

South Central Fresno

AB 617 Community Steering Committee Meeting #21

May 13, 2020 – 5:30 pm - 7:30 pm
Zoom Virtual Meeting

Action items for South Central Fresno Community Steering Committee:

- Please share suggestions about future agenda items with the Valley Air District.
- Please share suggestions and ideas about committee member outreach and recruitment with the Valley Air District.
- Start thinking about the list of problematic areas associated with truck traffic routes and help come up with the solutions.
- Sign up for the Fresno Energy Program (by September) by visiting www.fresnoenergyprogram.com
- Please spread the word about the Fresno Energy Program via social media, word of mouth, and via referrals (receive \$20 bonus for referral).
- If anybody needs Lupe's number to file smoke reports, you can request the number to be able to call direct.

Action items for the Valley Air District:

- Look into the Heavy Duty Truck Rerouting Study subcommittee and the composition of the Study consultant selection committee.
- Post the schedule of future meetings online and share a hard copy with members when requested.
- Post online meeting materials in advance and share hard copies with those who need them in advance.
- Continue to find ways for the Spanish-speaking participants to follow and view presentation materials during Zoom meetings most effectively.
- Connect Isabel Vargas with the appropriate agency (so she can report a vehicle in her neighborhood that has been emitting high levels of pollution).
- As feasible, circle back with Ed Ward about the history of air toxics reductions AB2588.
- Connect with Kimberly McCoy, who volunteered to be the co-host for the June meeting.

Welcome and Introductions

Christal Love-Lazard, Facilitator, Institute for Local Government

Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (Valley Air District)

Janet Gardner, Community Co-host

Christal welcomed the South Central Fresno Community Steering Committee (CSC) members and the public, provided Zoom and translation instructions, reminded participants that the meeting was being recorded and live streamed, and went over the agenda items. She announced that the CSC will discuss future agenda items at the end of this, and all future meetings.

Ryan welcomed participants and thanked them for being flexible as the Valley Air District and the CSC move forward with the implementation of the Community Emission Reduction Program (CERP) during Covid-19.

Janet thanked everyone for staying focused on improving air quality and relationships.

Comment: Please send the hard copy of the meeting schedules in advance as well as hard copies of materials and presentations a day or two in advance.

California Air Resources Board (CARB) Hearing Resolution Discussion of CARB's final resolution from February 13, 2020 CERP adoption hearing and next steps

Vernon Hughes, CARB

Vernon shared that the CARB hearing resolution is posted on the website:

<http://community.valleyair.org/selected-communities/south-central-fresno/steering-committee-documents/> The resolution that went to the CARB Board hearing on February 13 included staff recommendations. The CARB Board passed it with edits and modifications following the Board discussion on February 13, 2020.

Question: CARB passed several resolutions on February 13. What is the timeline for rules and regulations? Does CARB have any recommendations on where the CSC should start?

Answer: It is up to the CSC and the Valley Air District to identify the implementation priorities.

Question: What are the edits and modifications?

Answer: Some high-level changes include a truck routing study, MOU with the City of Fresno on stationary sources review, reporting timeline and format.

Question: Could you go into more detail on the resolution since it has been several months? I hope that we will spend more time talking about truck rerouting, freight handbook, rules and regulations (to address community concerns, for example. idling), reporting and the role of the CSC in the reporting process.

Answer: The Valley Air District will provide more updates in the next meetings about these and other topics if there is an interest.

Heavy Duty Truck Rerouting Study Update

Scott Mozier, Public Works Director, City of Fresno

Scott provided an update on the Valley Air District and City of Fresno (City) coordination on the CERP measure to conduct a heavy-duty truck rerouting study (study) in the AB 617 community. Christal asked the participants to hold their questions until the end. Presentation highlights:

- Heavy-duty truck rerouting is a high priority for the community, as identified during the AB 617 process and previous city work. The adopted CERP provides an opportunity to implement related measures. The goal is to reroute trucks from specific corridors, especially around vulnerable populations.
- Established in 2005, the city ordinance regulates current heavy-duty truck routes. The process of changing heavy-duty truck routes includes a study preparation, environmental assessment, map development and ordinance change.
- The City will manage the study and its elements: community engagement, traffic counts (an in-kind service provided by the City), the preview of existing road conditions, changes to truck routes and CEQA analysis.
- The next steps are to finalize the funding plan (the consultant cost and project management require additional funding), prepare collaborative agreements, select consultants, engage the community and prepare the study.

