

Stockton AB 617 CSC Meeting – Chat Transcript
Sept. 2, 2020 5-7 p.m.

00:40:24 Nicholas Hatten: Is participation optional?

00:41:34 Jaime Holt - AD: We encourage everyone to get to know one another, but if you do not want to go into a break out you don't have to.

00:41:44 AD- Jessica Olsen : optional, but highly encouraged!

00:42:52 Gene Fuss: Gene Fuss arrived late 5:13 pm

01:06:30 CSC-Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Nicely documented observations.

01:07:22 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I agree with Barbara!

01:07:43 CSC - Nicholas Hatten: This is where I live. One of the largest apt. communities with 200 units of families is in this area. Many multiple families living in studios and one bedrooms.

01:11:11 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Again, good documentation with facts. Nice work youth advocates.

01:11:56 CSC - Victoria Moreno: I live closed by here

01:12:12 CSC - Victoria Moreno: agree 100%

01:13:30 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: ++ Excellent data and presentation!

01:13:35 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Public and verifiable reporting would help the community monitor what happens with these industries -- even beyond monitors

01:13:52 CSC - Maria Cardenas: I live in boggs tract and we are surrounded by all of this

01:14:23 CSC - Victoria Moreno: yes, indeed Maria

01:15:25 CSC - Dillon Delvo : Yes Maria and Victoria. Your families deserve to have healthy living conditions.

01:15:42 GOV - Robyn DeGuzman : Healthy equity!

01:15:53 GOV - Robyn DeGuzman : *Health equity

01:17:53 CSC - Maria Cardenas: thanks Dillon

01:18:04 CSC - Jennifer Flores: do those numbers change depending on temperatures?

01:18:46 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: I live near McKinley and the high percentile of emissions is very concerning, given how nearby they are.

01:19:03 CSC - Gene Fuss: I expect it would. Also affecting it is wind direction and speed.

01:19:41 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Great research -- fact driven presentation.

01:20:14 CSC - Stacey Panyasee: I agree, as a resident, we need to monitor downwind of Port of Stockton

01:20:38 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: This is amazing! Thank you for engaging on community science

01:20:38 CSC - Deby Provost: These Ladies did a great job!!

01:20:43 Ryan Hayashi - AD: Great job Gloria and Glenabel!

01:20:56 CSC - Gene Fuss: The 'white smoke' is not smoke. it is mostly water vapor for DTL

01:20:57 GOV - Albert Rivas: great presentation

01:21:02 Ariana Hooks - AD: Great presentation, great job!

01:21:10 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Love hearing from the youth leaders from our community! Thank you Glenabel and Gloria!

01:21:20 CSC - Stacey Panyasee: Great presentation, Glenabel and Gloria!

01:21:33 CSC - Maria Cardenas: great presentation!!

01:22:12 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Gene -- good point. When this process starts, walking through where and how to research should be made available to the community. There is no way for the community to verify easily.

01:23:07 CSC - Gene Fuss: California Transportation Lines is a chemicals transport company. I will ask the company for what the white vapor is. May be water vapor, but need answer.

01:23:37 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: <https://oehha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen/report/calenviroscreen-30>

01:23:45 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: CalEnviroScreen 3.0 link

01:24:28 CSC- Gloria she/her: feel free to reach out to us - www.littlemanila.org

01:25:33 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Doug, the schools are listed on the presentation.

01:26:47 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Cannot hear Ed's question

01:29:59 CSC - Margo Praus: Glenabel & Gloria offered info on these sites. separate from our AB617 efforts, or in conjunction with AB617, might CARB or Valley Air look at these entities sooner to see if there are options to prevent pollution?

01:30:35 GOV - Albert Rivas: recommend we schedule mobile monitoring during high traffic times in morning and afternoon.

01:33:22 Jessica Olsen - AD: Thank you Glenabel and Gloria! We will certainly take everything we've heard here and address them throughout the process. For those interested in hearing more about the District's role in addressing the facilities presented during the co-host presentation, please join our workshop NEXT Wednesday, September 9 at 5pm

01:33:51 Jessica Olsen - AD: <http://community.valleyair.org/selected-communities/stockton/other-meetings/>

01:34:27 CSC - Deby Provost: What are the name of the Guidelines again?

