic, lead, and chromium. In addition, we came up with a list of 20 additional components to be tested to ensure that it's comprehensive. We asked the facility to expedite the source test. The process is as follows. We get the scope of those emissions, then the facility presents a plan on how they will reduce those emissions, then the facility will submit a report, then we will proceed with the assessment. We are currently working with Santa Fe Pacific Petroleum, and approved their plan. We are at the reporting stage for that effort. If you're asking whether Kinder Morgan or SFPP are subject to our part of the analysis, the answer is yes.

Question: The rules are not very strict because the level of contamination is very high. If we have so many stringent rules, why do we still have so much pollution?

Answer: The majority of air pollution we are seeing in the community come from mobile sources and CARB will be doing a presentation on regulatory efforts in regards to those sources.

Comment: On AB 2588, I hope they'll make extra considerations for the facilities that are currently complying with the District's rules. If you are going to increase the stringency, you should also make some economic considerations, especially for facilities similar to ours who have just put in equipment to meet stringent regulations.

Chat Question: I wonder if you can just remove the fireplace, without replacing with "clean burning" fireplace.

Chat Answer: You can remove your old wood burning stove without requiring a replacement.

Chat Comment: This process that is being described is NEW. All other projects that city has approved that have devastated South Central Fresno did not benefit from this type of intervention from the Air District. The Menu of RULE STRINGENCY. What options does it include?

Chat Answer: Here is the rule stringency pulldown and direct link to tool:

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/current-air-district-rules>

Hanjiro and Cassie presented on CARB rules updates and the AB 617 technology clearinghouse.

Presentation highlights:

- The CERP identified several statewide regulatory strategies that could be used to address the key emissions priorities of the community.
- CARB is currently tracking 14 programs that are reflected in the Fresno CERP.
- CARB has continued to take actions to develop key programs and achieve regulatory goals, such as the adoption of advanced clean truck regulations; these are part of a portfolio of measures we expect to deliver some improvements to emissions reductions.
- Heavy duty engines and emissions are a major concern identified by the community.
- The transportation refrigeration unit regulation will reduce the use of fossil power refrigeration on trucks that idle; heavy duty inspection and maintenance will try to identify non-compliant vehicles.
- Regarding light duty vehicles, there have been challenges, but we are working on cleaner passenger vehicle standards and advanced clean car standards.
- We will be holding workshops this fall on advanced clean car measures if you would like to stay informed about that process.
- CARB staff is developing a suite of options to reduce emissions from rail and locomotives.
- CARB is working to update the short-lived climate pollutants standards and bring those to the board.
- Final rules for CARB are sent to the EPA for approval or waiver, just like the final SIP rules on the District side.
- Final rules will be added to the rules tool.
- The Air District rules tool will be expanded to include CARB rules—this is a live tool that can be filtered by stringency, pollutant, rule type, etc.
- Every district has different words that they use for different rules. For that reason, we are expanding the technology so we can tag those different rules to ensure they are similar across the state, despite the naming convention.

- We are working to add limits to the rules to clearly convey what the limits are and what the rules are applicable to.

Question: Would this tool allow us to compare rules from district to district?

Answer: Right now it would be more of a manual comparison where you can search for a rule type; you can use the filter to see if there have been any amendments made. We want to make sure before we put all the information out there that we have the right approach.

Chat Question: These rules are already mandated by the SIPs. What additional attention (and most importantly) resources and enforcement will be added inside the CERP area?

Chat Answer: In the CERP, there are several measures that include enhanced enforcement of District Rules, which are being fully implemented, including additional inspections of facilities with emissions violations, enhanced enforcement of the wood burning heater curtailment regulation, fugitive dust at construction sites, and illegal burning. As part of the annual reporting process, we will also work with the AD to provide information on the status of each of the rules that are in the CERP.

Question: We will watch this website be developed with great interest, and it would be great to know whether or not we will eventually be able to compare these rules head to head. This idea of us hunting through rules of numerous air districts is crazy.

Answer: Absolutely—getting to that point is going to take some time, but we are doing our best to get there.

