

Meeting Highlights*

AB 617 Stockton Community Steering Committee Meeting #5

July 1, 2020 5-7 p.m.

Virtual Zoom Meeting

Action items for the Stockton Community Steering Committee:

- Email the Air District if interested in being a community co-host for a future meeting

Action items for San Joaquin Valley Pollution Control Air District:

- Bring to a future meeting any specific information about what types of monitors are available/being used and how many
- Post and share website information about fireworks and PM levels
- Consider updating the CSC roster and sharing with the group to help members connect and engage with each other despite COVID
- Before the next meeting, provide the CSC with information and/or a proposal about the cluster groups on the map reflecting feedback from the breakout groups
- Add truck routes and more information about where they are allowed to be to the agenda for the next meeting
- Add Future CARB monitor to the discussion agenda next month

Welcome and Introductions

Hanna Stelmakhovich, Institute for Local Government (ILG)

Ryan Hayashi, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

Espe Vielma, Community Co-host

Hanna welcomed the Stockton CSC participants, went over Zoom instructions for participation, and thanked everyone for attending. Erica Manuel, CEO of ILG, handled the roll call. Ryan then thanked the attendees for participating in this important process and thanked Espe Vielma for volunteering to be the community co-host for the evening. Espe introduced herself, explained her role, and welcomed the community.

Introduction to Community Air Monitoring Exercise

Jessica Olsen, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

Jessica explained that one of the two main components of the AB 617 program is to develop an air monitoring network, which will be part of a larger plan related to how the District is going to monitor on a community-wide scale. To begin this process, the District developed an exercise that builds on concerns already heard from the community. Presentation highlights:

- Every map has a breakout of sub-communities or community zones to help members envision different parts of the community
- The first map shows all the schools, medical facilities, and care facilities. The map has some wind direction information on it. The main wind direction is North West to South East, so pollution would likely travel in that direction
- The next three maps are a repeat of what was discussed at the last CSC meeting -- NOx, PM2.5, Diesel PM, and VOC emissions -- but this time the community zones are overlaid
- This is based on the inventory from all sources
- The next three maps show health indicators; the maps depict how the area ranks for asthma, cardiovascular disease, and low birth weight, based on the CalEnviroScreen tool
- The primary goal of the breakout groups is to look at the maps, talk amongst your groups, and start mapping monitoring suggestions with the help of the group facilitator

Hanna (facilitator) opened the discussion up for questions.

Chat Question: What is the potential future CARB monitor about on the first map?

Chat Answer: The first map depicts the potential future location of the CARB air monitoring station due to the demolition of the building where it is currently situated.

Chat Question: I am wondering why CARB decided to move it to that location, in NE part of the map.

Chat Answer: The location was chosen for several reasons, which include available power, site security, site access, in addition to several other factors.

Chat Question: I know that one of our buildings is getting demolished and rebuilt next door where the current monitor is. I know it is a trailer—does the community have input on the new location?

Chat Question: I saw the agenda and I hear you about placing the monitors, but HOW MANY monitors are we placing and what kind of monitors are they? What do they test?

Chat Question: How was the data collected? How were the zones divided (A-G)?

Chat Answer: The inventory is developed by collecting information from various facilities and models. This was based on 2018 data. The inventory development presentation from last meeting might help explain more. Located here:

http://community.valleyair.org/media/1710/final_tech-assessment-stationary-source-inventory-2020-06-03.pdf.

Chat Question: Is the future monitor something we can discuss further?

Chat Question: Are these updated current emission levels?

Chat Question: Moving the CARB air monitor to the North seems like a step backward since its current location is very close to the Crosstown Freeway. From what I understand, the CARB monitor is in a trailer. Why can't it be kept at the SJ Public Health facilities?

Chat Answer: We can definitely fill the gap if CARB decides to move that air monitor by placing a monitor nearby the old CARB monitor location. This will allow the committee (should you decide) to still have monitoring in that region. Let your facilitator know!

Chat Question: Is smoke always a good indicator of pollution? Because most of the map shows the most pollution at the Crosstown Freeway.

Chat Answer: Smoke is one indicator. You are correct in that the freeway is one of the largest sources, mostly due to heavy duty truck emissions.

Question: If we're talking about placing monitors, I'm wondering how many monitors and what kinds of monitors are they? How many of each kind do we have so we can have a more productive meeting and how is that determined? What is the budget we're working with? Are these donated to the state or this project? Do we have funding? I didn't see any data here about ozone. I am wondering what the priorities are?