01:36:08 CSC - Deby Provost: Got it! Thank you Todd!

01:36:40 CSC - Ed Ward : Gloria and Glenabel thank you for your hard work to develop this presentation

01:37:29 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Can you explain what liquidated means pleas

01:37:42 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: for those who don't know

01:43:07 CSC - Ned Leiba : Bang for the buck should be improvement in health not reduction in emissions per se. What specific, tangible, measurable health benefit can we expect for dollar spent. Consider classic public health cost benefits in terms of lower asthma in our AB 617 area,.

01:43:47 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Thinking about Glenabel and Gloria's presentation. They mentioned that 25% of children in the state have asthma. Is there a way to find out if that percentage is higher in our area? I suspect it is much higher. Do we have data from public health that can inform us on just how prevalent health issues can be in this area at this point in time. Considering we are just beginning this project wouldn't it be important to know exactly where the health data lies?

01:44:01 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Disagree -- otherwise it will all become indoor pollution projects and our outdoor air quality emissions will not be reduced.

01:44:27 CSC - Gene Fuss: Could one of the projects be installation of a CARB-quality air monitoring station in the BoggsTract area (just downwind of the port) to help drive Port emissions reductions over the next 5-10 years?

01:44:34 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Ultimately, the best way to improve health is to eliminate the source of pollution.

01:44:34 CSC - Ned Leiba : Asthma has increased dramatically while criteria air pollution has decreased. This is a big problem we should study and address.

01:45:32 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Air pollution has not decreased in the AB617 area, and with major Port projects on the horizon, HABs and potetntial tunnel construction, air pollution could worsen.

01:45:59 CSC- Gloria she/her: It's not the state. "about 1 in 4 children there[SJ Valley] have asthma"
<https://californiahealthline.org/news/dirty-air-and-disasters-sending-kids-to-the-er-for-asthma/#:~:text=Merced%20and%20Madera%20counties%2C%20also,to%20California%20Health%20Interview%20Survey.>

01:46:10 GOV - Christina Fugazi, Vice Mayor: Question

01:46:11 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Air pollution is not evenly distributed, so regional reduction does not mean a decrease in the most impacted communities - in fact with programs like cap and trade, research shows pollution is going up at those facilities.

01:46:22 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Thank you for clarifying Gloria.

01:47:35 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Asthma rates are just one measure of health - so that data would be valuable, in combination with multiple other factors, like they use in CalEnviroScreen...factors like cancer risk, toxics exposure, etc.

01:47:38 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Can't community based orgs be included in partners? I want that to be cleared

01:47:43 CSC - Deby Provost: How do I put up my hand??

01:48:07 Christal Lazard - CARB EJ (she/her): To raise your hand click on participants and the little blue hand

01:48:33 Jaime Holt - AD: Jonathan, yes...100%

01:49:20 Erica Manuel - ILG: if you're on your phone use *9 to raise your hand

01:49:48 GOV - Robyn DeGuzman : I believe that data re: asthma in youth exists at healthiersanjoaquin.org

01:49:58 CSC - Kenda Templeton: Thats a great question Christina. Obviously that has been our struggle at PUENTES.

01:50:34 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: If we work with the City of Stockton, we can get trees built inot the budget. We need Council Members to do their due diligence.

01:50:46 CSC - Tina Lau:Jonathan, my understanding is that a community based org could be a partner if they have a project that qualifies for funding (i.e. truck to convert to cleaner engine, clean energy infrastructure station, etc.)

01:51:15 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Would we be able to tap into already funding sources, say like Transformative Climate Communities? or would that be considered double dipping

01:52:32 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Deby, I will make sure your question will be answered

01:52:42 CSC - Deby Provost: Can't we leave tree care to the organization/person to whom it is given?

01:54:16 CSC - Deby Provost: Is there a way we can look at Shafter's and Fresno's what they spent their funding on? I haven't seen that.