Chat Question: Trucks are very important to clean the air. But school buses can be 8 times more harmful than trucks. I'm in a rural district so electric buses don't have the range per charge that we need. What can be done for small rural school districts with older buses?

Chat Answer: There are several CARB funding opportunities for clean school buses. Here's a link: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/school-buses/funding-clean-school-buses>. School buses should be 100% compliant with Best Available Control Technology. If you know of some old dirty school buses, please contact CARB with some vehicle information like a license plate and report it here: https://ssl.arb.ca.gov/sslapp/truckstop/complaint_form.php

Chat Question: I have seen that page many times. Unfortunately, with the exception of the CEC and Carl Moyer (I thought Carl Moyer was tapped out) all of the grants apply to electric school buses only. The CEC grant provided just over 50% funding for alternative fuel buses. So is there anything that you can do to not punish small rural schools that can't use electric buses?

Chat Answer: We can certainly loop back with CARB incentive folks and provide you a bit more information on what additional opportunities may be available. Thanks.

Chat Comment: Everyone at the District talked a lot about the very strict rules to clean the air but I don't see a change. We need more urgent change.

Updates from Other Agency Partners

Andrew Benelli, City of Fresno

Braden Duran, Fresno Council of Governments (COG)

Brian Moore, CARB

Jaime Holt, Chief Communication Officer, Valley Air District

Agency Update Summary:

- Andrew briefly discussed plans for the truck study. The city will prepare an RFP and submit it to the CSC's truck re-routing subcommittee for comments. The city will need to receive all comments by Monday, August 17. They plan to issue the RFP and a proposed timeline to a wide range of consultants that have experience with truck routing. A separate subcommittee of people will review the RFP responses and short list the consultants. They will then conduct interviews with the top two or three firms. The city will make a selection and seek contract approval from city council. Then the consultant will begin the study. The city intends to have lots of community engagement. The city (or the selected consultant) may hire a sub-contracted consultant with specific experience with engagement and public meetings.
- Fresno COG has officially launched the 2022 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The development process will continue until mid-2022 at which time the COG will seek approval. The RTP is the policy guidance for transportation in Fresno for the next twenty years. The COG has launched a new website, planfresno.com, which will be the main source of information on public engagement related to RTP going forward. The COG welcomes any comments.
- Brian reported on an upcoming workshop on the transportation refrigeration unit regulation. CARB is in the process of updating the blueprint, which will be a two-step process. CARB hopes to receive public comments on the blueprint this summer.
- Jaime shared the School Air Filtration and School Bus Replacement Subcommittee updates and thanked members for participating in the kick off meeting. There is a need to better understand the inventory at various schools, site needs and the costs associated with improvements.

Chat Comment: I did an inventory of air conditioners in the West Fresno Region. Only 8% of our a/c units can handle a filter above MERV 2. I am under the impression that none of our units can handle MERV 14 filters. I don't know what AB 617 can do to help the #8 worst census area (according to the 2018 SB535 report) where our schools are located.

Chat Comment: The District is working on a paper survey and will share more questions about the air filtration in the following weeks.

Chat Question: Can the City of Fresno and CARB use the Fresno Rerouting Study to further identify Heavy Duty truck mobile sources? Can the Fresno Truck Study be used to identify idle truck routes for the best pollution and health effects? Can the City of Fresno Truck Study identify each level of further commercial development and related traffic impacts on receptors in area? Lastly can City of Fresno Truck Study identify what level of development would reach and exceed a level of unhealthy traffic and set a cap on the level of industrial development in area?

Vegetative Barriers Update

Mona Cummings, Tree Fresno (TF)

Mona presented on the Fresno Trees partnership and project. Presentation highlights:

- Tree Fresno is committed to transforming the San Joaquin Valley with trees, greenways, and beautiful landscapes.
- The organization has planted about 50,000 trees since 1985.