Chat Question: La presentacion sera en ingles solamente,?

Chat Answer: la presentacion en la pantalla esta en ingles, pero esta disponible en linea

<http://community.valleyair.org/selected-communities/south-central-fresno/steering-committee-meetings/>

Chat Comment: For future meetings, Spanish residents need to be told to get the Spanish materials ahead of time not on the spot. As it is, we are struggling to get everyone to know how to operate this platform, let alone open a different tab to see the Spanish documents.

Chat Answer: Very good point. We will make sure to get those materials to them in advance.

Chat Comment: Por favor si para la proxima lo publican en espanol.

Chat Answer: Para la proxima reunion voy a proporcionar los documentos en espanol antes de tiempo

Question: What is the implementation timeline?

Answer: It will take several months for the cooperative agreement between the City and the Valley Air District, about three months to select a consultant (in the meantime, the City can start to conduct traffic studies) and about 10-12 months for engagement, the study, and ordinance change.

Question: What is the timeline for the collaborative agreement? Who will start the process, the City or the Valley Air District?

Answer: The City will look to the Valley Air District for the collaborative agreement. The City is eager to get started.

Answer: The Valley Air District hears that this is a priority for the committee. A series of conversations with the City already took place. The Valley Air District will try to move forward as quickly as possible.

Question: Thank you for keeping this issue moving. The community is frustrated because of all the pain and suffering of our people. Systemic discrimination and design made our neighborhoods more polluted. More people are dying of asthma. Why does this truck rerouting presentation not acknowledge that?

Answer: This perspective is incredibly important. In the upcoming community engagement process for the rerouting study, there will be an opportunity to share and address these critically important issues.

Comment: As we proceed with the study, we need to add a social/environmental justice angle, discussion about community health information, and impacts of road sharing with residents and pedestrians.

Question: What is the total cost of the study? Will the number of trucks change post COVID-19? Will the committee have input on the consultant firm selection and their service agreement to ensure that community needs will be addressed in this process? What about the Environmental Impact Report and the relinquishment of H Street? Will that be included in the study?

Answer: The cost will vary between \$200,000 - \$300,000 based on the study components. The higher cost comes with tradeoffs. We can be creative in utilizing existing data from the City's Active Transportation Plan that already provides sidewalk analysis. During a shelter-in-place, we see a 40% decrease in passenger traffic and a 10% decrease in commercial traffic. Future numbers will depend on various factors. The City and the Valley Air District have not discussed the composition of the consultant selection committee. We can have a conversation about that. The timeframe for the Environmental Impact Report has not been released. The study will note the Environmental Impact Report and H Street closure project.

Question: What is the City's plan for authentic community engagement? Will the City be holding virtual meetings if there is a second outbreak of COVID-19?

Answer: Community engagement is a major component of the study. The idea is to do something similar to AB 617 and South Central Fresno engagement with targeted outreach, translation,

materials, etc.

Question: Are you engaging the Councilmembers representing the areas of the study?

Answer: Yes, we will include Councilmembers and their chief of staff.

Chat Question: What factors will determine the recommendations for changing the truck routes?

Chat Question: What funding is available for the potential sources of study in addition to AB 617?

Chat Comment: I agree. Public health data needs to be included in determining how changes are prioritized.

Comment: Can the Valley Air District send out the interest form after this meeting to determine who would like to be on this subcommittee.

Chat comments: I agree. A subcommittee is needed.

Answer: The Valley Air District is supportive of a subcommittee and can look into it.

Verbally and via the chat box, the CSC members suggested spending more time discussing the study. They also suggested building in more time for dialog in future meeting agendas. The Air District committed to ensuring a better meeting balance between 'informational' presentations and CSC discussions. The facilitator asked the group to decide whether they preferred to move onto the next agenda items presented by the Valley Air District or postpone them until a future meeting. The CSC members voted to postpone the Air Monitoring Update and Incentives Update items.