01:54:34 Todd DeYoung - AD: Depending on the funding source, we may be able to leverage or stack funding for projects. We actually encourage that as long as we aren't double counting the air quality benefits. But short answer is yes.

01:55:50 CSC - Ned Leiba : I strongly support tree planting and urban greening. There seems to be good studies showing significant improvement in air pollution, and I believe there is some evidence of positive health effects. This should be an important part of our AB 617 plans

01:56:16 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Can you all distinguish between what is required by AB 617, and what is an optional measure? For example, aren't increased penalties and enforcement already required, so they should automatically go in the plan?

01:57:10 Christal Lazard - CARB EJ (she/her): @Deby you can see the measures and the amount of money (roughly) allocated in the Shafter tracker here:
<http://community.valleyair.org/media/1809/shafter-website-tracker.pdf>

01:57:25 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : I appreciated having the CERP strategy list so we could work more efficiently. (Do wish we would have received the list at least one day in advance.) I see lots of strategies around providing incentives. If the recipients are small businesses or individuals, I have no problem. However, I would not like major businesses that are known polluters to receive incentive money for something they should do anyway.

01:58:09 CSC - Ed Ward : I agree and support Ned's comments Regarding vegetative barriers

01:58:54 CSC - Dillon Delvo : I agree with vegetative barriers as well.

01:59:11 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Deby, check your email. I sent you the proposed CERPs from Fresno and Shafter

01:59:15 Erica Manuel - ILG: this list will be provided to everyone after the meeting with additional time to review it and provide feedback.

01:59:18 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Research shows that vegetative barriers should be combined with sound walls and advanced indoor air filtration to achieve maximum protections.

01:59:34 CSC - Tina Lau: vegetative barriers would be both good for air quality and beautification, which I think is also important for the community

01:59:52 Skott Wall - CARB: @Catherine - you are correct about enforcement and penalties. But the committee could prioritize enhanced enforcement measures for specific activities.

01:59:52 Ryan Hayashi - AD: Thanks Catherine, next week's meeting, we will be discussing the District and CARB enforcement programs and potential additional enforcement strategies based on the enforcement data that can be added as CERP measures based on feedback from the committee

02:00:32 CSC - Dillon Delvo : Will we be receiving a budget today, as stated in last month's meeting?

02:00:37 CSC - Mary Elizabeth : Why is the school bus replacement have such a high cost per ton?

02:00:54 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: I'm with you Noehmi ! I don't think receiving this list this morning was anywhere near a sufficient amount of time to go through and evaluate to prepare well enough for this meeting

02:02:03 CSC - Catherine Garoupa White: Thanks Ryan. I can't make the meeting next week but my alternate, Cynthia will be there so I will catch up with her after.

02:02:24 CSC - Maria Cardenas: yes please boggs tract is getting worse day by day.. please do something about the trucks :)

02:02:36 Todd DeYoung - AD: Mary, generally it is because they don't travel a lot of miles each year so the overall reductions are not huge. However, they are extremely important types of projects for reducing children's exposure to harmful emissions because when they are operating, they are impacting children.

02:02:38 CSC - Mary Elizabeth : Bike lanes are great but we need bike parking infrastructure to secure our bikes!

02:02:59 CSC - Ned Leiba : Dillon,
I believe Ryan Hayashi will be providing some information on budgets before the next meeting. And I hope we can hear from Kevin Hamilton about asthma studies and salutary measures in our AB 617 area. Is that correct Ryan?

02:03:07 GOV - Albert Rivas: why does heavy duty mobile source incentive stop at \$14,000? does that go far enough?

02:03:15 CSC - Tina Lau: Mary Elizabeth, such a great point!

02:03:36 GOV - Robyn DeGuzman : Where does incentive money go?

02:04:15 Todd DeYoung - AD: We understand that receiving this list this evening is not nearly enough time to digest all of this information. However, this is really just the beginning and these measures will be discussed at length at future meetings.

02:04:15 GOV - Albert Rivas: what's the maximum allocation amounts for major categories?

02:06:59 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Thank you Gene!