- In 2016, Sonoma Technology and TF came together to evaluate how well vegetative barriers, using trees and shrubs, protect people from exposure downwind of major roads.
- CARB approved TF project as a supplemental environmental project (SEP).
- Our SEP is called the Fresno Trees Project.
- Fresno Trees tasks Sonoma Technology with measuring air quality in areas with or without near road vegetation and tasks TF with planting more than 3,000 trees and model vegetation.
- Vegetative barriers can reduce particulate concentration levels downwind of major roads. As air passes through the barrier, the vegetation can filter or remove airborne particles and it can force traffic related pollution to flow up and over the barrier, lofting it higher into the air and giving it time to disperse.
- Fresno has between 5,000-18,000 heavy duty trucks traveling daily. Given the understanding of near road problems, TF will measure the pollution at locations within 150 meters of Fresno-area highways and adjacent to heavily traveled traffic ways.
- TF choose large canopy and hearty tree species that can withstand drought and have minimal maintenance.
- Suitable locations need to be approved by agencies in charge of those properties.
- A second vegetative barrier was completed in Fowler.
- A third project was completed at the convergence of Highway 99 and California Street in Fresno and required partnership with Caltrans.
- TF is excited about a new partnership with the Fresno Metro Black Chamber of Commerce, which was initiated to address climate change impacts that disproportionately impact disadvantaged communities of color, through a comprehensive community-led process.
- CARB has agreed to fund outreach, education and community engagement throughout this project.

Question: A Fresno resident asked for trees, but got declined because Tree Fresno didn't have funds. A resident does live in the qualified area.

Answer: Funds are targeted at specific locations, so it could be that the address didn't qualify. Please call back and talk to Mona. Tree Fresno can accommodate inquiries in Spanish language.

Question: At an Air District board meeting, I suggested looking at the Centennial projects through Caltrans in Bakersfield—what happened to that? Are you or have you looked at the Centennial project?

Answer: We have trees for free to give away through a grant from CalFire, so I haven't looked at that specific project, but I applaud it. Irrigation needs to be in place.

Question: What's the process for securing trees if you already have a project and committed funding?

Answer: It depends on the location and guaranteed irrigation. We do have funding to distribute trees, so please contact me directly.

Chat Question: Is the air quality testing being done by Fresno Trees available for our committee?

Chat Question: What about the trees that have been torn down? The stumps were left there and they look very ugly.

Chat Comment: Now that we know more about the opportunities with Tree Fresno, we will send an email to the committee to assess how we want to be involved! Tehipite Middle School is in the boundary, but we likely have other places where we want to place trees. Please think about those places.

Program Updates

Jessica Olsen, Program Manager, Valley Air District
Vernon Hughes, CARB

- SJVAPCD has an upcoming commitment to update CARB's board on the process of AB 617, so we are updating our website with a comprehensive tracker to help. We will send it out to this CSC and solicit feedback. The tool will track how far we've come and where we still have to go.
- CARB is continuing to work on the stipend issue. CARB is working to find the mechanism and process for issuing stipends and then identify the funding source. The funding mechanism being discussed is about a competitive bid contract or modifications to existing grants; this would only work if the grant has an existing stipend clause that can be modified.

Comment: The Air Districts in the Imperial Valley and the Bay Area provided stipend funding out of implementation funds. SJVAPCD can follow similar model.

Chat Comment: Well you shouldn't wait so long, all the other residents from other areas are already receiving it. We have been volunteers for a very long time and it's very unfair.

Chat Comment: I concur. Stipends are petty cash compared to the Air District budget. Furthermore, money is being saved now that our meetings are online.

Chat Question: CARB also committed to updating the AB 617 CAPP Blueprint by Fall of 2020. How can the CSC provide input to that process?

Chat Answer: The Blueprint will be updated with the Blueprint Advisory, which should be done before the end of this year, after an extensive community review process.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Hanna Stelmakhovych, Facilitator, Institute for Local Government (ILG)
Eric Payne, Community co-host

Hanna asked that committee members enter their name in the chat box or email the Air District to be a future community co-host. Also please continue to suggest future agenda items.

Ed Ward raised his Zoom hand and volunteered to be community co-host.

Eric thanked the CSC for participating in the call and the Air District staff in front of and behind the camera for coordinating the meeting.

Public Comment:

There were no public comments.

Reminders:

The next meeting is Wednesday, August 12 via Zoom. All the presentations, meetings highlights, transcripts and the Zoom meeting recording will be posted online.

**Refer to full meeting audio to review the complete details and comments from the meeting.*