Question: Will the CSC be able to participate in the consultant interviews and have a say in the selection?

Answer: The City has not discussed the consultant selection process or various aspects of the process, such as funding, cooperation agreement process, etc.

Chat Comment: I think CSC members should participate in the RFP process.

Chat Comment: Yes, Steering Committee members should be given the right to participate in that committee.

Chat Comment: The scope and process discussion needs to happen. It needs to be directed by the CSC members and residents. The City and the Valley Air District should not be having private conversations about cost, scope and process.

Chat Answer: We appreciate the concern that "The City and The Valley Air District should not be having private conversations about cost, scope and process." However, the two agencies need to prepare and obtain respective Board approvals for a cooperative agreement between the agencies. Working consistently with the expressed desires of the Steering Committee, the agencies need to work out agreement language and have the respective legal counsel's review.

Question: The traffic count study needs to be transparent. Since the City funds it, how do we ensure the accuracy and impartiality of the results? Why is the City and not a consultant doing traffic counts? I was told that the cost of the study would be closer to \$500,000.

Answer: The City's in-kind services include traffic counters and data sharing. The price of the study can vary. With \$300,000 price tag, we are trying to achieve the same community benefits at a lower cost and free up money for other priorities laid out by the CSC.

Comment: As we talk about numbers and cost, let us pause and think about the cost of lives, the

pain and suffering of the community while these industrial processes are going on. We see trucks take the same short routes to get products to manufacturers more efficiently. Thank you Scott and the City for willingness to do the study and change the ordinance.

Comment: Please listen to the community and have the community involved in choosing the consultant. With the economy potentially tanking and traffic numbers going down, how does the study plan to ensure the analysis of commercial and residential traffic for the robust economy scenarios? Can you prioritize looking at the environmental justice elements and community issues such as sidewalks and health concerns if we have the second shelter-in-place declared later in 2020?

Answer: One possible outcome is to delay the study while the economy recovers. Pedestrian safety, connectivity and bottlenecks are important issues to the City. The Active Transportation Plan reflects these issues. Alternative components of the study are part of broader discussions as we have to understand better types of components and their overall consistency with the study's scope and CERP. While funding is committed, there are two things to keep in mind. CARB needs to approve the projects before receiving funding applications. The Valley Air District's Governing Board also has to approve the funding.

Answer: We can look at the available surrogate sources of VMT data. The available and historical data can help the City, committee and the Valley Air District to decide on the timing of the study.

Chat Comment: here again is the notice for the CARB webinar that will be go over the AB 617 CAP incentive funding guidelines. <https://content.govdelivery.com/accounts/CARB/bulletins/286832c>

Comment: Health issues of the residents living along these heavy-duty truck routes are of great concern to this committee.

Comment: There are opportunities to leverage some of the ongoing collaborations along that corridor. For example, the City and Caltrans are working to resurface Jensen Street.

Question: My neighbor was burning something over the weekend. We filed a complaint with the City but did not hear back.

Answer: The Valley Air District will send down an inspector to look at your area.

Chat Answer: If anybody would like Lupe's number to file reports, request it from the Air District and you will be able to call directly.

Comment: The CSC and the public have to participate in the study, have a seat at the table and have a discussion with the City. Community voices need to be heard, taken into consideration and valued.

Answer: There will be numerous public meetings and participation opportunities.

Comment: There are several factors to consider:

1. The closure of American Avenue for the high-speed rail project puts the added burden to other streets, Jensen and North Avenue, for example. Trucks drive on streets not designed for trucks.
2. Caltrans will be doing an interchange improvement project. Without City planning to widen the streets, it is going to complicate the traffic in those areas. Maybe we can get a list from the community about these problematic areas and help come with the solutions.

Chat Comment: Regarding the timeline to complete the study, to recap:

- We need a minimum of two months for the City/Valley Air District agreement to be developed and approved;
- Three months to hire the consultant team;
- 10-12 months to complete the study;

- Culminating in a new truck ordinance adopted by the Fresno City Council. (1-1/2 years away). Regarding factors to be considered in changing the truck routes, the study would consider community input/concerns (noise, air emissions, safety, and compatibility with land uses) but also the ability of the new proposed truck route to handle both the type and volume of traffic. Community input on the new route and other stakeholder input will be critical (schools, Fresno County, businesses and so forth). In terms of other funding sources, the City of Fresno has offered in-kind services through Traffic Operations field staff (estimated at \$66,000 in staff hours). The Valley Air District is also looking into other funding sources.