02:07:51 CSC - Ned Leiba : Very good idea for upgraded air monitoring trailer at Boggs Tract! Very, very good! Thank you. Washington is the School.

02:08:18 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Thank you Gene! Thank you!

02:09:11 CSC - Ed Ward : This is so helpful... these strategies took Fresno 6 or more meetings top develop. Starting at this point gives us an opportunity to adjust our concerns and really develop the best solutions

02:10:52 CSC - Dillon Delvo : Residents are reporting that there are still many trucks using the path next to Washington School.

02:11:21 CSC - Maria Cardenas: Trucks all over boggs tract!!

02:11:39 GOV - Ann Rogan - Mayor's Office: Question for AD team - what's current thinking relative to when CERP measures are finalized?

02:12:14 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: The Committee needs to remember that the Port has major projects coming that will increase truck traffic -- even if the Delta tunnel is not built. We need to plan for a strong monitoring system at the Port for a good future.

02:12:29 CSC - Stacey Panyasee: Can we get a budget, I thought we were going to discuss this today? The budget would be helpful with prioritization of projects.

02:13:07 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Since we live (and work) in such a highly polluted area, could we require that large business place monitors at their sites so we could have real data rather than self-reported data?

02:14:15 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : HEre is the entire chat thread:

02:14:17 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : From CSC-Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent to Everyone: 05:38 PM
Nicely documented observations.
From CSC - Jonathan Pruitt to Everyone: 05:39 PM
I agree with Barbara!
From CSC - Nicholas Hatten to Everyone: 05:40 PM
This is where I live. One of the largest apt. communities with 200 units of families is in this area. Many multiple families living in studios and one bedrooms.
From CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent to Everyone: 05:43 PM
Again, good documentation with facts. Nice work youth advocates.
From CSC - Victoria Moreno to Everyone: 05:44 PM
I live closed by here
agree 100%
From CSC - Catherine Garoupa White to Everyone: 05:45 PM
++ Excellent data and presentation!
From CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent to Everyone: 05:46 PM
Public and verifiable reporting would help the community monitor what happens with these industries -- even beyond monitors
From CSC - Maria Cardenas to Everyone: 05:46 PM
I live in boggs tract and we are surrounded by all of this
From CSC

02:16:31 CSC - Ed Ward : It might be good to have someone from CPUC speak to our committee. They have some new regulations regarding how ships doc requiring electrical.

02:16:42 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I would like all the chats to be placed on the website so people could see the transcripts please

02:17:01 Kim Danko - ILG: Hi, Jonathan. Moving forward, we are posting the chat logs with the meeting summaries

02:17:34 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Kim, could we post the past meeting chats?

02:17:43 Jaime Holt - AD: Jonathan, we are working on getting these up. We had some Zoomie issue, but yes, that is the goal.

02:18:05 CSC - Margo Praus: The Measures re the Port all relate to mobile equipment. Some consideration needs to be given to the product pollutants from the businesses at the Port is very important. Research into how the Port can better control the toxins spewing into the environment.

02:18:20 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: I think trees with an addition of sound barriers would be more beneficial than just vegetative barriers alone

02:18:35 Ryan Hayashi - AD: Hi Jonathan, we will look to get the past meeting minutes up by the beginning of next week.

02:18:36 CSC - Maria Cardenas: C.1 is it also speaking on outside cooking that the homeless use to cook their foods? because my mom's house almost caught on fire literally a day after our last meeting? this is a problem in boggs tract

02:19:03 CSC - Glenabel (they/she): I agree. I think chats should be kept, there's a lot important and valuable information shared and should definitely be considered.

02:19:16 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I'd like to make it clear that residents and ej advocates put a lot of focus on enforcement/regulation measures on the Port. I would like that to be placed on the air measure

02:19:18 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Whether it is monitoring or projects, the group needs to understand that the Port has several expansion projects that will increase truck traffic. That is before Delta tunnel construction. Projects that will clean up the Port and handle train and truck track will help the community. So please everyone keep your eyes on what will meet future needs -- not just today.