Answer: We have a budget and we want to build where and what type of monitors based on the committee's feedback. The last time we did this, we kind of did it the other way around and it doesn't necessarily line up with what the committee is interested in. So today, the feedback we want is not just monitors placed, but if you can tell us where to place it and because of what concerns. That will help us develop what type of monitor will fit best there.

In terms of funding, we certainly have the funding for monitors big and small. The goal is to have the most refined, regulatory-grade monitors. No matter what comes of this, we will then develop our recommendations based on your specific locations and feedback and then we will come back to the committee with all of those specifics.

To your last point, we focused here on direct emissions, so things that we measure directly from a source --NOx, PM2.5, diesel PMs, VOCs -- those all have the ability to form ozone, so we didn't talk about ozone in particular, but what things form ozone. The easiest way to think about it is we are measuring stuff that comes out of a tail pipe, comes out of a smoke stack, comes off of a barbecue and ozone is not one of those things. Ozone has to be formed by those things. So we control those things by having an emissions reduction program and that would then limit the formation of ozone hopefully down the line.

Hanna (facilitator) gave thorough breakout group instructions for the CSC then handed off to Espe for any community co-host remarks.

Espe:

- You all are like captains and stewards of your communities, which is why you're on this committee
- The input you can provide is specifically where (in terms of the location) those direct emissions are coming from
- Focus on sharing where you have seen these potential emissions and staff will guide the mapping process
- For example, if you go down South El Dorado, there's a lot of smoke from a charbroiler, and that could be a location where a monitor could be. That is the type of input we need from you all
- Don't worry about all the other details, like the budget

Community Air Monitoring Exercise (Breakout Groups)

Participants were moved into five virtual breakout groups to discuss community air monitoring.

Breakout Group Debrief

Hanna (facilitator) asked the breakout groups to report back on their discussions.

Maps that had been updated in real time during the breakout groups were posted on the screen for everyone to see.

Group 1:

- Multiple people identified the Port and particularly Boggs Tract and Washington Elementary.
- Lots of people identified the cross town freeway, the Little Manila neighborhood, as well as in the southern border, especially public housing like Sierra Vista and Conway Homes.
- There was a concern that CalEnviroScreen data was from 2011 and 2013 and it might be much darker now given the passage of time.
- Some people noted concerns around I-5 and Charter Way as well.

Group 2:

- The Port and Washington School were a big focus of the discussion.
- Martin Luther King Boulevard along Charter Way to the west of I-5 is of interest because there's a lot of truck traffic on Highway 4 going east onto I-5.
- Charter Way near the fairgrounds has a lot of industry.
- Air monitoring as close to the airport, south of our area, but near the community center.
- Along I-5 South where Taylor School is and Conway Homes.
- El Dorado, where Espe took a video, has a lot of diesel trucks.

Group 3:

- The group identified everything from truck travel, ship travel, airplane travel, and more because there are lots of emissions in the area.
- Areas in section C and the middle section A and B.
- We have to have a safe place with electricity in order to have a monitoring site there.
- The group expressed some concerns about how the emissions maps were developed.

Group 4:

- The group began by exploring how to get a broad overview of the area for stationary monitors.
- Most pollution is pushing from the south, so we have to get coverage going from east to west; they looked at D and G quite a bit.
- They wanted to look at a differential; the hospital was an example as well as Cesar Chavez library.
- They found that there are quite a few school locations that could be secure sites and could be prime areas.

District:

- Lots of overlap with some of the challenges being seen at both Boggs Tract and Conway Homes, which is why a few locations were placed right on the south boundary.
- The Sierra Vista area with its railroad and truck traffic and the intersection of 99 and Highway 4 are all on the District radar.

Group 5:

- The group went through the whole map because the group had members that lived in different parts of the city.
- They began in A with I-5 and some possible fabrication north of the deep water channel. Definitely concerned about areas around Rough and Ready Island, Boggs Tract, and Washington Street. Some people mentioned Fresno Avenue to get into the Port area.
- Many are concerned with odors and dust so the group looked at East Main and Mariposa Road because there's a lot of truck traffic using that area as a bypass. They also discussed the Crosstown Freeway around 99, because there's a lot of backup and traffic there.