Chat Comment: I would like a history of air toxics reductions AB2588 and would like CARB to do a review of the scope of the AB617 Blue Print.

Energy Efficiency Program Update on Fresno Energy Program from Olivine, Inc. and details on resident incentives to participate

Laura, Policy Advisor for Disadvantaged Communities, Olivine

Laura presented information about the pilot energy demand response study and its companion, the Fresno Energy Program in South Central Fresno. This study seeks to identify participation potential, the reduction in energy consumption and targeted messaging. The findings will inform future program designs. Presentation highlights:

- Participation benefits: receive payments for energy reduction, save energy, learn about other public programs. Earn up to a \$170 cash reward by saving energy, participating in energy-saving events and making referrals.
- To participate, residents need to live in eight qualified zip codes (available on the website), have access to the internet, have access to the PG&E account and have no other enrolments in similar demand response programs. Participate by downloading the App or via the website. Enrolment is extended until September. Visit www.fresnoenergyprogram.com to sign up.

Comment: Energy efficiency is one of the CERP strategies and is very high on the prioritization list. Digital visa cards arrive within 48 hours after signing up.

Question: CSC member can reach out to 800 people about this program. Does the digital platform have a blind-friendly design? What about people who have no access to the internet?

Answer: Unfortunately, it does not have a blind-friendly design. As for internet access, participants have to be able to receive emails to participate. They can use public computers to log in.

Question: What about language access?

Answer: We have customer support in Spanish over the phone and via email.

Wrap up/Next Steps Meeting time poll Next Meeting: Wednesday, June 10 via Zoom

Christal Love Lazard, Facilitator, Institute for Local Government

Please let the Valley Air District know what future agenda items you would like to see on future meeting agendas.

The Valley Air District staff provided a steering committee membership update. There are 44 members; there is a need for five more residents. Valley Air District staff will be using social media, phone calls, emails and faith-based partner outreach to recruit more residents. CSC members are asked to share additional outreach suggestions.

Question: Is there a minimum age limit to participate in the CSC?

Answer: Teenagers are fine. Parents will have to approve the participation for those under 18.

CARB staff provided an update about the CSC stipends. CARB is working with the Valley Air District and Environmental Justice Consultation group on drafting the stipend guidelines.

Comment: Please share the list of the meeting dates in a hard copy form with the CSC members who request it. Please share the hard copy of handouts at least 2-3 days before the meeting. The stipend needs to be retroactive.

Answer: The second Wednesday of the month is a set CSC meeting date. The June meeting date conflicts with the Fresno Transformative Climate Communities meeting date. The staff will doodle CSC members about a potential new June date and will post the schedule on the Air District website.

Comment: Spanish documents are hard to open and to view on a separate screen.

Question: Even though we can share agenda items for future meetings, can we still review and set them at the beginning of each meeting?

Answer: Vetting the agenda at the beginning of meetings is logistically tricky to do. There is a lot of work that goes into preparing the agenda, meeting materials, finding the right speakers, and preparing the Spanish translation. We are committed to continuing to work with the community co-host to develop monthly agendas. Please let the Air District know what agenda items you would like to see in future meetings.

Chat Comment: Next Agenda Items: Rules and Regulations Updates, Stipends, Update on Truck Reroute subcommittee, Update on Air Monitoring (FUSD/Orange Center schools), continuation of postpone items from tonight

Kimberly McCoy volunteered to co-host the June meeting.

Comment: When we are back to in-person meetings, some people cannot attend unless there is a vaccine.

Committee members participated in the poll to identify preferred meeting times:

- 5:30pm-7:30pm – 7 votes
- 3:00pm-5:00pm – 5 votes
- 4:30pm-6:30pm – 4 votes.

Next Meeting: TBD by CSC input

All the presentations, Zoom meeting recording, meetings highlights and transcripts will be posted online.

**Refer to meeting audio to review the full details and comments from the meeting.*