02:19:26 Paige Tengeluk: I think it's necessary for community based orgs to be partners because their work with low-income, communities of color who are often shut out of similar mtgs. (Important meetings where decisions made have and continue disproportionately affecting them.)

02:19:45 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: It's important to include exactly what the resident want in the CERP as said in the chats

02:20:04 CSC - Mary Elizabeth : Cottonseed stockpile project has an open area I recall on the east side that can be used for vegetation. Perhaps the Port needs to have an inventory of areas that can support vegetation.

02:20:10 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: In my opinion we should focus more on enforcement/ regulation with the port of Stockton rather than giving them incentives.

02:20:16 CSC - Tina Lau: Is there a measure about supporting community education on vocations associated with clean tech?

02:20:40 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: Do we get to decide where incentive money goes towards?

02:20:40 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Yes, thanks for including truck rerouting. I want to ask that we look at rerouting the Boggs Tract area AND the Charter Way and El Dorado corridor.

02:21:22 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : Yes, Bianca. I agree. We asked for enforcement at the port but how can we enforce if they are free to self-report their own emissions data?

02:21:25 Jessica Olsen - AD: @ Tina. Measure TP.5 is educational training for electric vehicle mechanics

02:21:31 CSC - Ned Leiba : On your spreadsheet of draft strategies, we need to know what the expected, projected health benefit will be per dollar spent. To say a reduction in PM2.5 from 30 to 15 micrograms has some benefit avoids the fundamental question: what is the health benefit? At those low levels, it is extremely difficult to show any health benefit. Meanwhile we have a terrible costly problem with childhood asthma in our area, and that may be related to outdoor and indoor pollution. Let's do something meaningful.

02:22:19 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: I want to make sure AD and CARB staff are going to be available for additional questions after 7:00 pm

02:22:29 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: please

02:22:32 Christal Lazard - CARB EJ (she/her): @Bianca the CSC will be asked to prioritize the measures and how much of the budget will go into each category.

02:22:38 Jaime Holt - AD: YEs Jonathan

02:22:41 Trish Johnson - CARB: CARB will be available!

02:22:53 CSC - Deby Provost: Can we please see what Shafter & Fresno did on their spreadsheets, just in case we are missing something that might work for us??

02:22:59 CSC - Barbara Barrigan Alternate Mariah absent: Thank you CARB!

02:23:03 Jessica Olsen - AD: @Jonathan yes, us, too!

02:23:05 CSC - Bianca Mendoza: I saw air filtrations for school can we also add for households in the area as well.

02:23:13 Heather Heinks - AD: Comment from Facebook:

02:23:18 Heather Heinks - AD: Richard D. Iyall
My friend wants to know how many students have portable air monitors and what kind. She says that TemTop air monitors are good. Thank you.

02:23:44 CSC - Nicholas Hatten: received

02:23:54 Christal Lazard - CARB EJ (she/her): @Deby check out the Shafter tracker here <http://community.valleyair.org/media/1809/shafter-website-tracker.pdf>

02:24:35 Christal Lazard - CARB EJ (she/her): @Deby and the Fresno tracker here <http://community.valleyair.org/media/1818/fresno-website-tracker.pdf>

02:25:03 CSC - Mary Elizabeth : I had a question about the CARB monitoring lease - how much money is associated with the lease?

02:25:06 Jessica Olsen - AD: If interested, please attend the webinar next Wednesday, September 9, 5pm to hear more specifics about the regulatory and enforcement efforts from CARB and the District.

02:25:29 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Those who have hands raised, please stay on! And do we have any residents who would like to co-host?

02:25:47 CSC - Gene Fuss: PurpleAir.com individual-purchaseable PM2.5 air monitors have been found to correlate well with CARB PM2.5 readings

02:26:46 CSC - Jonathan Pruitt: Can we ask if we have any residents that would like to Co-Host?

02:27:50 CSC - Noehmi Jauregui : I appreciate that names were changed to reflect who is on the CSC but I believe it is MORE important to know who is a resident. If we are going to change names on Zoom, please include the R for residents.

02:28:21 Jessica Olsen - AD: Thank you Noehmi, we agree! we will make that change