Espe:

- All of the groups had very robust discussions and were able to take deep dives into the areas.

- The community members are very familiar with the areas and the truck routes, fly-over zones, odors, cargo feed areas, etc.
- I'm excited that the blue dots can turn into an actual device that can help give us the data that we need and the kind of changes we want to move forward.

Jessica Olsen with the District:

- I took the map and designed cluster groups that represent a lot of the feedback we've received.
- The air monitoring team can really hone in on these clusters.
- Our plan is to take these specific comments and determine what types of monitoring we need. Before the next meeting, we will come back with a proposal based on these clusters.

Jaime Holt with the District: We socially distanced last Thursday and met in Stockton with several of you. We learned a little bit about the community and did some videotaping to put together a virtual tour. Thanks to all the people who took time out of their schedules to stand in the sun with us. Special shout out to Jonathan, who helped organize it. It will help educate our Air District team because we are not as familiar with this area and we want to better understand the issues and do as much as we can despite COVID.

Comment: Because of COVID, as a steering committee, we really aren't getting to know each other. Can the Air District update the roster and possibly add photos so we can know more about the participants and get to know each other even though we're only meeting once a month via Zoom?

Comment: I hope that at some point as we're going through this process that there's going to be an opportunity to have more education about how our stakeholders can get involved in reviewing projects and making comments. Our elected officials continue to approve projects that are adding to the air pollutants in our area. We need a next step nexus so we can have more activists involved in this issue.

Comment: In our small group, we talked about truck routes and getting more information about them and where they are allowed to be. I would like that in the next meeting.

Comment: In this meeting we did not have non-CSC members. How do the residents and CSC feel about having the public go on through Facebook?

Response: I think it's great to have the public involved as listeners. They can provide feedback to you guys that we haven't thought about.

Response: The St. George area is also my church and I represent many students who are residents. The breakout sessions were much more meaningful this time because we didn't have ten more participants in the group who were not actively participating.

Comment: I appreciated the swiftness of how the meeting was managed. The only place there was a little bit of a delay was the roll call. Can we make that section faster in the agenda in the future?

Question: How does everyone feel about fireworks coming out? I know there can be a lot of smoke and I wonder if the Air District will be able to monitor the atmosphere during the time of fireworks and fire crackers and illegal fire. Can we talk about it the following month if it happens?

Answer: I saw that Councilmember Fugazi just mentioned that Stockton is not doing fireworks this year, so that's good. We are very concerned about personal fireworks and their impact this year. We do think if you have health issues, your best bet is to be inside. We typically see a spike in our PM levels about 10 p.m. on July 4 and it stays up there until about midnight. While we can't outlaw fireworks, we do very much recommend that folks limit firework use and you can go to our website and see what the quality is like in your neighborhood.

Question: Fireworks have been happening in our area for two weeks already and it's hard on the animals. I would hope that in the next meeting we take 5-10 minutes for the whole group. I would like more information about the future CARB monitor. I think there are a lot of questions about the location that's being recommended.

Answer: I can briefly start to answer your question. The site is being closed and we have a search that we do to try to find a site that will accommodate the security and all the things you've become aware of. As we try to find a long-term lease, the site that is being proposed right now is the most viable site we were able to come up with at this point.

Comment: That's one of the cleanest areas in town--it kind of defeats the purpose in most of our minds.

Comment: I would like more information about the monitors; what type we will be getting and how many.

Chat Question: Why couldn't we put every type of monitor in every one of those sections?

Chat Question: How do we account for indoor pollution sources—smoking, dust, molds, BBQ? Are they in the same order of magnitude of external for resident's exposure? If so, we should spot monitor them too.

Wrap Up/Next Steps

Hanna: Our next community co-host is Douglas. If you are interested in being a future co-host, please type in the chat box to let us know. We would like to say thank you to Espe for being our community co-host this month. She took extra time to prepare for this meeting and to work with us. Much appreciated.

Espe: Thank you to everyone for your participation. Our input as community members is very important, so we can have input about what is taking place, what affects our air quality, our quality of life, and our health. For the commitment that you all have to this process, I applaud all of you. I think it is great to have such high interest across all of our geographic areas here in Stockton.

Hanna: The next meeting is August 5 via Zoom. All the presentations, meetings highlights, transcripts and the Zoom meeting recording will be posted online.

Public Comment

There were no public comments via Facebook Live.

**Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.*